



## MINUTES OF THE CITY OF MIRAMAR REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

**February 21, 2018**

**7:00 P.M.**

The regular meeting of the Miramar City Commission was called to order by Mayor Messam at 7:09 p.m. in the Commission Chambers, Miramar City Hall, 2300 Civic Center Place, Miramar, Florida.

Upon call of the roll, the following members of the City Commission were present:

Mayor Wayne M. Messam  
Vice Mayor Winston F. Barnes  
Commissioner Maxwell B. Chambers  
Commissioner Yvette Colbourne  
Commissioner Darline B. Riggs

The following members of staff were present:

City Manager Kathleen Woods-Richardson  
City Attorney Jamie Cole  
City Attorney Alison Smith  
City Clerk Denise A. Gibbs

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening everyone. The meeting of the Miramar City Commission is now called to order. Madame Clerk, please call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: City Manager Woods-Richardson.

CITY MANAGER WOODS-RICHARDSON: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: City Attorney Cole.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Here.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: City Attorney Smith.

CITY ATTORNEY SMITH: Here.

MAYOR MESSAM: At this time, let us stand for the Pledge of Allegiance.

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

## **A MOMENT OF SILENCE**

At this time, we will observe a moment of silence. We reserve this portion of our Commission Meeting to observe moments of condolences in our community and obviously with the tragic shootings right here in our County, Parkland Marjory Stoneman Douglas High School where seventeen souls were taken from us. We would like to at this time to observe their memory as well as to remember the survivors and the victims of this tragic event. So if we could stand in observance in honor of those victims. I'll state their names and ages: Alyssa Alhadeff 14, Scott Beigel 35, Martin Aqueano (sp) 14, Nicholas Dworet 17, Aaron Feis 37, Christopher Hixon 49, Luke Hoyer 15, Cara Loughran 14, Gina Montalto 14, Joaquin Oliver 17, Alaina Petty 14, Meadow Pollack 18, Helena Ramsay 17, Alexander Schachter 14, Carmen Schentrup 16, and Peter Wong 15. Thank you.

## **PRESENTATIONS & PROCLAMATIONS**

Presentation: Police Presentation to Miramar Park of Commerce. (Police Chief Dexter Williams)

MAYOR MESSAM: We have one presentation for this evening and that will be

presented by Police Chief Dexter Williams in a Police Presentation to the Miramar Park of Commerce.

POLICE CHIEF WILLIAMS: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners, City Manager, City Staff. Dexter Williams, Chief of Police, City of Miramar. I think this presentation came at a fitting time. We lost a lot, as you just expressed, and there are a lot of others that survived. In the City of Miramar, we have approximately 17,000 students in our schools, different programs and so forth that we go through. There is an organization that has been working with us for years. They allowed us the opportunity to mentor students, they allowed us to give them guidance, hope, and support, give them the belief that they can achieve anything that they want. They allowed us to continue a program through which we have, which we call "Hanging with Five-O". This is program, every summer we have students – we started out with Five-O but it worked and we started out with 50 kids and we are probably up to about almost close to 85 or 90. Throughout the summer we only charge them \$25 for the entire summer and they spend the entire summer with us; they go through different programming, go to different field trips, different educational sites, spend time with the Officers. All the School Resource Officers that we have in the City, that is their primary function during the summer time program. They spend the entire summer with these kids. I would like to call Maridee Bell from the Miramar Park of Commerce to the front please. This lady has been a God send. I'm not sure – she will be here representing Andrea Hinson as well. The Miramar Park of Commerce is one of the major stakeholders in this City as you know. They have continued to fund the programming to which we do at Miramar Police Department, the Hanging with Five-O, the PAL program as well. Miss Maridee Bell was a Board member at one point; she has always supported the PAL program as well. Just recently, for our second year straight, she has spearheaded a program called the Polar Express. If you followed us on social sites and so forth you have seen that we had thousands of toys that we were able to give away to needy families, some of which we have helped our Commission try to fill some of your initiatives that you are out there – this was all at the hand of Miss Maridee Bell. They worked together in the Park of Commerce with all the businesses that were there to collect all these toys for the children in our community and they went out to all of those needy families throughout the holiday season and we were part of that and we are glad for that partnership that she has provided with us for the Police Department for over two decades with these programs, with the Hanging with Five-O, the PAL, and the Polar Express – you know the story. I would like to first have me as the Chief, and all the other Chiefs, come before me, thank you, personally thank you for your hard work and your service and your dedication to partnering with us to keep our kids educated. On behalf of the Miramar Police Department, we love you and we thank you for all that you have done for us. I would like to present you with this. Obviously, this is just a small token. It reads, "Appreciation for your continuous support with the Miramar Police Department's Youth programs." Thank you so much.

