



MINUTES OF THE CITY OF MIRAMAR REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

November 6, 2019

7:00 P.M.

The regular meeting of the Miramar City Commission was called to order by Mayor Messam at 7:06 p.m. in the Commission Chambers, Miramar City Hall, 2300 Civic Center Place, Miramar, Florida.

Upon call of the roll, the following members of the City Commission were present:

Mayor Wayne M. Messam
Vice Mayor Alexandra P. Davis
Commissioner Winston F. Barnes
Commissioner Yvette Colbourne
Commissioner Maxwell B. Chambers

The following members of staff were present:

City Manager Vernon Hargray
City Attorney Burnadette Norris-Weeks (Left at 9:30 p.m.)
City Attorney Norman Powell
City Clerk Denise A. Gibbs

MAYOR MESSAM: The meeting of the Miramar City Commission is now called to order. Madam Clerk, please call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: City Manager Hargray.

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: City Attorney Norris-Weeks

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: City Attorney Powell.

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: Here.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

MAYOR MESSAM: Let us all rise for the pledge of allegiance. (Pledge recited)

A MOMENT OF SILENCE

MAYOR MESSAM: Let us observe a moment of silence for any condolences we are experiencing in the community. We have a commemoration list for City employees who have experienced death in their families. We have two. Staff member Cindy Davis from the Utilities Department lost her grandmother. Rosemary Powell from the Finance Department lost her father. So, let's keep our fellow colleagues in our thoughts and prayers, and their families, as they bereave the death of their family members, and any condolences we are experiencing in the community. Thank you.

PROCLAMATIONS

A Proclamation: 602-HELP Line Month (Mayor Wayne M. Messam)

MAYOR MESSAM: We have one proclamation to present, and I would like to call forward Cindy Davis, Administrative Service Supervisor for CSRT. This proclamation is in observance of 602-HELP Month, November 2019:

Whereas, the City of Miramar provides public information and/or services through our 602-HELP, which is 4357 line; and, Whereas, the 602-HELP line was established as the initial point of contact and communication avenue for all Miramar residents; and, Whereas, the 602-HELP line is a 24-hour/7 days a week phone line that allows City residents to communicate and connect with City personnel; and, Whereas, the CSRT, Customer Service Response Team, provides individual customer service in English, Español, and Creole; and, Whereas, the 602-HELP line through the CSRT staff can initiate service requests for the various types of services provided by the City; and, Whereas, the 602-HELP line is the fastest way to report nonemergency neighborhood problems, code violations, water leaks, main breaks, and all city-related issues that require an immediate response; and, Whereas, the 602-HELP line, through CSRT accepts water payments, and provides information with reference to all City inquiries; and, Whereas, the 602-HELP line through CSRT helps residents connect with special services, such as loans, grants, and/or free-- free of charge material provided by the City; and, Whereas, the City of Miramar has designated November as 602-HELP Month to familiarize City residents with all services accessible through the 602-HELP line. And now, therefore, I, Wayne Messam, Mayor of the City of Miramar, and on behalf of the City Commission, do hereby proclaim the month of November 2019 as 602-HELP Line Month.

CONSENT AGENDA

MAYOR MESSAM: Consent Agenda. Items listed on the Consent Agenda are viewed to be routine and the recommendation will be enacted by one motion in the form listed below. If discussion is desired, the items will be removed from the Consent Agenda and will be considered separately. Anyone wishing to comment on any item on the Consent Agenda should approach the podium now. Good evening.

MS. SCIALABBA: Good evening. Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW --

MAYOR MESSAM: Is the green light on. Okay.

MS. SCIALABBA: Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26th Street. I have comments to make on item number five, Resolution R7041, item number six, Resolution 7067, item number seven, R 7068. Okay. Item number five, Resolution 7041, let's go back to the card system we had for so many years. We had -- we have the Utility Department that has to give this company all the numbers of -- of utility bills anyway, so it would be cheaper if we go back to the card system, then each year we have to increase the amount given to us -- certain company. As far as the events, you can put the events on the back of the postcard. You have banners citywide, different events and initiatives. You have the newsletter that advertises the events in the City. You have the big banners now over the overpass, the pedestrian crosswalk over University, so as far as marketing the events -- plus there's other areas you market the events, City Beat, etc. So please let's go back to

the card system. The postcard system is a lot cheaper than to keep doing this every time it comes up that we have to hire a company. Resolution 7067 and 7068, I just want to be sure that the stipulation is still in place that if the property in the plaza is sold before 15 years is up, that the grant is paid back, the \$500,000.00 grant is paid back to the City. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any other members that wish to comment on any items on the Consent Agenda? Any other members from the public? Seeing none, back to the dais. Are there any items wishing to be pulled?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Number seven.

MAYOR MESSAM: Number seven.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Number five and, I guess six and seven seem to be similar. I can speak on seven.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay, so Vice Mayor pulled item number five. Commissioner Chambers item number seven, as well as Vice Mayor Davis, six and seven together. May I have a motion on the balance of the Consent Agenda.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Chambers, seconded by Commissioner Colbourne, to approve Consent Agenda Items 1, 2, 3, and 4, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

1. Minutes from the Workshop and Regular Commission Meeting of October 2, 2019.

Approved

2. Temp. Reso. #R7044 approving the first **amendment** to the agreement entitled “**Landscaping, Irrigation Maintenance & Litter Control Services**” with DynaServ Florida, LLC to include Island Park, Miramar Regional Park and the Silver Lakes Tennis Complex, to the Landscape Maintenance Service Agreement for an additional amount of \$164,556.00 and a total amended agreement amount not-to-exceed \$260,553.00. *(Parks & Recreation Administrator Billy Neal and Procurement Director Alicia Ayum)*

Resolution No. 20-18

3. Temp. Reso. #R7043 approving the request for a **perpetual easement** from the State of Florida Department of Environmental Protection and Right-of-Way Deed from South Florida Water Management District for the **construction of Pembroke Road** from SW 196 Avenue to US Highway 27. *(City Engineer Bissy Vempala)*

Resolution No. 20-19

4. Temp. Reso. #R7036 authorizing the acceptance of **grant funding** from the Areawide Council on Aging of Broward County, Inc., in the amount of \$646,184.77 for the period from January 1, 2020, through December 31, 2020; approving and authorizing the City Manager to execute the funding agreement with the Areawide Council on Aging to provide **senior center services**. *(Community Services Director Katrina Davenport)*

Resolution No. 20-20

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number five, please.

5. Temp. Reso. #R7041 approving an agreement with Enco Utility Services, LLC for **utility bill printing and mailing services** through the utilization of the Florida Municipal Power Agency Competitive Agreement in an annual amount not-to-exceed \$280,000.00, which includes \$210,000.00 for postage and \$70,000.00 for monthly services; authorizing the City Manager to execute the Utility Billing Agreement for a term effective September 22, 2019, through August 9, 2023. (*Procurement Director Alicia Ayum and Financial Services Administrator Winsome Freeman*)

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: A resolution of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, approving an agreement with Enco Utility Services, LLC for utility bill printing and mailing services through the utilization of the Florida Municipal Power Agency Competitive Agreement in an annual amount not-to-exceed \$280,000.00, which includes \$210,000.00 for postage and \$70,000.00 for monthly services; authorizing the City Manager to execute the Utility Billing Agreement for a term effective September 22, 2019, through August 9, 2023, and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes, Vice Mayor Davis, do you wish to have a complete presentation or just a question?

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Well, I know Debra Scialabba mentioned about the cards, and, you know, it was back in the day, I remember we used to use those. Maybe you could go back as to why we now use this new system. The other question that's often been asked is that why is it that we have to mail our -- I don't know if it's still the same way, you have to mail it to -- is it to Atlanta? I'm not sure where this is located, where does the mail go.

MS. FREEMAN: North Carolina, currently, is where our lockbox is located.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So, yeah. So that's always a question, why does it have to be North Carolina? How many days it takes to go up there, even though I know they can drop it off here. That was always a question. And then the issue was in terms of cost, and why we moved away from the card system.

MS. FREEMAN: Okay. Thank you. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commission, Winsome Freeman, Financial Services Administrator. When we had the card system, the issue that we had was customers complaining that the cards, because they were small, were getting lost in the mail. And they were not being delivered, their utility bill, so we went to the paper bill. We went to the paper bill, it afforded us advertising on the bill that Ms. Scialabba mentioned, and it also came in an envelope that the customer could return their bill with their payment. The cost of this company, \$210,000.00 of the cost goes to postage, so that would be given, regardless of whether the company manages the bill or the City does the billing.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Okay.

MS. FREEMAN: The printing -- the services that is \$70,000.00 covers the paper, the copying, the printing, and the mailing, so those are the services they provide, where we would have to use staff overtime to process some of these bills, because, of course, we have 140 -- 50,000 residents. As it relates to the lockbox, the company -- the bank that we use, Wells Fargo, that's where their lockbox is located, and Wells Fargo is our bank, so that's where their lockbox is located.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you. I appreciate the explanation.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner -- Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thanks, Mayor. Thank you, Ms. Freeman. I think that's -- from time to time, we get question from our resident as to the out of down mailing. But always a cost associated with this mailing. Don't have much issue with it, I just want staff to look and see if we could find someone locally, if that's possible. If not, it is what it is.

MS. FREEMAN: There is no additional cost for the lockbox. Again, we have banking services with our Wells Fargo, and that's just where it's located.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: All right. So with that, there's an administrative cost built into it. Like you said, the postage, envelope, and so forth.

MS. FREEMAN: Yes.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you so much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are these services competitively bid?

MS. FREEMAN: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MESSAM: All right. And this is the lowest, responsive bidder?

MS. FREEMAN: That is correct.

MAYOR MESSAM: So in the procurement process, it -- it affords the opportunity for local vendors to compete for the opportunity, correct?

MS. FREEMAN: That is correct. And we're currently piggybacking on an agreement that was -- that was competitively bid.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah. So, just for the public, so we -- it's not that we choose to have a vendor where, you know, the lockbox is in North Carolina; printing services are externally. This process allows us to efficiently and accurately produce utility bill invoices, so they can get delivered to our account -- to each utility account holder. And -- and this

is -- this was the -- this vendor was competitively procured, and our procurement code allows the City to, in unique circumstances, piggyback off of competitively bid procurements, which this happens to be. So we just want to be able to provide that information to the residents, that you are getting the best value for the taxpayer dollar, and there's no additional cost, whether the company would have been here or where this company is in Atlanta.

MS. FREEMAN: Yes. And I just would like to add that we recently launched our eBilling campaign, so that we could find ways to reduce costs.

MAYOR MESSAM: Right. So we encourage our residents to maximize the multiple options to pay your utility services, so we're trying to meet the various ways, so that it can be convenient for our -- our utility account holders to -- to be able to pay their -- their utility bills. Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? If there's new information based off the presentation, yes. No, you have to come to the mike, ma'am.

MS. SCIALABBA: Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26 Street. Go to bigger cards. I see cards all the time. But, really, what is the percentage of residents and business owners that mail theirs in? They pay online or they go over to the water company, and they pay over there, the utility company and get their receipts, and their -- the percentage has to be like not even ten percent of the people that mail it in, and there's a lot of residents. We don't need the graphs and all that stuff that's -- and an envelope that's being mailed. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Seeing none, back to the dais. I see I have a speaker. Commissioner Barnes, you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Just a question for staff. Is it going to be possible for you to provide a comparison costing of staff doing it using overtime and so on, as against what we now spend to do the -- to get the service done? Does that data exist, or is it going to be possible to produce that data?

MS. FREEMAN: It is possible to go back and find overtime information. The cost, currently, for the services, is, like I said, \$70,000.00. I don't know what the overtime costs was, but we could research it.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yeah, take a look, and -- and -- and -- and furnish that to us, thanks.

MAYOR MESSAM: I would also add that other costs beyond just personnel cost would be printers, paper, having the appropriate software to efficiently and quickly generate these invoices, like this print or mail house is printing them. So, just for public information,

it's more than just staff costs, it's hardware costs, software costs, training costs, all of those things to efficiently to produce these invoices timely.

MS. FREEMAN: That is correct, Mayor. A printing machine, a mailing -- a sorting machine, which we no longer have. We would have to purchase those again.

MAYOR MESSAM: And, perhaps, even additional space in City Hall.

MS. FREEMAN: That's correct.

MAYOR MESSAM: Which we don't currently have.

MS. FREEMAN: That's correct.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Question.

MAYOR MESSAM: All right. Commissioner Colbourne, you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yeah, thank you. Question; how comes we piggyback instead of going out for bid?

MS. RICHMOND: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, Madam Vice Mayor, Commissioners, Natalie Richmond, Procurement Administrator. We piggyback, as I think the Mayor stated earlier that our code allows this. This was a competitively bid contract. It was bid last year in 2018, so it is -- it is relatively new contract. So since our code allows it, if it's a competitive price, we go ahead and piggyback, because our code allows it.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Okay. Thank you.

MS. RICHMOND: You're welcome.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay. Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mayor. I'm going to make a suggestion. In the age of electronics, we should look at email and text customer their bill, maybe electronically, no paper at all. And maybe we could give them some incentive to go paperless.

MS. FREEMAN: Yes.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Like this money would go back to -- in the pocket of the residents. I think the billing, maybe what, 35,000 meters per month?

MS. FREEMAN: That is correct, Commissioner. We have already launched the email eBilling, so residents can, right now, sign up for eBilling, where the bill would not have to be mailed, and that would save costs.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So for the residents who are using, if you -- maybe we could market it to all the residents, this is something we could push -- push forward for them to -- how do they want their bill. Do you want it text to you, do you want it emailed, and this is how much you would receive in return each month, and maybe that's a way we could put the money back into our residents' pocket.

MS. FREEMAN: Yes, so, again, the residents can sign up right now for eBilling, so that they don't -- do not have to receive a paper bill.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Right.

MS. FREEMAN: And we can -- they can pay their bill online. They do not have to mail their payment in; they can pay online. There are various methods which they can use.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Right. But I think where we come in is the market, create an incentive.

MS. FREEMAN: We're doing it online, and we are doing it in the mail, and yes, we can come up with additional incentives for folks to sign up to avoid us having to mail a bill.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: And once we move everyone to that system, this money can be -- go right back to the residents.

MS. FREEMAN: That is correct. If our residents sign up, that would save us like \$210,000.00 a year. That's correct.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Right. Okay. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Just one question. I know with the card system, isn't that cheaper to mail than the envelope?