MS. MARIDEE BELL: Thank you. First, Commissioners, Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners, thank you so much for this opportunity to say thanks. With the Miramar Park of Commerce, we are so blessed to be able to have opportunities to serve our youth; youth is really the passion that our ownership has and Miramar youth particularly. This latest initiative with the Polar Express came out of a need that was expressed and I truly believe that God directs our hand and the timing was perfect, the opportunity was perfect and we thank the PD for allowing us the privilege of being part of that because we have had 78 tenants in our park participate, up from 60 last year, we are going to keep going, we are going to keep doing it. We are going to keep serving the children in Miramar especially in light of the tragedy that happened. Even without the tragedy that happened, we love the kids and it is a lot of fun. I actually want to present to you the Spirit of Giving Award for our Polar Express, for our PD, for being part – amazing – if you could see any of the video that goes on with what these gentlemen, men and women do getting these gifts out to the children of Miramar, joy, pure joy, pure joy on their faces; it's the best. Thank you very much.

POLICE CHIEF WILLIAMS: And we have one more for Andrew Ansin but we will give that to her and she will relay that him. Thank you very much for your time this evening.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you Chief and thanks to the Miramar Park of Commerce for all of your philanthropic efforts you give to the community.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

MAYOR MESSAM: We are now onto Consent Agenda. Items listed on the Consent Agenda are viewed to be routine and the recommendation will be enacted by one motion in the form listed below. If discussion is desired, the items will be removed from the Consent Agenda and will be considered separately. Anyone wishing to comment on any item on the Consent Agenda should approach the podium at this time. Hearing and seeing none, back to the Commission. If there are any items, if not, I entertain a motion.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Before we record the votes, we won't be able to record on our devices, so there will be a verbal count. We will revert back to the legacy system with our voices. So at this time you can call the roll for votes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Chambers to approve Consent Agenda Items 1, 2, 3, and 4, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

1. Minutes from the Workshop Meeting of September 5, 2017.

**Approved.**

2. Temp. Reso. #R661 approving the **Lease Agreement** with Dell Financial Services LP through the utilization of the State of Florida Contract No. 250-WSCA-10-ACS, for the lease of **166 desktops and 93 laptop computers**, in a total amount not-to-exceed \$327,116 over a three-year period, which includes an amount not-to-exceed \$53,130 for FY 18. (*Information Technology Director Clayton Jenkins*)

**Resolution No. 18-67**

3. Temp. Reso. #R6642 authorizing the acceptance of the Memorandum of Agreement between the City of Miami Fire-Rescue, as the sponsoring agency of the Florida Task Force 2 of **National Urban Search and Rescue (USCAR) Response System**, and the City of Miramar as participating agency of the Task Force. (*Fire-Rescue Chief Robert Palmer*)

**Resolution No. 18-68**

4. Temp. Reso. #R6666 ratifying the **Memorandum of Understanding** and cooperation with **Belize City**. (*Mayor Wayne M. Messam*)

**Resolution No. 18-69**

***End of Consent Agenda***

**RESOLUTIONS**

MAYOR MESSAM: On to resolutions. Item number five, please.