MS. IRIGOYEN: Good evening. This is Ruby Irigoyen. I'm the senior vice president of customer service for Enco Utility Services, Florida. Our mailings are not done from Atlanta, they're mailed from Tallahassee; that's where our facility is, and we are a Florida corporation. The eBills, we mail those out or send those for you as well. The regular bill with the number ten and the number nine, the bill printed fresh, front and back, is nine cents apiece, plus the postage. But the eBill is only five cents, so that really is a very important thing to do to try and get that out. Postage on a post card is about 23 cents, so the postage is significantly less. The issue that you run into is security. With the fact that

and with the proper securing of customer's information, when you have a postcard, their name, their address, their consumption, everything is on that postcard and visible for anyone to see, and that's generally one of the reasons that cities will move to an enclosure bill, so you have more privacy. We can offer to provide the design of the eBill marketing product for you; in fact, we already have some that other cities are using, and we can give you examples of those. They're very inexpensive. They're enclosed, so there's no additional postage. And you're at about seven percent now, and we have some cities that are 15 to 20 percent using eBills, so it's really something very important for you to do, because every single one saves that postage.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Question. So the cards, because there's cards that you fold and, you know, secure.

MS. IRIGOYEN: Yes.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: That's cheaper than the regular as well, right?

MS. IRIGOYEN: I'm not sure what the postage on that one is. The paper itself is more expensive, so I can go back and do a comparison for -- if you want to do that, we can print those as well.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yeah, just to compare. I mean, yeah, I understand --

MS. IRIGOYEN: We provide that.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yeah. There are some cards that, basically, you just tear off each side, and you open it up --

MS. IRIGOYEN: Yeah, those cards are more expensive than regular paper in envelopes.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: To mail.

MS. IRIGOYEN: And then the ones that close with the plastic tab that closes or the ones that tear on the sides are actually more expensive than regular paper and envelopes. We were able to piggyback on the State of Florida's paper purchase, so we get our paper and envelopes, everything is all the same for all customers, in order to keep that cost down.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yeah. So it's just a comparison between the paper and the mailing and the cost of the card, and the cost of the postage. But thanks for that explanation.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there any other questions? If none, I'll take a motion on item --

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Chambers, seconded by Commissioner Colbourne, to approve Resolution #R7041, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

Resolution No. 20-21

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number six, please.

6. Temp. Reso. #R7067 approving amendments to the **Commercial Rehabilitation Agreement** for the commercial property located at 6927 Miramar Parkway in Historic Miramar providing for twelve (12) month extensions; authorizing the City Manager to execute the amendments and authorizing the City Manager to approve an additional twelve (12) month extension, if required. (*Community Development Director Eric Silva*)

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: A resolution of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, approving amendments to the Commercial Rehabilitation Agreement

for the commercial property located at 6927 Miramar Parkway in Historic Miramar providing for twelve (12) month extensions; authorizing the City Manager to execute the amendments and authorizing the City Manager to approve an additional twelve (12) month extension, if required, and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Do you want -- is there just a general question, or is there a request for a presentation?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I just want to make a comment. Thank you, Mr. Silva. This item, we have gone through this process quite a few times in regard to this property, and I'm very pleased with the way it's coming along, even though I'm disappointed that it took so long. There was a lot of delays with this property, simply because the dais couldn't agree or get it right or delayed, delayed, delayed. And -- and what has happened now, because of the double construction with the Taco Bell, this business owner is losing about \$60,000.00 a month, because of the inconvenience with the parking. And if both construction was not happening at the same time, the patrons would be able to park where the existing Taco Bell parking lot would have been, so I just want to state that. And I know some time we a little bit shortsighted, but this is a well-deserved project; it's really coming together nicely, and I hope we can get it done soon to get the customer not to be walking in the mud and -- and the dirt and so forth. So I just want to thank staff for -- and my colleagues to move this project along. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Vice --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I asked --

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah. Vice Mayor Davis, followed by Yvette Colbourne.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you. The question I had, and I -- I just wanted to ensure that -- there have been complaints about the back of B & M, and so I know they have the money for the façade improvements, but there is that fencing back there that's torn in parts, and you know, when the trucks come back there, it's abutting some residential, and people are complaining. So can we ensure that the fence is fixed, and that there is some kind of buffering, in addition to what's happening in the front. The front could look beautiful, but if the back's torn down, it doesn't too much for the residents who are looking at the back of the facility.

MR. SILVA: Eric Silva, Community Development. Yes, we can ensure that the fence is repaired, and that the plans that we are -- are reviewed and approved, they do include a buffer in the form of a hedge, so there will be a hedge back there to buffer the residents.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: And that will be done at the same time as the improvements to the front?

MR. SILVA: Correct.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Perfect. That was my question.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Oh, I'm sorry. Well, we usually ask the public, and then come back, but since I gave courtesy comments, because both of you pulled the item. So, Commissioner Colbourne, let me just check with the public, and then we'll bring it back to the dais, okay? All right. Thanks. Any members from the public to comment on this item? Seeing none, Commissioner Colbourne, you're recognized. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: This item has probably come before us more than any other item. I -- I want to ask you how many times, but I don't know if you've lost count yourself. So I guess my question then is going to be is it coming back before us again?

MR. SILVA: This will be the last time. I spoke to the contractor yesterday. He expects to be done early next year.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Wonderful. Thank you very much. Appreciate it.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Barnes, you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: In other words, we will not need 12 months?

MR. SILVA: No.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: We're just asking for that as -- as a guarantee of the amount of time?

MR. SILVA: Right. We shouldn't --

COMMISSIONER BARNES: That would be allowed.

MR. SILVA: -- need the full 12 months, correct.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: I'm still not so sure, though, why -- why there's a need for - - for this extension? What is the specific cause for the delay?

MR. SILVA: The agreements have an expiration date of December 13th, and there were three applications, actually, involved: there's a building permit application, there's an engineering application, and then applications of Broward County also, the surface water management. So the preparation of those plans, those three different applications, took quite a while to prepare. Our permit review was actually done earlier this year, by the spring it was done, but then the -- the reviews of the County, the preparation of those plans took more time.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Pushed it back more -- even more.

MR. SILVA: Yeah. So everything kind of added onto it.

MAYOR MESSAM: All right.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Mayor --

MAYOR MESSAM: Can we -- comment or are we ready for a motion?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I just want to say real quick that this small business set the trend for all other business here in Miramar, and this will not happen again. This make it easier for us to work with all the businesses in Miramar move certain process along, so kudos to just a business owner.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. May I have a motion.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Chambers, to approve Resolution #R7067, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

Resolution No. 20-22

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number seven, please.

7. Temp. Reso. #R7068 approving **amendments** to the **Construction Agreement** for the commercial property located at **6927 Miramar Parkway in Historic Miramar**, providing for twelve (12) month extensions; authorizing the City Manager to execute the amendments and authorizing the City Manager to approve an additional twelve (12) month extension, if required. (*Community Development Director Eric Silva*)

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: A resolution of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, approving amendments to the Construction Agreement for the commercial property located at 6927 Miramar Parkway in Historic Miramar, providing for twelve (12) month extensions; authorizing the City Manager to execute the amendments and authorizing the City Manager to approve an additional twelve (12) month extension, if required, and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: I presume all questions have been answered on this item, so are there any members from the public that wish to comment on item seven? Any members from the public? Seeing none, back to the dais. May I have a motion, please.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Chambers, to approve Resolution #R7068, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

Resolution No. 20-23

End of Consent Agenda

RESOLUTIONS

MAYOR MESSAM: On to resolutions. Item number eight, please.

8. Temp. Reso. #R7045 approving an Interlocal Agreement between Broward County and the City of Miramar for Public Transportation Services (Community Bus Services) providing vehicles and operational revenue, in an annual amount of \$928,508.03, for a term commencing upon execution through September 30, 2022, with two optional one-year renewal options upon approval by the County's Contract Administrator; approving the addition of a **bus stop at the Haven Lakes Estates Mobile Park**, and one shared bus on the Orange and Red Routes along with updates to route headways. *(Public Works Director Anthony Collins)*

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: A resolution of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, approving the Interlocal Agreement between Broward County and the City of Miramar for Public Transportation Services (Community Bus Services) providing vehicles and operational revenue, in an annual amount of \$928,508.03, for a term commencing upon execution through September 30, 2022, with two optional one-year renewal options upon approval by the County's Contract Administrator; approving the addition of a bus stop at the Haven Lakes Estates Mobile Park, and one shared bus on

the Orange and Red Routes along with updates to route headways, authorizing the City Manager to execute the interlocal agreement, and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

MS. GILBERT: Good evening. Good evening, Mayor, Vice Mayor and Commissioners, City Manager, City Attorney. The item before you tonight is for approval -- next slide, please. It's for approval of the interlocal agreement (ILA) with Broward County to provide the Community Bus Service program, provide vehicles and revenue from Broward County in the amount of \$928,000.00 approximately, approving the addition of a bus stop on Haven Lakes community, a shared bus on the orange & red routes, update to routes arrival times. Some background information. The City of Miramar has been operating the Community Bus Service program for 24 years through an interlocal agreement with County. The program provides shuttle service with four routes; those routes are the green, yellow, red and orange routes. The routes operate five days a week, 12 hours a day, and provides public transportation at no cost to passengers and residents and connects with Broward County Transit. Next slide. This slide provides a -- shows you a map of the combined four routes. You will note on the map the bottom middle part shows an asterisk. That asterisk notates the added stop that's been added to the Haven Lakes community; the stop is actually going to be located on the northwest corner of Red Road and Honey Hill Road. The picture that we've included shows an actual location of where that bus stop will be. Next slide please. Revisions to the route; as noted, the -- a bus stop has been added onto the orange route at the entrance to Haven Lakes. A shared bus has been provided to the City by Broward County to support the red route during the morning trips, and the orange route during the afternoon trips. The previous ILA provided for only four buses; this new ILA will provide for five buses. In addition, updates to route arrivals on the red and orange route will provide for on-time performance. Broward County support of this program is being provided to the City in the form of revenue, approximately \$928,508.03, to be exact. The revenue previously provided under this ILA was approximately \$181,100.00. The significant increase resulted from Broward County voters approving the one-cent surtax -- transportation surtax, I'm sorry, in November of 2018. The tax took effect in -- on January 1 of 2019 and, in addition, support from the County is provided in the form of five buses, as noted earlier. The agreement; there's a three-year term under this agreement. The agreement will be effective through September 30th of 2022, and there is an option to extend for up to two additional one-year terms, upon approval by the County contract administrator. City Manager approval is recommended.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any members from the public that wish to comment on this item?

MS. SCIALABBA: Good evening, Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26 Street. I'm glad this is going on. Haven Lake Estates community has kind of been the orphaned children of Miramar. They've been neglected through the years, many years. I am, however, requesting, if it's possible, for you, the Commission and Mayor, to write a letter -- a

resolution to the Miami Gardens elected officials and mayor opposing Formula 1 racing at the Hard Rock Hotel. Residents of Miami Gardens will continue to protest in opposition, as this is not an appropriate venue, and Homestead is better suited. This may assist in helping solidify the Miami Gardens council, in the event the elected officials file a lawsuit on behalf of their constituents. Remember how close proximity Haven Lake Estates is to the Hard Rock -- Hard Rock Hotel. Hard Rock -- Hard Rock -- anyway. The noise -- the noise, we're going to have traffic congestion all the way back to, most likely, Pembroke Road, because when it's Dolphin games, it's backed up over there from University, Miramar Parkway, and back further. The noise will affect both Haven Lake Estates community, as well as traffic congestion on University that goes past Miramar Parkway towards Pembroke Road. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Any other members from the public? Seeing none, back to the dais. Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. I just want to say that this is -- this is really a good thing. This is -- this is much more funds that we received before. What is it, about -- almost \$700,000.00 more that we're receiving? And with that, the program will be fully funded or almost fully funded? How does that work?

MS. GILBERT: Correct, Commissioner. You're correct. The program was previously supported by General Fund; this program will now be fully self-sustaining.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: As a result of the surtax?

MS. GILBERT: Correct.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes. This is -- it's definitely good. I happen to think that our community bus system is just one of the gems in our services that we provide. City Manager, I would ask that we promote this and highlight this service more, because I really do think it is a -- it is an excellent service. I know it's utilized a lot. When we spoke, you -- you told me how many -- how many riders we had. What was -- what was that last year?

MS. GILBERT: Last year, approximately 118,000.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: 118,000. And I -- I think we could even exceed that. I think that was just below what you thought you would have. But I do think it's something that we need to let residents know that we're doing this. We need to let everybody know we're doing this, because it is an excellent program. Thank you very much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner Colbourne. Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mayor. I'm also in agreement with Commissioner Colbourne. When we have service like this that can help our residents, we really need to promote it and let them know that it's here, and -- so they can continue to utilize it. And for those who are not aware, they can be aware. I know the children love it, the seniors love it, so I'm all for it. Thank you guys so much. Appreciate it.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner Chambers. I like this item as well. When Broward County municipalities advocated for the support of the referendum for the surtax for transportation, these and many other benefits were highlighted, in terms of what would come to our City, some throughout Broward County. Pardon, Siri. Siri is supposed to be on reset during meetings, but -- so I would, though, like to continue to support and encourage our staff. Due to the fact that, with revenue support from the surtax that we're experiencing, to the point where this program is fully funded, I think it presents an opportunity for us to look at and explore technological upgrades to our transportation system. For example, it would be great if our residents knew when their bus is coming on the red line or the green line or the yellow line, as we discussed. That can be done through an app, maybe technology placed on the buses with a countdown to what stop it's on, and when you can anticipate the bus coming. Those type of features, you know, really helps, you know, the riders have a -- a more convenient experience when -- when taking public transportation. And, as transportation continues to be a challenge, not just in Broward County, but more specifically in our city, the more convenient we can make public transportation, perhaps, individuals may choose to use public transportation, because just of the experience that they have. Nice new buses, clean buses, courteous drivers, convenient routes and stops, and -- and -- and pleasant bus stops as well. So we thank you for your -- your -- the administration over this program, and we look forward to what you will bring back to us for consideration as we look to upgrade the technological support for our transportation system. All right. Commissioner Barnes, followed by Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Just an observation, Mr. Mayor. I promise you the people who are regular users of these buses, they have a good idea when they're coming. I had a pleasure -- the interesting pleasure of riding the buses and, if nothing else, it attracts what might be called a number of characters. They are people who, I suspect, ride buses just to have this great conversation with someone else. One of the things I'd love for us to do going forward though, is to articulate a position vis-à-vis the use of these buses by our school children, because there has been something of a challenge over time, where children sometimes who are eligible to use school buses don't and, instead, rely on this transportation, especially in the afternoons. What I'd love for us to do is to articulate opposition, specifically as is possible under the circumstances, as to how we accommodate school children, or if we do any at all. So, going forward, this is, I want to think, something that we could look at, clearly delineating what it is that we do with that service, where -- where school children are concerned.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes, thank you. I just wanted to add, in reference to the technology that you were -- you were talking about. Perhaps staff could give us a little highlight on that, because I know there is conversation we had, in terms of -- of plans moving forward. Because that is essential to any ridership that we are able to -- to automate and let folks know when the bus is coming, and so forth.

MR. HOBSON: Evening, Commissioners, and Mayor, Vice Mayor, City Manager, City Attorney, Kirk Hobson-Garcia, the other Assistant Director of Public Works Department. We have been exploring the different technologies, and we are -- we are working with two vendors with some apps, and we will also like to add some automatic passenger counters on the bus, and -- and also add real time video cameras onto the bus, so that people at home could see what is going on on the bus. Because -- because I think the more transparent we are with our information, it is a better thing. So, yes, we do have an app that I am experimenting with. Right now, this app is being used up in Connecticut, and just using the app, you could plan your trip, you know. One of the things that Commissioner Colbourne asked about is if we could get in with the Broward County technology also. We have also approached Broward County, and they are not ready as yet to invite us onboard, but yesterday we received an email from them saying that they would like the City to be the first ones to begin to electronically collect passenger counts on the bus. So they will be coming to install some iPads on our buses, and we will be the city that is going to roll out this new technology. And with the extra funds that we get, I'm hoping that I can convince the Budget Department, you know, to get some of this technology. So any influence you all have on them --

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. Thank you so very much. Of course, I am very pleased to know that we have that -- that bus stop at Haven Lakes. I know that they've waited for it for a number of years, but it's there now, and that's -- you're going to start right after this meeting, right?

MR. HOBSON: We're going to get them out, even if there's nobody to pick up.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. Thank you very much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mayor. I just want to share with your all that about 14, 15 years ago, I stayed at a hotel in London, just outside of downtown London, Heathrow, and I ride the bus every day to -- on the train, and the bus stop there that -- all the bus stop was -- had the same service, electronic -- you'd know when the bus is coming, and how many minutes. So this is not something new; it's already available from 15 years ago, so it's pretty easy to engage the English, and see how they did it, so a service up -- already up and running. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: And since we're asking for money, I'm looking for that first autonomous bus as well. All right. May I have a motion of item number eight, please.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Chambers, to approve Resolution #R7045, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

Resolution No. 20-24

ORDINANCES

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number nine on Ordinances.

- 9. FIRST READING** of Temp. Ord. #O1732 approving the **end-of-year amendment** of the **Fiscal Year 2019 Operating and Capital Improvement Program Budget**;

and providing for an effective date. (*Management & Budget Director Norman Mason*)

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: An ordinance of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, approving the end-of-year amendment of the Fiscal Year 2019 Operating and Capital Improvement Program Budget; and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

MR. SANMIGUEL: Good evening, Mayor, Vice Mayor, City Commission, Rafael Sanmiguel, Assistant Director of Management & Budget. I'm here to present to you the Fiscal Year 2019 final budget amendment. Per State statute, all amendments must be adopted within 60 days following the end of the fiscal year, so this year, that would be November 28th of 2019. Please be advised that due to the ongoing yearend process, the figures are subject to change, as presented in this presentation, and the City Manager wishes to amend the budget. Starting with the General Fund revenues, we're going to recognize \$125,000.00 of the Community Engagement Program revenues from -- as -- as per the amendment of the agreement with Waste Pro, half of which is going to go towards funding the City Commission initiatives at \$62,500.00 in the expense side, and half will be a transfer out to the Economic Development Fund of 62 5 -- \$62,500.00. Moving on to this off -- Office of the City Manager, \$95,000.00 due to the compensation related to the former city manager and department restructuring. Human Resources increased that budget to -- by \$97,300.00 due to salary attritions not being realized as anticipated in that department. In the Office of the City Clerk, we're going to increase their budget by \$78,700.00 due to election costs. It was an invoice that they got from the Broward County Supervisor of Elections due to the recount efforts and related overtimes that they incurred that they passed onto us. In the Financial Services, \$3,900.00 due to an unanticipated overtime cost related to yearend audits, contract ratifications, and assuring staff covering customer service -- service after closing. Procurement, they have a savings of \$71,000.00 due to the salary savings from vacancies, as those are departments of -- for \$254,000.00 in salaries and consulting services. Police, we're going to increase their budget by \$708,500.00, due to overtime costs from various unanticipated operating needs, staffing shortages, and overtime due to Hurricane Dorian. Fire Rescue, a similar story, \$1.2 million over time caused from staffing shortages, extended leaves overtime of Hurricane Dorian, and DROP transfers. Moving on, Community Development; \$89,000.00, due to salary attrition not being realized as anticipated. Public Works, \$94,000.00 due to overtime costs that they used to assist Cultural Affairs with building maintenance and other activities. Parks & Recreation, a savings of \$117,000.00 due to salary savings from vacancies. Similarly, Social Service -- Social Services, a savings of \$405,500.00 due to salary savings and program supplies. Cultural Affairs increased their budget by \$111,900.00, due to higher personnel cost for additional duties and responsibilities. And non-departmental, any savings in the police and none -- non-rep retiree stipends and other operating costs, including appropriation fund balance. In the Economic Development Fund, the \$62,500.00 of the community engagement money, dollars, we're going to transfer in from the General Fund, and we're going to appropriate

that into Fund Balance in the fiscal year '19, now. In '20, we're going to re-appropriate those funds in an upcoming -- in, actually, my next item. In the Public Safety Outside Services Fund, due to higher than anticipated public safety details, we're going to increase the budget by a total of \$104,000.00. Their revenue breakdown is \$26,900.00 from PD Special Detail Administrative Fee special detail administrative fee, \$25,500.00 from fire special details, and \$51,600.00 from the appropriated fund balance. Utility Fund, it's a CIP item reprogramming. We're going to take \$1.2 million and reprogram that from the West Water Plant improvement CIP project, to the construction of the Historic Miramar drainage improvement Phase IV project. Fund 414, similar story. We're going to have reprogram \$319,373.00 from the Historic Miramar fire hydrant and lines CIP project from those three accounts in that project, into the Historic Miramar infrastructure and improvements Phase III project, CIP project. And approval is recommended. I just want to reiterate that figures will change on the second reading on next Wednesday, due to the ongoing reconciliation that Finance is doing, and staff is available for questions.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any comments or questions from the public on this item?

MS. SCIALABBA: I wasn't going to come tonight until I looked at the agenda. Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26 Street. I want to discuss the wrap arounds around the electrical utility boxes. Historic Miramar needs these wrap arounds --

MAYOR MESSAM: But, excuse me, it's not associated with the --

MS. SCIALABBA: It is in a sense -- can't you re-program some of the money into -- it was approved. We had the finances, it was in design, it was approved in 2018. Can't you reprogram some of the monies, so that we can get the wrap arounds. It's only affecting 12 or 13 boxes; that's why I was going to bring this up, because it's a chronic problem with these large posters advertising events. The adhesive sticks to them. Now there was an issue with -- Cooper City has them, Hollywood, Hallandale, Pembroke Pines. All the Cities have it, but because Miramar wants it, there's some kind of issue it's a fire hazard, which makes no sense, because the other cities where it's allowed actually is setting precedence for us to have it. We don't need the 61 throughout the City, but we do need it. We're beautifying Miramar, we -- we need it in Miramar. That's where I was -- that's where -- we need to -- to reprogram some money somewhere from the budget to get this done. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Seeing none, back to the dais. If you don't have any comments, I'll take a motion.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Chambers, to approve Ordinance #O1732, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

Passed 1st Reading

SECOND READING SCHEDULED for November 13, 2019

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number 10, please.

- 10. FIRST READING** of Temp. Ord. #O1734 approving the **first amendment** of the **Fiscal Year 2020 Operating and Capital Improvement Program Budget**; and providing for an effective date. (*Management & Budget Director Norman Mason*)

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: An ordinance of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, approving the first amendment to Fiscal Year 2020 Operating and Capital Improvement Program Budget; and providing for an effective date.

MR. SANMIGUEL: Good evening again. Rafael Sanmiguel, Assistant Director of Management & Budget. Again, I will be presenting the first amendment for FY 2020. So to start -- to start with, the amendment calls to transfer \$423,150.00 from Public Works to Parks & Recreation. This is due to a change in strategy for landscaping services. Originally, the City wanted to bring all of those landscaping services in house, and we budgeted equipment and personnel in 2020 to do so. After a three-year pilot program, the Public Works Department found that the methodology wasn't really viable, so now we are trying to do a hybrid approach, where we have both in-house landscaping services, and contracted out. So the Parks & Recreation Department needs those monies to contract out whatever is not feasible to do in house, so that's what this is about. On the Economic Development Fund side, we are appropriating those funds that we brought in from -- in fiscal year '90. Those are the community engagement dollars from Waste Pro, and we're going to put them into the Economic Incentive account to be used appropriately. And approval is recommended.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Seeing none, back to the dais. No questions or comments, I'll take a motion.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Just -- sorry.

MAYOR MESSAM: Vice -- Vice Mayor, you're recognized.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Just a question. And I know the -- the Waste Pro, \$125,000.00, and we had given half of that to Economic Development. But I was under the understanding at the time that that money would roll over, because it was -- it was really given towards the end of the budget. But now I'm being told that that's not the case; it's use it or lose it type of thing.

MR. SANMIGUEL: right. That's any of -- any of the appropriations for the -- for the fiscal year. It's -- that kind of thing doesn't roll over, only capital stuff, capital improvement type items roll over. And those monies are being used to -- to cover items in the City Commission that are --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yeah. I mean a lot of people did have -- I mean, I've used up most of mine, but I'm just saying, in case somebody didn't, and they were hoping to use it in 2020, it's not available.

MR. SANMIGUEL: Right. So -- as with any operating budget item, at the end of the year, it's just going to -- it goes away. It -- it closes into fund balance.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I'm just saying if that was explained initially, it would have been kind of helpful, but no problem. I found good use for it. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: No other speakers, may I have a motion, please.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Chambers, seconded by Commissioner Colbourne, to approve Ordinance #O1734, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

Passed 1st Reading

SECOND READING SCHEDULED for November 13, 2019

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number 11, please.

11. **FIRST READING** of Temp. Ord. #O1737 amending Ordinance No. 16-11 establishing the **salary and benefits** of the **City's Elected Officials**; providing for conflicts; providing for severability; providing for inclusion in the Code; and

providing for an effective date. ***(Requested by Commissioner Maxwell B. Chambers)*** *(Human Resources Director Randy Cross)*

CITY ATTORNEY NORRIS-WEEKS: An ordinance of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, amending Ordinance No. 16-11 establishing the salary and benefits of the City's Elected Officials; providing for conflicts; providing for severability; providing for inclusion in the Code; and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

MR. CROSS: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, Madam Vice Mayor, Members of the Commission, Randy Cross, Human Resources Director. Good evening. Ordinance No. 16-11 establishes language to adjust the salaries and benefits for each of the elected officials. It does so in the following way: it provides an annual increase on the first day of January, a COLA, based on the CPI, with a fourth two percent, and a maximum of five percent on an annual basis. It provides an annual business stipend of \$10,000.00, and it adjusts the vehicle allowance that elected officials have the option to take to be in line with what the City Manager currently has. So it would increase it from \$5,400.00 a year to \$7,800.00 a year. Manager recommends approval.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any members from the public that wish to comment on this item?

MS. SCIALABBA: Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26 Street. I'm assuming the \$10,000.00 business stipend was what you were getting the \$2,500.00 annual. Now you're receiving what, \$34,175.00 -- \$34,175.00 for Commissioners, and then \$43,411.00 for the Mayor. So now you had also a \$2,500.00 stipend, which was your cost of living raise, and that actually was talked about in 2013, when people were losing their jobs, getting layoffs and consolidating apartments -- departments. Health insurance for you and your families, you're getting life insurance. I believe the City matches -- was matching three percent. You have city credit card, you have an expense account for event initiatives, which was increased to \$20,000.00, vehicles from the fleet, you get a monthly expense account, cell phones, laptops, expense reimbursement for your trips, Jamaica Diaspora, Washington, etc. You just gave the secretaries three percent increase. The Commission is taking \$1,411,000.00 plus from the City's budget as it is. You give yourself tuition reimbursement, I saw, for \$4,000.00. Pay for your own tuition. Everybody -- all your taxpayers have to pay for their own tuition. We don't get reimbursed. We're paying two law firms. The new law firm -- give them a budget to adhere to for 2020. \$1,200,000.00. Give them a budget. You don't know what they're going to actually spend by the end of 2020, so give them a budget that they got to work within. Last meeting I attended, the attorney's report was that some of the major litigation was handed back to Weiss Serota and Jaime Cole, so we're paying the two law firms until the transition period ends. But when? When is that going to happen? There will be collective bargaining negotiations, and pensions coming up. Come on, let's -- let's really think about your total package.

Calculate your total package, not just your W-2s and what you're getting. Calculate everything in. You go to be getting at least \$100,000.00 or more. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Any other members that wish to comment on this item? Seeing none, back to the dais. Are there any comments or questions from the dais? I have a speaker. Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Basically, I want to pose a number of questions. I'm not sure who will answer for the -- Randy will. First and foremost, what does stipend mean in this context? Usually, a stipend is a support mechanism for trainees, for example. Stipends in this country have to also meet a number of federal guidelines. Do we, with this stipend, meet those guidelines? How much -- as -- as Ms. Scialabba just mentioned, how much is the total package going to cost the City? We heard about where some of the funding will come from, and what happens when these funds are placed in the budget and they're not used? Some of us find it necessary to -- to utilize these funds in different ways. I think these are questions that should be answered for our residents, so they have an idea how their tax dollars are spent going forward.

MR. CROSS: Question one, what is the business stipend? I believe the idea of the business stipend was to cover miscellaneous expenses that an elected official may spend during the course of their business that's not reported and directly set out for reimbursement. So itemized -- things that are not itemized. Number two, the total cost -- this is an additional \$12,400.00 on top of current compensation that Commissioners and the Mayor receive. It's a \$10,000.00 increase for the business stipends, and about \$2,400.00 increase to the vehicle allowance that an elected official opts to take the allowance in lieu of taking a city vehicle. And if the funds are not used, generally, the funds that would be part of your compensation would be included in your monthly paychecks, so those would be part of your monthly stipend -- your monthly earnings, rather. If, for some reason, funds are not taken or used, and they're budgeted, they would be returned back to the General Fund at the end of the fiscal year.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: What portion would be attached to the monthly --

MR. CROSS: The stipend would be -- part would be distributed amongst 12 paychecks. Elected officials are paid on the first of each month, so the total cost of \$10,000.00 would be divided by 12, and you would be -- it would include on your -- your monthly paycheck. And if you opt to take the vehicle allowance, the vehicle allowance is you currently -- currently receive a \$5,400.00, it would increase by \$2,400.00; that would be distributed amongst your 12 paychecks as well.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: So we are basically being asked here to vote to increase the salaries of Commissioners by calling them exotic names. You know you don't have to answer that one.