5. Temp. Reso. #R6638 authorizing the **renewal of various insurance coverages** for the City's Non-Benefit / Property and Casualty Insurance Program as part of the City's Comprehensive Risk Management Program, effective April 1, 2018 ("insurance renewals"); approving a projected premium cost of \$2,408,683, not-to-exceed \$2,460,683, including taxes and fees; declaring by four-fifths affirmative vote that applying the City's Competitive Procurement Procedures to the insurance renewals is not in the City's best interest, thereby exempting the insurance renewals from the City's Competitive Procurement requirements; authorizing the Human Resources Director to negotiate lower premium amounts due under the insurance renewals. (*Human Resources Director Melanie McLean*)

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Item number five is a resolution of the City Commission authorizing the **renewal of various insurance coverages** for the City's Non-Benefit / Property and Casualty Insurance Program as part of the City's Comprehensive Risk Management Program, effective April 1, 2018 ("insurance renewals"); approving a projected premium cost of \$2,408,683, not-to-exceed \$2,460,683, including taxes and fees; declaring by four-fifths affirmative vote that applying the City's Competitive Procurement Procedures to the insurance renewals is not in the City's best interest, thereby exempting the insurance renewals from the City's Competitive Procurement requirements; authorizing the Human Resources Director to negotiate lower premium amounts due under the insurance renewals.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening Ms. McLean, you are recognized.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR MCLEAN: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners, City Attorney. The item before you is Temporary Resolution #R6638, which concerns non-benefit insurance renewals for the period April 2018 through March 2019. I am Melanie McLean, Human Resources Director. The issue at hand is that City Commission approval is required for the renewal of non-benefit property and casualty insurance policies for the period April 1, 2018 through March 31, 2019 with a projected premium cost of \$2,408,683 not to exceed \$2,460,683. Some background on this item. In anticipation of the

expiration of the City's insurance policies on March 31, 2018, Arthur J. Gallagher, who is our Risk Insurance Broker Consultant for the City, began marketing for renewal of the City's non-benefit property and casualty insurance program to the Worldwide market in December 2017. The expiring policies for the prior period cost the City \$2,175,976. For policies renewing on April 1, 2018, there is a 7% increase in premium compared to the prior year. The premium increase is due to the City's increased insured values and increased rates in the general insurance markets. The new total premium amount will not exceed \$2,460,683 for the 12-month renewal term. Staff is seeking the Board's authorization to renew the City's property and casualty insurance policies starting on April 1, 2018 and approval is recommended.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. At this time, are there any members from the public that wish to comment on Item number five? Please come to the podium at this time. Seeing none, back to the dais. Are there any questions or comments for staff? If not, I will entertain a motion.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Vice Mayor Barnes, to approve Resolution #R6638, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

MAYOR MESSAM: Item number six.

6. Temp. Reso. #R6657 expressing its disappointment with the alleged ill treatment of persons visiting the **United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement Services (“ICE”)**, including the lack of restroom facilities, lack of shelter from the elements, and lack of adequate areas for sitting and waiting; requesting that ICE provide additional parking, and improve the facility by adding adequate restroom facilities, shelter, and sitting and waiting areas. *(Commissioner Yvette Colbourne)*

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Item number six is a resolution expressing its disappointment with the alleged ill treatment of persons visiting the **United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement Services (“ICE”)**, including the lack of restroom facilities, lack of shelter from the elements, and lack of adequate areas for sitting and waiting; requesting that ICE provide additional parking, and improve the facility by adding adequate restroom facilities, shelter, and sitting and waiting areas.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you Mr. Attorney. This item is being presented by Commissioner Colbourne in response to the various, numerous complaints that the City has received regarding the ICE facility that is located here in the City of Miramar. We still have technical difficulties with the screen but this item is a Resolution moving forward regarding items in response to the treatment of those individuals that are seeking service at the ICE facility. Are there any comments, Commissioner Colbourne?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes, thank you very much, Mr. Mayor. The City received a number of complaints. I personally received a number of complaints as well. One of the complaints came from Attorney Drukin, who complained that there were so many people out there in front of the ICE building and the surrounding area that they had to wait there for many many hours before they were attended and while they were waiting out there, there was nowhere for them to sit, there is no adequate restroom facilities, and there is no adequate parking. Subsequent to that, many cars were being towed. I feel very disappointed to hear of those circumstances. The Resolution is pretty much stating that we are disappointed with the type of treatment and we are asking ICE if they will please address the issues that we are receiving so many complaints for.



MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner Colbourne. I know that many of us on the dais have received several emails or phone calls regarding the situation. The City has been aware of these conditions. In terms of the actual facility being under the jurisdiction above the Federal Government, working with this Federal Agency to ensure that they are providing the appropriate provisions for individuals seeking services at those locations are imperative. At this time, I would like to ask the City Manager to at least give the public just an update in regard to City jurisdiction, some of the actions that we have taken, as well as some of the correspondence that has taken place regarding some of our Congressional delegation in regard to the response to these activities.

CITY MANAGER WOODS-RICHARDSON: This item came to the City's attention as far back as early November and since that time, the City has on numerous occasions, and all parts of the City, have gone out to the site to first of all see the situation and secondly, to make efforts to talk to the persons who are in the building. The building is not owned by the United States Government, it is leased by the Government, but the property owner has responsibilities to the persons who come to that building obviously. We feel that they have neglected their responsibility, that they obviously did not anticipate the number of people who would be visiting the building and so they have not provided for those persons. The conditions are exactly as Commissioner Colbourne explained, literally are horrendous and you do see people, mothers with small babies, and they are there for hours on end. So, to that end, we have attempted to talk to the owner of the building, we have had meetings with the GSA Representative, who is the Federal GSA Representative, who leased the building, we have had conversations with everybody around the building, all of the property owners, the surrounding property owners are definitely concerned to the extent that some of them feel that they will not be able to rent office spaces in the area and that threatens their livelihood. We have had our Federal Lobbyist come and go out again in the field with us to take a look at these circumstances and he has so far reached out to a number of our Federal Representatives. I know Representative Hastings and Congressman Nelson, and we sent letters to Frederica Wilson. We have reached out to literally every office, to every person that we can think of, we are now at the point of simply going after the owner of the building because if the building belonged to anyone else we would do the same thing. So, we are taking every measure that we can to go through the notice process, the violation process. We also noticed that there were some, and we consider illegal towing going on in the area, and our Police did step in and tried to manage that situation. We have had numerous meetings here and as well as their facility trying to engage them and trying to get them to take steps that would make the situation better. As of today, there has – the improvement has been so minimum that it is not even worth mentioning.

MAYOR MESSAM: So, at this time, if there are any members from the public that wish to speak on this Resolution, can come forward to the podium at this time regarding this item. Just for some housekeeping notes, if you could state your

name and your address for the record, it would be appreciated. Good evening ma'am.

JILL RICKEN: Good evening, my name is Jill Ricken, I am an Immigration Attorney, Board Certified Immigration Attorney. My address is 12010 NE 11<sup>th</sup> Court in Biscayne Park in Florida. I thank the Council for addressing this issue and for drafting the proposed Resolution being discussed today. A special thanks to Commissioner Yvette Colbourne for listening to me when I called her and for communicating with me about this issue extensively and for putting it on the agenda today. ICE has no excuse for the inhumane situation it has created at this office. ICE and its parent agency, the Department of Homeland Security, are large Government agencies that routinely handle hundreds of thousands if not millions of in person appointments, interviews, and ceremonies every day without any incidents. ICE and DHS are absolutely capable of figuring out a way to handle these appointments without creating unsafe and inhumane conditions. In my opinion, it is at best negligent, lazy, and inefficient, and at worst, an intentional infliction of distress. I applaud the City Council's efforts thus far to address the situation and I urge the Council to pass this Resolution. We all must prepare for the event that ICE does not comply with this Resolution. I ask the Council, what are the consequences if ICE does not immediately improve conditions. If ICE does not comply I urge the Council to take further measures and to impose actual consequences. I ask the Council to review the City's zoning laws and regulations pertaining to Certificates of Use to determine which laws ICE may be violating and which laws may need to be revised in light of the needs of the City. If ICE disregards the Council's request this Resolution should just be the beginning. Thank you.