MAYOR MESSAM: That concludes your questions, Commissioner Barnes? Any other comments or questions -- the Commission? I have additional questions as well. I need more clarity on stipend or business stipend. What are these business expenses? What -- what -- what -- well, first, where did this request come from? What -- what are the business -- what are -- what these additional business expenses by the Commission? What's the definition, what's the basis?

MR. CROSS: I'm sorry, Mr. Mayor. Can you ask -- can you repeat that?

MAYOR MESSAM: What qualifies as a business stipend, and how does that correlate with the activities of elected official that are not itemized, based on your presentation?

MR. CROSS: My understanding would be that the Commission has the option to -- if expenses are incurred during the course of your business, your activities as an elected official, rather, that in certain circumstances you could seek direct reimbursement for those expenses through a process where you would turn in receipts, and itemize those items, and then be paid -- and reimbursed for those expenses. So the stipend is another way of handling that in a way where you're not required to itemize whatever type of expenses you may incur in the course of your activities as an elected official, and instead of itemizing those, it's a number that's put out there to help offset some of those costs, without carrying the burden of having to individually --

MAYOR MESSAM: So give me an example of what would be expense under the current process prior to this item? What would be a reimbursable business expense?

MR. CROSS: Perhaps -- you know, I really couldn't tell you specifics. Things -- you know, not serving as an elected official, I'm not sure what you encounter day to day, but it would be things that would be related to your job that are an appropriate business expense for taxpayer dollars to be used. And then you would itemize those, track those, gather the receipts on those, and then, periodically, have the responsibility of having to put some sort of documentation together, requesting reimbursement from the manager, and go through a process to do that.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay. So I would think, though, that the request eliminates transparency, in terms of those activities, if we have a -- let's say, a working lunch. Let's say we have a working lunch, then we can clearly say this was a working lunch for a meeting with community or whatever official activity that required meals, we have a process that would be -- that we would itemize that. I think it just -- I think the taxpayer would -- would choose for us to submit invoices for those, because that's not directly tied to our salary, not directly tied to what has been adopted for compensation for us being elected officials to do our -- our -- our -- our work.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Mr. Mayor, if you don't mind.

MAYOR MESSAM: I'm -- I'm going to go through the questions, and everyone will get a -- an opportunity, so. There are legitimate -- I guess what could be considered legitimate expenses that can come up. I'm not sure if it's \$10,000.00 worth, and then if it -- when it does come up, I think that the current process of expensing those items, I think is appropriate, and gives accountability and transparency, and I think that the -- that the taxpayer would -- would prefer that the elected officials do that. So one of my other questions you touched on briefly on that Commissioner Barnes asked was these additional dollars are being paid to -- basically, to our salaries, so it's automatic, it's not going into an -- an account that's available for us to expense against. It automatically is paid, prorated over the course of 12 months.

MR. CROSS: That's correct, so instead of having an expense account, which would be an operating expense that exists in your budget that you would charge itemized expenses against, this would be considered compensation; it would be taxed.

MAYOR MESSAM: Which raises another interesting point. So since this is considered compensation, this would be taxable income, correct?

MR. CROSS: Correct.

MAYOR MESSAM: Which, therefore, right off the top, reduces the amount available to do official city business, so, therefore, it seems to be more appropriate to itemize it as a budget item under our budget, that can be expensed against, so we're not paying income taxes. So, basically, it's a waste of taxpayer dollars by, I think -- it's earned income that's at the highest tax bracket, what 30 percent, at least. So, off the top, you're down to \$7,000.00 of the ten, because you're paying earned income, because it's coming to us. I don't think 30 percent just going to Uncle Sam is the best use of taxpayer dollars. I think if -- if this is going to be approved, and the need is there, and the Commission decides that \$10,000.00 should be allocated for these activities, let the full \$10,000.00 be available, and not put in a way where it -- we're useless -- the dollars are uselessly being -- just given to the federal government, instead of the benefit of the public. That's another issue that I have with how this is structured. I would also bring forward that, you know, we -- we have some very important collective bargaining that's coming up, where we're going to ask our general employees, our fire rescue, and our police department to make some very tough decisions, as we try to continue our course of fiscal solvency for this city. And, to approve this as presented, I think it puts -- I think we have to set the example as the leaders. Especially if we're going to ask -- and I'm not sure how that bargaining is going to go, but in the event -- if we have to ask our workers to give, we should give. This item is asking for more. Our job functions hasn't increased in -- much more. We're among the highest paid elected officials in Broward County, among the highest, if not the second, or probably in the top three, for sure, including Pembroke Pines and Pompano, as I look at this survey. I hope we vote this down. And I think that if we work for -- if there are -- if there's a situation where -- where an elected official is using personal dollars to conduct City business, which shouldn't happen, we have initiative dollars. We have legislative dollars to do a lot of these things, and I just don't think this is the right time for this. And I

guess my other question is that if this item should pass, those not in favor of this should have the option to put the stipend in a stipend account that is funded, where to use it, it has to be expensed, there's receipts, there's transparency. And the elected official can choose to use it or not to use it, and if it's not used, it's gone -- it goes back into the General Fund. But I think to put this into salaries in the way that it's been presented, I just think is irresponsible, and I don't -- this is basically a raise for the -- for -- for -- for the Commissioners, is how I see it, based on how it's structured, and I would encourage my colleagues not to adopt this as structured. Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yeah. I, too, would like some kind of arrangement where -- I mean my -- my record here is clear. This -- these are not monies that I have any intention of ever spending. Not going to happen in my office. What I would like to get out of this discussion is some kind of understanding where I do not use this money, what happens to it. Is it going to be co-opted by someone else, some other department? Is it, as the Mayor suggested, going to go into some kind of situation, where if it has to be used, it has to be accounted for? My preference would be that this money simply goes into the General Fund. I have no intention whatsoever of supporting an ordinance like this, and I go further. I want the assurance that this money will not be co-opted by another situation. I want it to at least sit into an account where it won't be grabbed. I'm -- I'm obviously not going to support this, but I want more -- I want some kind of understanding that this money is going to be put away, and in no way whatsoever attached to my salary. That has to be done. It is not a question -- don't get me wrong, if it is attached, I'll do what I've done in the past. There are young people going to school who need money; I'll give that money to them, but I'd really prefer that it just not attached at all to my salary. We cannot, in good conscience, sit here and make demands of people who laboriously support and help the City to thrive and look presentable. I cannot ask those people to continue to sacrifice. I cannot in good conscience plan to talk to the police and the fire about, "Hey, give us a break going forward." I cannot, honestly, in good conscience do that, and then attach what is -- is -- is -- is a raise of pay to -- to what I get. I'm not going to be a part of that.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mayor. Mr. Cross, can you say for certain, based on this item, since I brought it forward -- I ask the City Manager to take a look and he brought it back, he identified the funding. Who would be responsible for paying the taxes on the stipend?

MR. CROSS: The employee would; each elected official. It would come out of your paycheck as a payroll deduction, and the taxes would be deducted from that.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So -- and the reason for that is to alleviate the City from paying all the cost that would associate with this stipend if this was to move to the salary side of our paycheck, correct?

MR. CROSS: Can you say that again?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: If it was to be a direct increase in the salary, then the City would be responsible for paying all the taxes on this stipend, right?

MR. CROSS: Correct.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So --

MAYOR MESSAM: Excuse me, that isn't correct. The employer pays salary tax, and the -- and the employee has its separate tax, so both employer and employee -- I didn't mean to interrupt you, but I just --

MR. CROSS: It would show up as part of your federal income tax or your payroll tax, and it would be deducted out of your paycheck, and paid for the portions that are paid there, and then you would be responsible for reporting your taxes at the end of the year, to whatever means you do that as earnings.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So I'm correct, right?

MR. CROSS: The City -- you know, it shows up as compensation, --

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Right.

MR. CROSS: -- so you would be in the tax bracket, and you would be taxed in accordance with that. You would pay your taxes at the end of the year, whatever is short, or whatever overages are made from your taxes would be between you and the federal government.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Right, so I'm correct. I -- I think this is a fair request. Any elected official can do what they choose to do, what they -- their stipend. They could not take it, give it back. With all the population growth, all the things that we're doing, as elected officials in the community. Me, for sure, and some of my colleagues have paid bills, especially utility bills for our resident that less fortunate in our City. They call us on a daily basis. Yesterday -- today, I got a lot of request, and I have to pick up -- I take my debit card and pay bills for people who are struggling. So -- and even some of our employees here, I would -- making request to assist them with their bills, the ones that live here in Miramar. So I think this is a fair request, and I would encourage my colleague to support this. This is the first reading. I -- I would love for this to pass in the way it is presented, and if we need to make changes, then at the next reading, we could do so. So City Manager identify funding for it. If he didn't think he could do it, he wouldn't bring it forward, so my name is attached to it, and I'm in support of it. So I'm ask my colleague to support this agenda item.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: If I --

MAYOR MESSAM: Vice Mayor Davis, you're recognized.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you. I -- I have heard some talk about stipends and, you know, what it's used for, etc., but, you know, according to this, we already get a stipend, so the stipend, you know, is \$2,500.00 right now; we're looking to increase it. So you're already getting the stipend, and it's in your paycheck. I don't know that you've given it back or donated it out. I -- I have no idea, but it's not new. It's something that currently takes place, and -- and we get a stipend. There are other cities -- I see Pembroke Pines, they -- they get a stipend. The mayor gets \$20,000.00, commissioners each get \$11,000.00 in stipend compensation. I -- I did try to find out the -- the annual salary itself, that goes towards -- in terms of your pension, but the stipends and those things do not add up in terms of additional pension, you know, compensation later on. Am I correct?

MR. CROSS: Yeah, correct. Anything that's counted toward your pension would be based -- would be your annual salary, not stipends, allowances.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Which is the \$34,000.00. And -- and -- and again, speaking of Pembroke Pines, their car allowance, the mayor is \$9,000.00, commissioners \$7,000.00. It's not out of the realm of -- of what is -- is happening. And -- and so I -- I have problem supporting the item when we're ready to -- to vote on the item.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Just a correction, Vice Mayor. It's \$20,000.00 for the mayor in Pembroke Pines, and \$11,856.00 for a commissioner, the stipend.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: What I would share with the public is that --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I think Commissioner Colbourne is --

MAYOR MESSAM: Oh, I didn't see her raise -- raise her -- okay. Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. I would like to see some further work done on this -- on this item before I could approve it. There are several items here, one of them being a regular increase or annual increase between two and five percent. There's a \$10,000.00, and then there's an increase in the car allowance. The \$10,000.00, if I wanted to use it for a scholarship program, similar to what Commissioner Barnes has done in the past, I could use that money towards that?

MR. CROSS: You could. How that would work would be dependent on how the stipend is structured. If it's as presented in the agenda item this evening, it shows up as compensation, so -- excuse me. To the Mayor's point, what's deducted from that for taxes, you'd have that remaining amount, and you would handle that outside of the City's process. If it was done as a -- as an expense, perhaps some other type of language could

be written into the resolution -- into the ordinance, rather, that would -- would allow that type of flexibility with the money. It depends on how it would show up finally.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Okay. I would -- I would certainly want to -- to -- to use it towards something of a scholarship program, again, similar to what Commissioner Barnes has done in the past. The car allowance, I would -- I would ask my colleague if he would consider in keeping it the way it is, and in terms of the annual increase, I would -- I would also like to forego that portion of it. So if we can -- if we can take a look at these and bring it back to us, because it has to come back before us, those are the changes that I would like to see on this item when it comes back to us.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. A couple of items for perspective. Of all the cities that are comparable, will be considered comparable in sized of the City of Miramar, Miramar and Pembroke Pines are outliers. Only Miramar and Pembroke Pines even give a stipend. And a -- a -- a refresher, the \$2,500.00 stipend only came about when Broward County Commission approved or mandated the new ethics ordinance that takes place, and when a big issue became where elected officials that typically and normally, and as they should, attend charitable balls, galas, and those events have big tickets for cost, because they're fundraisers. And we adopted this stipend because we could no longer accept those tickets. The \$2,500.00 was a stipend to compensate elected officials to purchase their own tickets to these events, and it was averaged around about, maybe, eight to ten, on average cost of about \$250.00 for those events. That's when we adopted the stipend, and that was the purpose of the stipend. Pembroke Pines, they're off the chain. Mayor \$20,000.00; I don't know the rationale behind that and what it's used for. I guess you have to go back to their record. Commissioners, \$11,000.00. I don't know. we don't live in Pembroke Pines, we're Miramar. So -- and the other thing is this, if I'm reading correctly, automatically gives us a raise of two percent to five percent COLA, right, automatically?

MR. CROSS: That's correct. It would be every January 1st based on --

MAYOR MESSAM: So approval, no public inspection, automatically, we get a raise.

MR. CROSS: Correct.

MAYOR MESSAM: And very well, in collective bargaining, our employees may not get that, but it's not even up for debate or even vote; that's what this ordinance calls for. So not only is it in effect, basically, giving us a raise in pay, automatic raises to COLA, cost of living adjustment. If these dollars are needed for legitimate commission business activities, it should be placed in the appropriate account, where we're not just paying over 30 percent in taxes and income taxes toward employee. We haven't even talked about the City of Miramar as an employer in regards to its payroll tax for that same amount, and that's the point I was making. So not only are we paying as employees taxes, the City of Miramar has its associated payroll tax for that additional increase. It's just waste of government dollars. I'm not saying that there are situations, as was alluded, in terms --

that's a choice if you want to provide benevolent service to the community using your own personal dollars to help people in a benevolent way. But we have a program that is set up to assist individuals for arrears of utility bills; we can put effort and funding into that transparent process. But I think to put that on to the elected official as income is not the most efficient way; we get automatic raises without inspection or vote, and this isn't the norm. Stipends are not the norm. Based on this survey, only Miramar and Pembroke Pines, out of comparable cities. You don't have all 31 municipalities; there may be others, but based off those that are comparable to us in size -- and I would probably guess that smaller cities that have much smaller budgets don't give these types of stipends. So I think this would need some major overhaul. I'll make recommendations between the second reading, but I just think that this does not look good for us as a commission to talk about giving raises automatically, every year from two to five percent with the floor -- two percent is the floor. So regardless -- no matter how the economy is going, two percent raise regardless, without question or inspection, in the closet, in the dark, because no one will ever look at this ordinance every year, that's a fact. So I think if we are looking for funds to address some of these other issues, we put them in a transparent process, or just ask for a raise to base to cover it. Commissioner Chambers, followed by Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Just for the record, Pembroke Pines car allowance for mayor is \$9,594.00 and for commissioner \$7,176.00, and in addition to that, you have the stipend of \$20,748.00, and \$11,856.00. You know, we -- we are within range of all the other cities around here. Miramar is considered to be the -- one of the leading cities here in Broward County of the 31 municipality. And we are on the cutting edge, we are doing things no other city is doing. Right across the country, cities are looking at Miramar as to what we're doing, and learning from us, and taking lesson from us, and Fort Lauderdale, is within -- a leader ahead of us, so they have an increase that they pushed recently, Miami-Dade and so forth, so we're not doing anything that's not within the scope of other cities here in Florida. And I -- I think this is very reasonable. In addition, the Mayor spoke about what this is doing to our city, and recently I see a report where in the presidential race where it was a \$5.00 posted for a quarter, and that was really embarrassing for me, embarrassing for the City of Miramar, and I think with this, it will allow me to contribute more than my \$10.00 already given to the campaign. And if there's someone else who is running for president from the City of Miramar, we -- personally, I could contribute more to prevent that embarrassment, so I think this is reasonable, and I urge my colleague to move this along, and make a few changes when we come back.

MAYOR MESSAM: You can tell when someone does not have any merit to stand on when they try to change the debate and make it personal, but I won't get in the mud, because my parents always told me when you get in the mud.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: And if I may, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR MESSAM: So, Commissioner Barnes, you're -- you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Thank you. So I may read from a string of emails between myself, Mr. Eric Silva, via my legislative assistant, it says at the September 18 Commission meeting, Commissioner Barnes and Commissioner Chambers offered to pay half of a property owner's permit fees. She has two fire permits pending. My response was, go ahead. It said, "Please proceed with processing one of the payments below. If it -- if one needs to be paid first, please process that one." And she gave the account number from which it should be paid. So any questions about my commitments to help, whether private individuals or businesses, it's been done.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Commissioner Barnes.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Colbourne, you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I'd like to make an amendment. To delete the portion of -- of the annual salary increase, and to delete the portion that changes the amount that increases the amount of vehicle reimbursement as well, and -- and in terms of the \$10,000.00, to allow those who wish to use it for charity, or for some other public purpose, that we be allowed to do that.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: If I --

MAYOR MESSAM: We can have some discussion on that. Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you. In terms of the -- the COLA, I -- I think we -- we need to -- to relook at the COLA issue, because we really don't know what's going to happen in the future. I mean we're looking -- we could be possibly looking -- be looking at a -- a recession that may or may not come, so I think it would be irresponsible to -- to -- to predict and have a COLA every year when we really don't know from year to year what's going to be happening. So I'm agreement -- I'm in agreement with -- with that -- striking that out. But the -- the business stipend is currently \$2,500.00 --

MAYOR MESSAM: No, it's a stipend, not a business stipend. It's just a general stipend to -- to -- that could be used towards -- at the time when it was adopted, for galas, events, those personal expenses, because we could not -- you just could not accept a gala ticket from an organization to come to those events.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Okay. So the business stipend, I'm okay with. I'm mean, if we need more explanation as to how it would work, and what the funds could be used for, maybe we could look into that to see if folks want to use it for different things. The monthly vehicle allowance, I believe, just as the City Manager receives the -- the -- I think it's what, \$7,000.00, many of us are here every day working, going out, meeting, doing business outside of the City of Miramar, and I -- I think it would be comparable to -- to have a similar vehicle allowance. I mean, granted, if you're not going anywhere and you're not doing anything, you don't come to City Hall every day, you don't go meet people outside of Miramar, maybe you don't need it, maybe you don't use it, and that's fine. But for those

that are actively working and actively here, and actively would use it, I -- I think it's quite appropriate. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: I think the -- the main issue I have here is the -- is the business expense. If the business expense is going to pass, that must be moved over to a departmental account, so that the full use of that can be available for those who are using it for either philanthropic purposes, for scholarships. It makes no sense for us to pay taxes on that, upwards of 30 percent, plus -- in addition to the City's associated payroll taxes that would be associated with that amount. That would just be irresponsible, so that should be moved over to a separate account, so that the full use of that would be available. How could any of us in good conscience say that it is okay to pay those taxes on that just to receive it in our paycheck? I think the vehicle -- to put the Commission on the same line as the City Manager, I think that's a reasonable request; it's, in my estimation, de minimis, in terms of the -- from where we are right now to where it would go up to, but on the business expense, that must be moved over, because it just would be irresponsible to have to pay taxes on that, when we could have the full amount available for whatever purposes, for whoever chooses to use it, and I think that's the responsible thing to do. Commissioner Chambers followed by Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I'm going to ask Ms. Susan Gooding, if you could come to the podium, please.

MS. GOODING-LIBURD: Good evening, Mayor, Commissioners, Vice Mayor.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, ma'am. I know you are the expert in the City finance and the salary. Can you explain the difference between the stipend, as oppose to if this was a straight up increase in our salary, and which one would be more efficient for the City.

MS. GOODING-LIBURD: Well, as was stated earlier, the stipend won't count towards the base pay. However, as the Mayor stated, the City will have to pay that 7.65 percent as matching for any of those expenses that comes on your paycheck.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So, is there another way to avoid that cost?

MS. GOODING-LIBURD: The only other way I could see is increase a line item into the operation of your department or division within the Commission, so you can put a line item in there that says stipend for those extra stuff that you need to do, and if it is not utilized, it can then go back into the fund balance. But that provide a lot of clarity and a lot of disclosure, so no questions are asked.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Okay. And if it's -- if there's an increase in the Commission pay, what -- what would happen?

MS. GOODING-LIBURD: If there's an increase on the base pay, the pension goes up.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So that's the -- the only difference is the pension goes up, as opposed to the stipend?

MS. GOODING-LIBURD: Right. And if I can make a recommendation, I would say put the stipend in the operation of your division, so that the City doesn't -- you will not be taxed, and the City doesn't have to pay tax.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Barnes, you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Just for the record, comparisons of the City Manager benefits and those of the Commissioners are disingenuous and inappropriate. The City Manager is a civil servant. We are elected officials.

MAYOR MESSAM: All right. So we have presented recommendations. I think you've gotten some from Commissioner Colbourne, Commissioner -- I mean Vice Mayor Davis, as well as myself, and I think for purposes of discussion, and for the second reading, if those are probably just put down on a schedule, so that they can be discussed to adopt what would be the, I guess, the final or approved ordinance that may or may not pass for second reading. Are there any other comments on this item? May I have a motion.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Motion to approve.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Just for clarity, so we're approving with the changes?

MAYOR MESSAM: There are no changes to approve. So this is approving the adopt -- the present -- the current draft of the ordinance as the first reading. If it passes tonight, second reading, as backup, staff would present the recommend -- the recommendations that was discussed during our -- our comments. So, in other words, there was --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So my -- my question is, then, can this be removed and brought back with the changes? Why approve something that --

MAYOR MESSAM: We can -- we can --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: -- all the things are --

MAYOR MESSAM: The Commission can decide what we want to discuss these items. I recommended removing the automatic COLA.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Right.

MAYOR MESSAM: I recommend moving over the business stipend to operational. So -
-

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: And could we bring it back with those changes?

MAYOR MESSAM: We -- well, it could -- well, we have to -- let's give clarity for staff, in terms of what we want to see to come back, so we can do that tonight, so that as it comes back before us -- so, yes, we can do that tonight.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So is that what we're doing?

MAYOR MESSAM: So are we in agreement to remove the automatic COLA?

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: It's three people that said to remove it.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yeah.

MAYOR MESSAM: So removal of the two percent to five percent.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: And we keep the car allowance and the stipend.

MAYOR MESSAM: I recommend that, to avoid the loss of the \$10,000.00 through payroll tax by the City, as well as the associated employee income tax on the \$10,000.00. That the business stipend be moved over to operations under the Commission department, which would still be available for the same purposes, which was the spirit of even originating this, and it would be available for those purposes. If someone wants to use it for benevolences, if someone wants to use it for scholarships, or choose not to use it at all, but the City would not be taxed, as well as us as elected officials wouldn't be taxed. I think that would be the responsible thing to do. Do I have support on that?

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I am okay with the idea, since it's still accessible for benevolence. So the issue that was raised, in terms of scholarships, paying utility bills, and so on would still be able to be done with that. So I'm good.

MAYOR MESSAM: That's two. Is there a third supporter of that?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I think I would like to see the City come back and bring the options of how to handle the \$10,000.00.

MAYOR MESSAM: We received the recommendation from the CFO, in terms of their recommendation is to have it on operations to save those unnecessary costs, so the other option would be from us.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Understood. I would -- I would like to see all of the options outlined for the \$10,000.00.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I'm in agreeance with that.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Okay. So, so far, we have consensus for the COLA, so that can come out, and then the -- sorry, just to clarify.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah, the --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: And then the -- taking the stipend, that needs to be -- needs to come back with more explanation, according to -- but what about -- what else.

MAYOR MESSAM: Well, it's just two options -- stipend, let's be clear. It's only two options: it's either on operations, or it's in our paycheck, or none at all. Those are the options. Some have tax -- if it's on operations, there's no tax implication. If it's on our payroll, it has --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I think Commissioner Colbourne mentioned that if it's -- if it is in -- in the -- not as -- as an item, that can she still use that, and how to do it, to use it for scholarships, because then that would be an option --

MAYOR MESSAM: Oh, yeah, we're -- we're saying --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Because then that would be an option for her --

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah, we're saying that. We're -- yeah.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Okay. This -- let me -- let me be clear in what I'm saying, since I'm not.

MAYOR MESSAM: That was my recommendation. I'm saying -- I made the recommendation to move the \$10,000.00 business stipend out of the paycheck to operations and designate so that I can be used for benevolence, so it can be used for scholarships and the other items that were mentioned, in terms of what the business stipend was originally proposed for.

MR. CROSS: Mr. Mayor, can I --

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

MR. CROSS: Just a procedural suggestion. Perhaps we write for the stipend both options, so that the Commission has the option to take a stipend and take it as either part of compensation or it can be identified as an operating expense, just to have that language in the ordinance for second reading, and then the Commission can debate that. And then whichever option is decided upon, can strike the parts out that they don't want as part of the final code. That way, they're both there presented in the ordinance as

options, and then the Commission can debate that next meeting, and decide how that language would look in the final.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: That's exactly what Commission Colbourne was saying.

MAYOR MESSAM: I made the recommendation. How can -- that's my recommendation. So what's the pleasure of the Commission. They'll present the ordinance with both options, we can decide it. I'm just saying -- I'm communicating to the public. It's either in our paycheck or it's in operations, it's as simple as that. One is taxed, one is not. That's the decision we have to make. You can present it in the ordinance. All right. next recommendation. Who has another recommendation?

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: For that same thing?

MAYOR MESSAM: No, no, no, no. For -- you said the others.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Well, the vehicle allowance, I'm in agreement that the vehicle allowance should be raised to the level of the City Manager for those that, you know, don't come to work, like they -- you know, they don't show up here. That, maybe, have no need even for a vehicle. But for those that do show up here, those that do actually go outside of City limits to do what needs to be done, I think it's quite reasonable. The fact that you're an elected official doesn't mean you just show up at commission meetings twice a month. There's a lot more to it, and -- and so I -- I think that's quite reasonable. The -- the extra amount is what, \$2,000.00; I have no problem with that. Again, some other people have another option.

MAYOR MESSAM: So that would be no change; so that will just stay as is, because that's what it currently is, right? So it'll stay --

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: As -- as I voiced before --

MAYOR MESSAM: It'll

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: -- I didn't -- I don't agree with the vehicle -- with the increase for vehicle. I don't know if you have consensus, but I -- I don't agree with it.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I think we have three consensus on the vehicle.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yeah, that was myself, Mayor Messam, and Maxwell. You said you didn't mind about the vehicle.

MAYOR MESSAM: Well, if it was debatable. I mean if it's -- I mean I don't see a need for it, for the increase, but, you know, I'm -- I'm okay how it's presented in the -- in the -- in the -- in the ordinance.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So the main issue is the \$10,000.00 stipend?

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes. And the automatic COLA.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: But we already agreed to not have that.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah. Okay. Are there any other adjustments for staff for direction? Because those were all the other points. Okay. So you have -- I think you -- you all have -- and you'll listen to the tape, I'm sure. All right. There's no further -- if there's no further action -- comments on this item, may I have a motion.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Motion to approve again.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Second, with the changes.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Amendments, adjustments or whatever, my vote is no.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: No.

On a motion by Commissioner Chambers, seconded by Vice Mayor Davis, to approve Ordinance #O1737, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	No
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Vice Mayor Davis	Yes
Mayor Messam	No

SECOND READING SCHEDULED for November 13, 2019

PUBLIC HEARING

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number 12, please.

- 12. SECOND READING** of Temp. Ord. #O1733 relating to **Signs**; making findings; amending Sections 1002 Definitions and 1014.3 Regulations; providing for severability and interpretation; providing for inclusion in the Code; providing that officials are authorized to take action; and providing for an effective date. (***Passed 1st Reading on 10/16/19***) (*Community Development Director Eric Silva*)

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: An ordinance of the City Commission of the City of Miramar, Florida, relating to Signs; making findings; amending Sections 1002 Definitions and 1014.3 Regulations; providing for severability and interpretation; providing for inclusion in the Code; providing that officials are authorized to take action; and providing for an effective date.

MR. SILVA: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, --

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

MR. SILVA: -- Madam Vice Mayor, Commissioners. Eric Silva, Community Development Department. This is the second reading of an ordinance to change our billboard requirements. And we do have one change, and this change was originally brought to our attention by a property owner who had dedicated a canal for drainage to the South Broward Drainage District. So the change that some suggested is to section 1014.3 regulations 1b, and the change would be to delete, "...adjacent and..." and then at the end after expressways, to add, "...for the purpose of this section, continuous is defined as touching along a boundary, while separated only by a canal or access road dedicated by the property owner or the predecessors in title." But during our research on the properties along I-75 and the Turnpike, they also found some properties that had dedicated an access road along the Turnpike, so those properties will also be allowed to have digital billboards.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any members from the public that wish to comment on this item?

MS. SCIALABBA: Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26 Street. I did have one comment. As far as the landscaping around the post, is the City taking care of the grass around there,

making sure it looks nice and clean, or is the Out Front, Incorporation doing that? Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. We'll make sure we get an answer to that. Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Any other members from the public? Seeing none, back to the dais. Are there any other questions or comments? Can you address the question raised by the resident, Ms. Scialabba?

MR. SILVA: Yes. Regarding landscaping, yes, the billboard company will be required to maintain that landscaping.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay. Thank you. May I have a motion.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Motion to approve.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Record the votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Barnes.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Barnes, seconded by Vice Mayor Davis, to approve Resolution #R7033, the Commission voted:

Commissioner Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes

Vice Mayor Davis
Mayor Messam

Yes
Yes

Ordinance No. 20-02

OTHER BUSINESS

Reports and Comments:

Commissioner Reports:

MAYOR MESSAM: On to reports. Commissioner Barnes, you have a report?

COMMISSIONER BARNES: No, sir.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Chambers, you have a report?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes, sir. There is an ongoing issue with the Monarch Lake Professional Center. That's just west of Flamingo and Miramar Parkway, and we've been working with the -- the management company and the owners of the -- those business there. I know the doctor was here earlier, and he seems a little sleepy, so I told him to go home, and we do -- I don't acknowledge the property manager here. And we, so far, have come up with a solution the parking issue there. Number of persons that have their car towed, so I asked the City Clerk to give each elected official a paper bill -- I have one more, if there's someone needs another drawing. As you look to the paper, you could see where it's highlighted, that would be the new additional parking on the north section and the west section of the plaza. This is a plaza that was approved and granted variances for less parking, so this should alleviate the stress and having patron cars being towed. No -- this is going to come back before us next week with more details, and I know they're going to be asked for fees to be waived, so I just want to announce this now, that it will be coming forward next week. And Mr. Silva will be working with the applicant to bring us the fees, and what need to be waive, because that will be the last meeting before next year, so we don't want to hold up the project, we want it to move along quickly. So I just want to share this with my colleague and staff, and acknowledge the gentleman here, so thank you for your patience, sir, and thank you for move quickly and give us this drawing, and I know you are in the process of getting estimate for the construction. So if you could try to get back to us by Monday, so we can put it on the agenda, and give you some resolution with the fees that would be associated with this. So, thank you so much for being here, and thank you for your patience. Thank you for producing this drawing quickly. Okay. Something else I have in mind before I go to the screen. The City Clerk Office, I walked in there today, and the carpet -- carpet is in dire repair; there's some bubbles. I'm going to ask staff to take a look at it, and make sure no one tripped over it, and see if we could get a carpet replaced, and try to make it a more safe City Clerk Office. Then we can move forward with the next -- I had the pleasure of visiting the Bahamas

once more, and this time I went with Mr. Sonny (sp) Martin, and was greeted at the airport by the Minister of Natural Disaster, Mr. Iram Lewis, and have the pleasure of went down and did the tour. I know the first time I was there I was there to work, but this time I really get a good look as to some of the damage that was done by the hurricane. And next slide, please. As you could, some of the houses that I visit, as to how badly damaged with the 15 and 20-foot wave came in and -- and -- next slide, also. You know, so many people had lost their lives, and lost their home, entire neighborhood just gone, and people are just devastated there. Next slide. And this is one of the NEMA warehouse where, you know, we -- right here in the City of Miramar, people donate so many things that was shipped over there, and everything went to -- that's not labeled for each resident, it all went to NEMA warehouse, and then this is one of the warehouse that I toured to see the operation, where people are unload the container, and then have to go through and sort everything, and get it ready to be distributed, so -- next slide, please. Next -- next slide. Do you see, we were -- Mr. Lewis on the left, and myself on the right, we were loading up to head out. Next slide, please. Some lady who lost her business and try to get going at home; needed a generator. We were able to make a delivery to her, and she was very grateful. Next slide. And just out on the street. Now -- keep going. This is my college workshop coming up again. We want to encourage student to sign up. We're doing it from home on their computer, and we want to help them with their -- step by step, all the application process, their letter writing, recommendation, and the scholarship FAFSA, and for them to access all that free money that's out there. It's \$2.9 billion that goes back every year unclaimed, and the student loan adds up to \$1.4 trillion in debt that is -- our kids incur. So we want to encourage them to reach out to myself at 954-602-3154, or Ms. Beth Hall, 954-546-1171. Coming up on November 16th, we'll having the event at Shirley Branca Park, 6900 Miramar Parkway, and we would be having -- collecting toys; it's a toy drive, and also food drive for Thanksgiving for folks who in need. And we'll have a number of performances there: Hal Anthony, Dilly Chris, Alley Cat, Curly Cash, and many, many more DJs, along with WZOP and food trucks and bounce houses for the kids. Patrons are encouraged to bring toys for -- and food for their donation to enter, so we want to encourage everyone to bring something that we can give back for Thanksgiving, and also toys for Christmas. And November 16, this is a program that I really like. It's Heroes Home Advantage, and the good thing about this program, if you are in this nonprofit program, the realtor will give you 25 percent of their -- of their proceed back to one of these person, whether it's a teacher, a military, fire, police, medical personnel, or any government employees will receive up to \$6,000.00 toward their closing cost. And this program is whether you're buying or selling. So if you're one of those person, and you're selling a home, and you opted into this program, you will be helped just as buying a home with your closing cost. So I really like this program. The fact that it works both ways for our heroes, especially teachers, who are at the lower spectrum of the income salary bracket, so please come on out and enjoy a day of festivity from 4:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. on the 16th. I do have also -- I want to encourage folks to donate for Harvest Drive, and Glade Middle School will be having their Harvest Drive this coming November 15th from 4:45 to 7:00 p.m. For those of you who always come out and volunteer, please do so, and please bring any donation that you have this week to be dropped off at the school. And also New Renaissance. They're not doing a full harvest drive, but Ms. Teyra, she's

-- continue to do her thing; it's a lady that always doing things. She had a stroke, but she's back; thank God she made it, and back at school teaching, so we want to continue to support her. The next thing I want to announce our annual -- 21st Annual PAL Golf Tournament coming up November 15th, and this is at the Bonaventure Golf Club in Weston. I also want to encourage all employees who can contribute. You don't have to be a sponsor, but you could have donate alcohol that can be raffled or a gift basket, anything that can raffled, we want you to donate, so we can have that to raise fund for our children here in Miramar. You know, PAL provide the year round services for Miramar children, and we want to continue to support that organization, make sure they -- and continue to do that, so. And all of you who play golf, this is a good way to come out and hang with our officers and shoot some golf, and just have a wonderful day. And any item that can be donated to Miramar PD or to my office, we will gladly accept it. And I think that's it. Thank you so much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. Last week we had Let's Go Walking To School; it's an initiative that happens every year. This year there was a twist to it. The MPO also has a similar program to -- the MPO and the School Board, along with the City of Miramar, we work together to do a special walk to school day, where we painted crosswalks, and -- in bring colors to bring awareness to the pedestrians, to slow down the vehicles. It was actually well attended. We did it in two phases: on the 23rd, we got together, and we did -- and we did the painting. It's temporary painting. Most of it will probably have been washed away by now. It was really painted for that day, and then on -- on the 30th, we had probably about 100 students and parents that walked a two-block area to -- to work This is an area where we received a grant for sidewalks. From FDOT in this area, over the next five years, until sidewalks will be implemented. But I definitely want to thank MPO, our police department that participate in this. We had engineering staff that truly helped out to make this possible, so I do want to say thank you to all the parents, the teachers, and everyone who participated. And I would -- I would definitely say it was -- it was truly a good experience, a successful event, and the kids are excited to have all that company walking with them to school. And they're definitely looking forward to it happening again next year. May I -- (video shown) Okay -- go down some more. Okay. Okay. Thank you. Next I want to talk about the Halloween a little bit. Our Halloween event last year came out really good, and I truly want to thank officers that made quite a big difference and corrected the traffic issues that we had last year. I did receive comments from residents that they were -- they were very pleased and satisfied that the incidents that they had last year did not occur this year. So, again, thank you so very much to all our officers. It truly made a difference to the residents, and the kids were able to enjoy -- enjoy the party. I think we have a 30-second video, and if it's too loud, we can cut it. If the audio is not good, please cut it. Okay. Okay. Okay. And, lastly, I will be having a Thanksgiving Turkey Giveaway next week, and we'll be putting out some more information on it. It is for City of Miramar residents only, and you must register on the link that's provided. Okay. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Commissioner Colbourne, if I may, I want to thank you so much for the Halloween event. It was well attended. To see families -- families and young men that look like me walking their children, their daughter, their son out there, that's priceless, so just to have that, I'm grateful. These families and men, once again, -

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: -- black men walking their children to the Halloween and to the fun.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: It -- it is -- it is so true. It is so true. It really is a great sight. Thank you so much.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I'm very pleased. Thank you so much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Vice Mayor Davis.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you. I -- I guess I would echo that. We did get a lot of compliments on the improvements, and -- and how well it turned out, and that you actually did listen to our residents in that area, and the police did a good job at navigating the traffic.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: And I should say staff in general. I did say police, because I know that's -- the residents had some complaints, and they truly addressed that, but we had a lot of staff participation, and they really worked to make it -- to make this possible, so thank you all.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Excellent. Couple of things before I start my presentation, one being if I could get an update on the City Manager with regards to the marquee at the Regional Park. Why I'm asking is because that the marquee, currently, it can -- looks like it can advertise about, maybe, four or so events. Currently, what's being advertised there, apart from the fact that it had advertised the State of the City event, currently, what's being advertised there is, I believe, it's Veteran's Day, and also either a diving or swimming --

MAYOR MESSAM: It advertised Halloween as well.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Oh, I didn't see the Halloween. And so the reason why I asked is because I am working along with the Police Department to do a Guns For Funds event to bring unwanted guns off the streets, and I had asked to advertise it on the marquee. The marquee, as I mentioned, wasn't really advertising; it wasn't being fully utilized, and I was told at the time that there is a draft policy, not even a policy in effect, that would not allow for advertising on City initiatives. So I would like for -- for this Commission, if you would, and since we are the policymakers here in the City to have your input on the use of that

marquee. If it's not advertising anything from the Regional Park, and it's underutilized, and there is an event that's cup and coming, which is for the wellbeing of all of the residents of the City of Miramar, if -- if we could allow for that to be implemented in the policy that events that the Commission is doing, whether it's an initiative or not, can be advertised, rather than just leaving the space as is. I know for myself, again, I have something this weekend, I would love for that to be advertised. I think it's very important to get the guns off the street. In the past, I've used VMS Sports; it proves to be expensive, and since we have this -- this method, I'm asking that -- if I could ask my colleagues to allow for me to use the marquee. And in going forward, if we could come up with a policy, as policymakers, to ensure that it is used effectively, as I think the marquee is to be used. And I know I -- I believe you have something coming up as well, Commissioner Chambers, and, as I mentioned, there are several opportunities, and only two things are really being advertised of the fourth or five things that can be advertised from there. If I could get my colleagues' feedback on that.

MAYOR MESSAM: For your -- for your gun control? I mean for your gun buyback program. Is it this weekend?

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yes, it's this Saturday.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Commissioner -- I mean Vice Mayor, I remember when I saw it first, I didn't know it was up and running. There was only one event was advertising, and I asked, and I was told that I could not advertise my event, which was really nonsense. So I think if you're asking for us to vote tonight to approve that to your gun buyback or whatever it is that need to advertise, I think we -- I'm willing to do so to make that change.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Personally, in terms of the -- I think, overall for the -- for the marquee, I think it'll be -- I welcome us to discuss -- to discuss, I guess, the draft, and then we can discuss on what we actually, ultimately want -- want to see. Personally, I don't have an issue with the gun buyback event for Saturday. What I would caution us though, however, in terms of the marquee there, I think, right now, when I drive pass it, I see about, maybe, four or five flyers. I don't know all the ones that are -- that are being displayed on -- on them, but I think, as we discuss the policy for the marquee, I think the priority should be first towards the promoting events that are at the amphitheater, because that is the -- the marquee asset there at the park. I think that official-approved City events that we approve throughout the year that's a part of the budget process, should be a priority. Then followed by, for example, communitywide departmental -- you know, departmental activities or -- or -- or -- or features that benefit the community as a whole. Then, where there is availability, then Commission events. Now that's where it gets -- because all of us have events, and at some point you -- you -- you -- it gets to the point where diminishing returns happens when you have ten, 12 different -- I don't know the capacity of how many flyers can be -- can be shown, but I think as -- we don't have to solve this tonight. I just

think that as we talk and as we discuss, that we prioritize it with the -- what's going on at Regional Park, then official City events, and communitywide, departmental -- you know, departmental benefiting core programs beyond there. And then, in terms of the City, you know, Commission initiatives would be then slated afterwards. So I think what we would need to know is what is the recommended number of rolling screens, shots or slides; that should be shown, and what that number is to kind of give us some guidance, in terms of if that number six slides, seven slides, or whatever that number is, then it kind of helps us --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Right, and --

MAYOR MESSAM: -- to be able to determine.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: In addition to that, you can have, maybe, -- and we get more details as we go into the policy, but maybe an event can be shown, maybe, on certain days, or - - you know, like if there's several that's going on.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: And try to work around it. But just to blanketly say that, you know, Commission events are not going to be on there -- since we're the policymakers, I think we determine that. And so if -- if -- if I have consensus, just like three, if I could get that up and running, I'd appreciate that.

MAYOR MESSAM: That's for this weekend.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I think this is very simple, and --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Yeah, it's on Saturday, Guns For Funds.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Well, you have -- you have my -- you have my consensus to do it.

MAYOR MESSAM: You have support.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: And, going forward, I don't -- I don't -- I don't see why we would just be excluded from it. I -- you know, of course there has to be a policy, it has to make sense, and, you know, we don't -- we don't want to put more in there than -- than folks can actually absorb, and -- and it actually gives the information they need to get, so that has to be managed, so -- but I definitely wouldn't want a blanket no Commission initiative; that just doesn't sound right.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: And -- And I definitely don't want something to be micromanaged either, to find ways to keep us from having our stuff up there, because that's what it go right back to find sneaky ways to keep us from using it, so -- if not, we're

going to have to come right back here and make changes again, so just need to be fair across the board.

MAYOR MESSAM: City Manager.

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: I want to just address that. It was a very difficult response that I had my Assistant City Manager dealing with, Kelvin Baker, on this issue here. The one thing that I didn't want to happen -- we just put the billboard. Nobody knows better than the -- it's been eight years for me to get those billboards there, eight years, all right. And the -- in fact, it's supposed to be three. My biggest concern is I do not want to have a bad relationship with anyone about no marquee. And, yes, I recognize that the police guns -- the gun buyback is important here, but what was more important to me is to get a policy, so we're all on one accord. I'm going to tell you what can happen out of this. You only got one. So you got the Regional Park activities, and that's why -- that was the fight eight years ago. All right, they got their activities there. Then you got the City events, all right. Then you got the department -- you got the Cultural Arts Center that need to be advertised, because it's not nothing there. And then we come with the initiative, and then what happens with staff is, if we don't sit down with policy, they all going to be fighting with me about who should be first. I can see that coming. So I don't want to go down that road. I want to be on one accord with you all, all right. I don't want to be dancing with this thing. I want to be fair; I want everybody to be able to advertise. I wish we had three -- three out already. I wish there was a way that the billboards -- they were already here, but I need to make sure that we're all on one accord, because you can stress the staff. We already going through the -- the -- the -- Kathleen, during the time I was just watching, we had those -- those -- what it was called?

MAYOR MESSAM: A-Frames?

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: A-Frames, and the -- the --

MAYOR MESSAM: DMS.

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: -- DMS. Lord have mercy, we -- I mean that was a nightmare, all right, with that issue in here. I just want us -- we -- we got the tools. I just want us to be on one accord on how we're going to do it, and then who's first? Who's going to make the decision who's first. So we're going to have priorities as to who's event, and some -- and some of you all have same events the same time. I know it's a capacity on this here. So just understand from my point and from the staff. The staff been taking enough beatings with -- with -- with events in here. We just want to make sure that we all on one accord. Help me, and I'll help you, and do whatever you want to do. But just understand that we got to come up with some kind of policy, so everybody feels it's fair.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Well, nobody is saying you shouldn't have a policy. We're the policymakers. We just don't want to be put out of the policy. And -- and so, moving forward, we will get the policy in place. You have not -- I asked you before I began talking

what you have? You mentioned nothing. So if we could get that policy back in short order; in the meantime, if I could get my event up in short order, meaning tomorrow, I'd appreciate it.

- Commission Consensus given for Vice Mayor Davis to place her "Guns For Funds" event on the Miramar Regional Park marquee by November 7, 2019.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Continuing on. The -- I know I haven't been here that long. I've been here, back now, since March, but I know there is, possibly, a policy in place or somehow -- that we -- I'm -- I'm not quite ready for that, thank you -- that we evaluate our employees. So, in particular, I know in the past we have -- I wasn't here -- there was an evaluation process for Kathleen. I would like to see what that looked like. I wasn't here when that was being done, and I would like for, maybe, the attorneys have it, or somebody could provide for me that avenue to evaluate our -- our -- our City Manager. And, you know, since I've been here, he's been doing a fabulous job, from what I see. I was here under several different administrations, but there's always room for improvement. And - - and I think it's only fair to the employee to understand where the employer is -- is -- is looking at their work, and where there are room -- there is room for improvement, that is outlined, and when there is good work being done, that's also outlined. So if I could ask -- is Burnadette here?

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: She stepped out to the bathroom.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Okay. So, Norman, if you would research that, and what tool was used in the past, if that could be provided to me, and the rest of the Commission has probably seen that tool, because they were here during the last evaluation. And -- and so I could review that.

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: Yes, ma'am.

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: I don't think there was a tool.

MAYOR MESSAM: There was one -- I think there as one formal process or document, and I think even in that discussion, because of the -- it's up to each, individual elected official if they want to do their own -- what that evaluation process, there is a document that does exist that can be sent, I think, to you.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Okay. Right. So if -- if the attorney could look at that document and, maybe, provide me some other tools, and the rest of this Commission, so that we can have an actual process in place that would be beneficial to the employee, as well as to the employer. And -- and we could go forward, because we do need some kind of structure in that regard. I was here during the time when we had Robert Payton, and evaluations were nonexistent. He walked away with over \$1 million from the City, and, you know, I just want to be prudent in making sure I -- I look at what's going on on an annual basis, if that's the pleasure of the dais, to annually -- and I would think that would

be the pleasure, to annually review the employee. So with that, said, if I could go through to my presentation.

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: The pleasure for me has been -- because I've been around here for 20 years, it will be a pleasure for me, because I like to get feedback from the Commission, good or bad.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you.

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: Because I saw what has happen in the past.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Appreciate that. So this one is the Community & Cops event. We -- we had a good time; our residents were able to -- to speak to many of our esteemed panelists and get a lot of their questions answered. And, in fact, based on this forum, I believe other cities -- I believe the City of Tamarac wants to do something similar to make sure that our residents feel comfortable asking certain questions in a public forum, to whether it's a police chief, Broward sheriff, the Assistant State Attorney, or public defender, Clerk of Courts, they were all there, the Chief Judge, on hand to respond to our residents (Video shown). Thank you. Moving along, we also -- October 25th, we recognized Black British contributions, both here and the UK (Video shown). Thank you so much. We also want to thank our sponsors. Most of these events could not be possible without contributions from Waste Pro, and in this particular case, also the Related Group. Further in, we -- we -- we had our Biz Fit workshop, and -- and the folks from Economic Development and Community Development, and Business Inclusion have worked tirelessly to bring information, including Miramar/Pembroke Pines Chamber, to bring information to our budding entrepreneurs. And we are going to where they are. We're doing our tours first, and then our workshops are very well attended. People are craving for this information, and, really, they're very, very informative. And, so we had a very good time here, October 29th; we have a couple more -- well, actually, one more coming up. Move along. And then, of course, the Guns For Funds; we did this one over at St. Stephens, and we were able to retrieve over -- well, about 40 guns of the streets. And, you know, people just -- at some point, they want a way to get rid of some of the guns that they're not using, and it's best they give it to us, than it gets into the hands of the wrong individual. They throw it in a lake, or they throw it out, it gets in the hands of strangers, who, you know, maybe want to do harm, and so this is a really good way, and we partnered with, of course, the police department and Crime Stoppers, who provided the funding. So we appreciate the work that's been done in putting this event together, and we will continue this Saturday with our -- with our other one. I must say that the Cultural Affairs Department is really doing it, they're really stepping up. I know a birdie told me that Commissioner Colbourne had much to do with it. I don't know if she's going to take the credit, but I must commend Camasha and her staff, Zakiya and Alexis, and all those that -- that work over there, to bring these kind of top notch artists, and the place is always full. And it's -- they have something for everybody, and, you know, I happen to like R&B, but there's stuff for everybody at MCC, and we certainly appreciate your efforts to really listen to what our residents are seeking for. Upcoming, we mentioned the Guns

For Funds; that's this Saturday. This will be at St. John Paul XXIII Catholic Church, 16800 Miramar Parkway, from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. Once again, November 9th, this Saturday, St. John Paul XIII Catholic Church, 16800 Miramar Parkway. It's our Guns For Funds. You can get up to \$100.00 in gift cards for each handgun, up to \$150.00 for each assault rifle and shotgun. And we'd like to thank the League of Women Voters also; they were out there handing out free gun locks to residents with firearms. The Biz Fit Tour, on our last leg in the historic neighborhoods, November 12th, Tower Plaza, 6321 Miramar Parkway, from 2:00 to 5:00. We'll see you out there in the plaza. Again, Tuesday, November 12th from 2:00 to 5:00 p.m. And, finally, the Biz Fit workshop is the final in the series is November 19th, and we're going to be talking about finance: Finance Matters. Miramar Multi-Service Complex, 6700 Miramar Parkway from 6:30 to 8:30. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Vice Mayor, if I may. I'd like to commend you for the Black British event. It was well attended, well organized. I must say it's, for the most part, like a reunion. Folks who haven't seen their fellow friends and family in years was able to connect. And, as for me, just to see some of my family there, it was a wonderful, wonderful event. I want to thank you so much.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I know the Mayor has visited us twice, so you know it must have been special. He closed down the place. You left -- I left him there.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: And -- and the word out in the community, the people are looking forward to next year, so thank you.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thanks, Vice Mayor. Yes, it was a good, good event, good event. Good music, good vibes. In regards -- as a follow up to the State of the City that took place, I would just like to thank our -- our staff for putting that together, specifically, I would like to thank ACM Kelvin Baker, Gio, Eric Silva, our Cultural Center staff, Liz Valera with Parks & Recs, and our Office of Marketing & Communications, I think is the new name of the department. I think I got that right on the first time, right? So thank you all for, all the support staff, to -- to put that event together. Over the years, this event has -- has kind of formed to the place where the community can really see what's going on in the City, what accomplishments that the City staff and we, as a city together, have accomplished. And this year's focus -- focused on -- on some of the priorities that not only issues that have been brought up by the City Commission, but -- but intentful coordination with City administration to bring us all together as a community on one accord, at least in vision, so that we can begin to work on the future of the City of Miramar. Because we are the stewards for the residents that are yet to even exist, and and -- and that's how we have to look at -- as part of our calling and our charge, serving the community of today, while ensuring that our city is resilient and will be in strong standing for our residents in the future. And, also, I would like to thank, again, our friend of the City, his Worship Delroy Williams from Kingston, who sends his regards as well. I can truly say that the -- the two cities have had meaningful communication and interaction, in terms of technical support,

as well as idea exchange. And I can see this model even spreading towards other cities across the world, where we can begin to establish these relationships for the mutual benefit of -- of our international relations, as well as national relations with other cities, even across the country. The Creole Fest took place; it was their first annual Creole Fest; it actually received great reviews, in terms of their -- their lineup, the organization and production. They've already committed to coming back next year with -- with -- with -- with the second annual event, and I would like to thank the support staff at the -- the Regional Park and the amphitheater in helping that organization put on a world class event that was broadcast internationally across several countries, and will really help to not only provide culture -- additional culture in the City, but -- but put Miramar on the international stage again, in terms of being a place where culture lives and thrives. I would like to announce the successful conclusion of the educational toy drive; this was kind of as a result of the -- the City of Miramar hosting the Jamaica Diaspora Conference, where the Jamaica Teachers Association, as well as the Diaspora Education Task Force have their annual culmination of educators sharing best practices between South Florida, as well as in -- in -- in Jamaica. And we were contacted to help to support the Church's Teachers' College in Mandeville, Jamaica, and we partnered with the Emmanuel Apostolic Church in Miramar, and we collected over five container boxes that will be shipped to Jamaica through the consignment of the National Education Trust, which would be on behalf of the Church's Teachers' College. So I would like to thank all the residents, as well as the -- the members -- members and congregation of Emmanuel Apostolic Church for -- for a successful effort. On Saturday, December 7th, we have the community day for the Mayor's Aviation Expo. We -- and it's sponsored by Spirit Airlines, Broward County Aviation Department, also known as Fort Lauderdale International Airport, Broward County Schools, Ansin's Foundation, Miramar Park of Commerce, Comcast, Richard P. Hall Foundation, Broward College, Broward Sheriff's Office and many others. This is everything aviation. And this -- this Saturday is the community day, where everyone can come out and learn about the wonderful sector of aviation, which thrives in our city. We have many aviation companies. We really, really want you to bring your children out again, get to fly drones, get to go inside of an actual helicopter, and iFLY will be there onsite, and -- and, again, we'll have Broward Schools, robotics scrimmage will take place. There's already 26 robotics teams that will be competing against one another concurrently. These are STEM careers, and aviation is, perhaps, one of our largest commercial sectors in the City of Miramar. And, to ensure that this sector has a - a good depth and breadth of available employees and future managers and directors and technicians and engineers, we have to introduce this industry to our youth. And the day before will be a fieldtrip for Broward schools; we'll have over 2,000 youth that will be at the Miramar Regional Park at the amphitheater for the third -- third year in a row. So it has really grown to be a very successful event and looking forward to everyone coming out. The next item I want to bring to the Commission's attention is -- as many of you know, the -- with the solid waste issue that's going on in Broward College, there's a solid waste task force -- I've been -- Miramar is one of the five cities that have been involved with the Alpha 250 site, as you already know. But with this work group, they're asking each city to designate an alternate to be with the represented with the City, so I wanted to see who would have an interest in being the alternate for the City of Miramar for the

work group. And there will be -- these are meetings that -- that will take place as a result of the -- the consultant study to look at the future of solid waste and recycling in Broward County, whether it will be an independent or dependent authority that will manage solid waste in Broward County. So, obviously, Miramar being one of the largest producers of solid waste and recyclable material, our voice is strong, so we just need to -- just need to designate an alternate to -- to add to the Miramar representation to -- to the work group.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Just -- just for clarification, because I -- I did speak to staff myself regarding that, and it seems to me that they're in the process of reworking the group that you're a part of, and I -- I just need -- who's here from -- is the person here from solid waste to give a better perspective, because I believe that the whole thing is going to change.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: And there's going to be a whole new selection of folks who are going to be on the board, and I just want to make sure that we're on the same page with that.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah, for the -- for the -- for the authority, that ends up happening, so, no, you can -- but if you can just give some -- just a brief historical, I guess --

MR. TRAPANI: Brief?

MAYOR MESSAM: Brief, in terms of where we are, and the meetings -- the involved cities will change slightly, because some of the cities, like Pembroke Pines, their current contract is coming up, so we want them to be a part of the group, because they're large user. So, obviously, with their tonnage, it helps us in our bargaining and negotiating power, and all of those types of things. So -- so if you can just give a -- a brief --

MR. TRAPANI: Yeah, right. So -- Ralph Trapani, Public Works. So years ago when we left the ILA, an ILA sun-setted, the -- the County held certain assets and money from the cities. The City of Sunrise started a lawsuit against the County for those -- those funds and the assets -- excuse me. The City of Miramar participated, as well as other cities. When that happened, and the litigation ended, and they had to figure out what they were going to do with the assets, like Alpha 250 and the money that was still remaining from the debt service, the participants in the litigation chose five mayor, which Mayor Messam was one of them, and Becky Tooley from Coconut Creek, I think it was. So they chose those mayors to go ahead and figure out what we're going to do with the assets: are we going to sell them, are we going to keep them, are there going to be benefits for us to recycle and for trash, and how we're going to move forward with our next step. So over the several -- you know, several years now, they've kind of come to this conclusion that, hey, you know, maybe we should get back together, not get rid of Alpha 250. Let's do a study, see what the cities want to do, you know, where are we going to go, what do the cities want to do, you know, how can we get back together, because we have the power

of volume when everybody's together. Right now everybody's on their own really, so to get back together, and -- so, right now, it's the mayors, and then we -- you know, like Mayor Messam was saying, we choose an alternate as well, to figure out where that regional system might go. So we have about a year to do that, so that's kind of where we're at. This -- this working group right now is going to try to figure out -- which the -- the Mayor is asking for an alternate -- is figuring out how do we set up that structure moving forward; how do we get, not necessarily the same resource recycling board, but another board; how do we figure out that structure. Do we be an independent district, do we -- excuse me, a dependent district? So, right now, that's where we're at. Those people, the alternates -- every city will have an opportunity to be represented, and how do we figure out how to get there, so that's kind of where we're at. And then once we figure out where we're going to be, then a whole new working board will be chosen, as I understand it right now.

MAYOR MESSAM: And so a lot of these recommendations are the bases of the study that was commissioned, that the County paid for, as a part of our settlement with the Alpha 250 sale, and the mayors, pretty much, -- the work -- the mayor working group, the five with -- with Coconut Creek saw the value in retaining the -- the Alpha 250 site, because it has the zoning, it has the permitting, everything there, so that could, potentially, be a location for a future, let's say, processing or -- or -- or recycling plant. So -- so -- so now that we are engaging in this more broader discussion with all the cities and stakeholders, similar to how like we have Broward League of Cities, we have the chair, then we have the alternate, in the event -- like, for example, if I can't make a meeting, I'll reach out to Commissioner Colbourne to say if she can attend the meeting on -- on my behalf. So, for this, we are to designate an alternate, so that for each city, we'll have the mayors, their alternate or -- let's say that city may say: okay, well these are our two rep - our two representatives if -- if -- if -- if their mayor is not available for that.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: If I may.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I think this situation with staff, they have a more handle or understanding as to this --

MAYOR MESSAM: There's a technical group as well.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So what about Mr. Ralph.

MAYOR MESSAM: No, this is for elected officials, it's not for staff. There's also a technical consulting group that is alongside the -- the elected officials that provide that feedback, technical information, in terms of the topics and questions and issues that may arise. But, at the end of the day, it's going to be the elected councils and commissions that will give the directive for each city to say yay or nay, or what they would like to say as a stakeholder.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I'd like Commissioner Barnes, does he want to be an alternate? Commissioner? No.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Colbourne, you had a question?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes. I'm trying to understand a little better.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay. Currently -- who's meeting currently?

MAYOR MESSAM: They're -- they're setting up -- there hasn't been -- the next meeting is going to be on November 18th.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: But, generally speaking, it's the five mayors that meet?

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes. Well, only four when there is action required. So, for example, it was more so a -- it was more so a -- the divorce, so to speak, when the Resource Recovery Board broke up, and we had all these discussions about, well, we don't feel the County should have these assets, because we've been paying into this as well, so that was settled. And then part of -- as was -- was stated before, part of that settlement, it came up that the -- we would not sell the Alpha 250 site, we -- and commissioned the study.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: So --

MAYOR MESSAM: Now, based off the result of the study, now we have the study, now we are in position to say, okay, we have these recommendations from the study, which, basically, recommends that we and Broward County have a separate authority for solid waste. It will be its own governing board or whatever. They said -- they gave the options if it should be dependent or independent. The working group will now talk about these recommendations, so now each city will now have a -- an opportunity to be a voice in the ultimate decision.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: So the working group, it's now representative from all 31 cities?

MAYOR MESSAM: Is the working group going to be all 31 cities or is it just going to be the main -- the main -- the larger users? And then -- it will be larger than the five originally, but -- but it's not all 31 municipalities. Yes, Mr. Horton

MR. HORTON: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, members of the board. The Broward League of City is seeking five to seven members to make up this working group, and this working group will -- will be made up of elected officials that will help set the tone for -- for how we move forward, and the direction that we'll move forth. And then the

technical group made up of staff will give the input to the working group for them to make their decisions.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So I guess the question is, has the seven -- which seven are they? I thought you said five.

MAYOR MESSAM: It'll -- yeah, the original -- I think it was Sunrise, Miramar -- six --

MR. HORTON: There are six -- six cities that have been identified, thus far.

MAYOR MESSAM: Including Pembroke Pines, --

MR. HORTON: Including Pembroke Pines.

MAYOR MESSAM: -- which wasn't originally involved, because they were not a part of the original group. They had their own contract; they were separate. But now that they are -- their contract is ending, they have a stake in terms of where this goes, and they will be included as well, so the working group will only increase by one or two additional cities. And these are the major -- these are the major -- the major solid waste producers. Coconut Creek, although a medium-sized city, was included, because they were intimate in regards to the dispute because of the -- the -- the -- the landfill that's in their city -- that's in their city, so they had a -- they had a lot of issues with -- and then when Waste Managed purchased it from -- from -- from -- I think from Wheelabrator -- I forgot who they acquired it from. But -- but that's beside the point. So the working group -- so now that -- the working group is basically in place to give recommendations to the rest of the County -- to the rest of the County, in terms of representing the cities, because all 31 cities can't be at the table. All 31 cities can't be at the table. So with the working group, instead of just having only the mayors that represent those municipalities, they're asking each working group member to also have an alternate -- to have an alternate -- to name an alternate, so that they can have the roster of each city, the roster of the mayor and their alternate or the representatives that they have on -- for -- for the working group.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So the seven people right now are just mayors?

MAYOR MESSAM: I don't know everyone who is -- for the most part, but I don't know all their representatives from each -- each -- each -- who are their -- their alternates. So, for example, Mike Ryan -- you have Mike Ry -- you have Mike -- Mike -- Mike Ryan from Sunrise, you have -- what's the new mayor from Pompano.

MR. TRAPANI: Weston.

MR. TRAPANI: Dan Stermer.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah, Dan -- yeah.

MR. TRAPANI: Mayor Stermer from Weston is involved.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So you're going to have seven mayors, is what I'm asking?

MR. TRAPANI: No. On the current -- I think what's happening is we're confused, because we're using the same word "working group" each time.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah.

MR. TRAPANI: Currently, there's only a working group that was helping settle the -- the litigation from the sun setting of the ILA, which Mayor Messam has been a part of. So, moving forward, after we figure everything out, there's going to be five to nine municipalities represented, and that depends on the population of the cities, how they're going to break it up. There's a couple of different options available.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So when is that coming up?

MR. TRAPANI: That's --

MAYOR MESSAM: That's coming up now. All we have to do is --

MR. TRAPANI: Right.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So we're deciding those nine now?

MAYOR MESSAM: No, we're not -- Miramar is one of the --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Nine?

MAYOR MESSAM: -- eight to nine, yes. So we just have to name our alternate. Each city will put their mayor and their alternate who's going to be represented in the work group.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: That's why I was asking if --

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: -- if every city is nominating a mayor or that's not a requirement?

MR. HORTON: The answer is no. The -- the cities that have been identified have already provided their -- their delegate and their alternate. In our case, our delegate would be our mayor and --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: That's decided by?

MR. HORTON: Well, the Mayor by -- by the Charter, I believe, is the representative of the City, and so he has the choice --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: That don't make any sense.

MR. HORTON: -- if he doesn't want to be the delegate to give it over to someone else on -- on the -- on the dais.

MAYOR MESSAM: Plus I've been involved since the inception.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I don't think that's the correct reason.

MAYOR MESSAM: Why?

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Because Yvette's part of the MPO, so I just want to get an idea -- and you're saying that you've been involved from -- from the onset, but --

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes. And I'm -- and -- and -- and -- and, technically speaking, in terms of the Charter, I'm the governmental leader, as it relates to representing the City with other governmental entities. So if I delegate and say that I don't want to have that responsibility, because I have other responsibilities, and the Commission decides who will fit in that role, whether it's the vice mayor or if they determine two other elected officials, that can be at the prerogative of the Commission.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So is that something new? Because I've not known it to be that way. I'm just trying to understand the concept.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yeah, I understand that, yeah.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Because you said you have nine other cities, and they're not going the way that you're saying.

MAYOR MESSAM: Each city chooses -- each city can choose their representation, however, their governed by their charter, and however they decide on how -- who's going to represent them. So our decision is based on how our Charter and how we decide we want to -- how we decide we want to govern ourselves. So our decision tonight is our representation. So, as the Mayor of the City of Miramar, and being involved in the negotiations from the onset, and I have no change in desire to continue serving in that role, so the question is moved forward in terms of who would like to be the alternate.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I guess this -- this conversation has taken a kind of a different tone. So it's -- it sounds to me that that we're saying that the Mayor has to be on the board, that he has to be the representative, and I guess I would like a clarification on that from -- from the attorney. Because the question is -- is -- does the board have to be represented by the Mayor of the City, and -- and I'm a bit confused of that. So I guess I'm -- I would say I would like to hear from the attorney to see what -- which way do we have to go with this particular board.

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: For the alternate or the current makeup of the board that you're talking about?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: For -- for the makeup -- for the -- for the makeup.

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: Well, I don't have -- I don't have the provisions of this particular board in front of me, so to answer your question, if you're looking at it in terms of what the Charter says, the Charter dictates who the ceremonial officer of the City, that's the Mayor. So I'm -- I'm not familiar -- I don't have the provisions of the makeup of this Alpha 20 makeup. And the Mayor is representing that the makeup of it has been preexisting elected officials that are mayors of the respective cities. He doesn't wasn't to serve on it anymore and he's asking the Commission --

MAYOR MESSAM: No, I'm still serving. It's they're asking additional -- alternate --

CITY ATTORNEY POWELL: As an -- asking for an alternate, and he's asking who would want to serve in addition to him as an alternate if he can't make the meeting.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: I think we -- we need to understand more. I -- I -- I believe it's -- it's a little bit more than what's being represented here. We have a work group that was done for or five people. Now we've moved on from that work group, --

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: -- and each city is selecting somebody --

MAYOR MESSAM: To rep --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: -- nine cities --

MAYOR MESSAM: To represent their city.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: -- is selecting somebody to represent their city.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So we need to get more of a background on that.

MAYOR MESSAM: They're asking us to send the representatives.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: So we -- so we can make a decision as to -- and vote on it, like we do for other boards. And that's where we need the attorney to take a look at that board and let us know what the makeup -- I -- we need to understand more --

MAYOR MESSAM: Listen, this is -- this -- the --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: -- about -- I know you understand. You're -- you're involved in it.

MAYOR MESSAM: No, no, --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: We just want to get more information, because I don't believe --

MAYOR MESSAM: You can get more information. The only information is the League of Cities is just telling cities these are the eight, nine cities that are involved with the work group, --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: But we don't even know who they are -- what they are. We haven't got the presentation, and we don't know how they were chosen.

MAYOR MESSAM: The cities -- we said who the cities are.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: We need more information.

MAYOR MESSAM: They're Coconut Creek, they're Parkland, they're Pembroke Pines, they're Sunrise, and it's Tamarac. Those are the cities. Those are the cities.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: And how were they decided?

MAYOR MESSAM: And Miramar.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: How were the cities -- you see what I'm saying? Is a lot more going on? And maybe --

MAYOR MESSAM: However, they were decided -- however -- all right. Okay. Let me try to -- let me say -- let me try to simply --

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: You know how they were decided.

MAYOR MESSAM: Let me -- let me -- let me -- this is what the decision comes down to. Irrespective of how the eight or nine cities were derived, Miramar is one. The only one we control is Miramar. We don't control even the existence of the other seven or eight,

so Miramar is to submit its representative for the work group. As the Mayor of the City -- as the elected Mayor of the City, the ceremonial city and per the Charter, that says that, as the government leader, and representing the City with other governmental entities, I've served in this role in the first phase. I choose to continue to serve in this role in the next phase. However, moving forward in the next phase, the City of Miramar also should appoint an alternate, so that's what we have to decide. So who would like to serve as the alternate?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: From what I understand, and we're trying to understand, and Vice Mayor is saying that there's a process. And each city is going through their process, so, moving forward, we -- Vice Mayor want to have more clarity, and then bring it to the dais and we vote on it, and we select two --

MAYOR MESSAM: No, you -- you vote on the alternate. There's no voting on my position.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: But we can.

MAYOR MESSAM: The elect -- the -- the electorate decided on that. So if you all want to wait until the next meeting to decide on who wants to be the alternate, you can do that, but the meeting is no the 18th, and the Mayor of Miramar will be at that meeting, representing the City of Miramar as its mayor. I don't even know why this is even up for debate.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Well, because it's a free country, and we can debate things we don't understand. So if the attorney could get that information, please, as to the makeup of the board, who's represented on the board, the cities, and how they were chosen, some background, so we can all be as educated as our Mayor is educated about this board.

MAYOR MESSAM: And in the process, if you all can decide on who wants to be the alternate, so we can finish the discussion.

VICE MAYOR DAVIS: Well, we'll come back to that once we get all the information.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Barnes, you're recognized.

COMMISSIONER BARNES: I was wondering if I could volunteer, and therefore, nullify this ongoing conversation. Is that a remote possibility?

MAYOR MESSAM: All right, let me move on with my -- with my -- with my report. Do you have a report?

CITY MANAGER HARGRAY: Mayor, no other report.

MAYOR MESSAM: All right. As I close my -- my report, no matter what, I will continue to serve in my capacity as mayor, as long as the residents choose to. And despite some of

the comments, some of the personal attacks, my commitment to the residents is that I will have a level of decorum. I won't get personal. I will debate issues. I know we agree on many things. Things that we don't agree, and I'll respectfully debate the issues based on the merits of each point, and that is my commitment to the residents. I can rebut in ways that can go tit for tat, but I choose not to, because the image of this city is very important to me. The future of this city is very important to me. We have a lot going on in the City of Miramar, and when we work together, in the spirit of the community, and not make everything personal when we disagree, but just debate the issues, and vote up or down, according to our policies, according to our procedures, and according to our Charter. Miramar will continue to move forward, that is my commitment to you, as the residents, this is my commitment to the Commission, to each member of the Commission. I have no personal issue with any of my colleagues. We agree, in hallways, we laugh, we chat, we talk, we come on the dais, we have heated discussions, but I respect everyone as their role in their elected position, even when I don't get that in return. And it is my pleasure to serve as the Mayor of Miramar.

City Manager Reports:

City Attorney Reports:

FUTURE WORKSHOP

Date	Time	Subject	Location
11/13/19	5:00 p.m.	Financial Focus Meeting	Commission Chambers

ADJOURNMENT

MAYOR MESSAM: This meeting is adjourned.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:17 p.m.

Denise A. Gibbs, CMC
City Clerk
DG/cp