MAYOR MESAM: Thank you, thank you ma'am. Good evening.

LAURIE WOODWARD GARCIA: Good evening. My name is Laurie Woodward Garcia, I am a resident of this City, a former business owner, a local activist, and more importantly, I am a mother. As a mom, I teach my child that if you see something say something. I had the opportunity a few weeks ago to go to ICE. Friends of mine had been out there week after week and they put a call out, please come out. So, I just happened to go out and I happened to capture on video a man who pulled into my City and was extorting people for money because he was going to tow their car. The video is on Facebook and as many people that I could, I tagged. That was horrifying but it was a little more than that. The fact that there is no restrooms, the heat. It is a public safety hazard. I saw mothers with small children walking along 145<sup>th</sup>, I had my business son 145<sup>th</sup>; that is a very dangerous road. It is terrifying for me to think of all these cars and immigrants walking because there is no place to park. Now, as a small business owner, I was required to have a \$5,000 handicap accessible water fountain for anybody that came in and my question is, is ICE above the law? Why are they not providing restrooms and shelter from the rain; we have seen the photos. That day I was very horrified

to see what happened with the tow truck drive but since then I have learned of more egregious behavior by staff. We captured video yesterday of a staffer from the ICE building tormenting somebody who was trying to help with translation. This is what we have been able to capture so I can only imagine what it is like for a terrified immigrant coming to our City and walking through there. That's what we have been able to see; it's very terrifying. This City is supposed to be the City of Beauty in Progress. I can tell you for visitors that come here that are immigrants, it is very terrifying. I do not believe our City is helping with the parking situation, the outdoor situation. This is just not tolerable whatsoever. I also witnessed, on two different occasions, I've been back a couple of different times, I witnessed where somebody had been there for hours waiting and then they were told, they showed us the paper, I took a picture of it, that they needed to get over to North Miami and check in with a security company over there. So, my question is why are they processing these people, making them stand for hours on end. The man had gotten there at 4:00, this was 11:00 and he was being told that he had to get over to North Miami Security and I was told they are going to put a tag on him probably for deportation. It is not fair. If you look around, in Pembroke Pines, they have an Immigration facility. I do not see any lines at that facility, in fact the parking lot is quite empty. So, I say to my leaders in Miramar, we are better than this right, we need to lead by example. I understand and I am respectful of the law because believe me I am not happy with 45 and what is happening but I do respect the law. What is happening outside in our streets is dangerous so please take a moment and think about how we can rectify this situation. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Good evening, sir.

FRANCIS L. CONLIN: Good evening. My name is Francis L. Conlin, I live in Key Largo, Florida, and yes, that is a long way. I came to your City tonight with my wife. My wife and I come to your City every week with a small group of people, humanitarian minded people, we stand with the people in the lines, we give out water, coffee, a seat, a shoulder to cry on, that type of thing. So, I am involved as a volunteer with Immigrant rights and I would like to just give you a little history. In early 2017 we started hearing disturbing things that were going on at the ICE Miramar facility. I will do it quickly, but what you've been hearing, long lines with no protection from the elements, men, women and children standing in line for nine+ hours, the absence of any legal or safe parking, and something people have not mentioned is there are people in our community who have lived here for 15-20 years, they have been reporting once a year at the Miramar facility, now they are told to report every three months, many of them, or every month. This huge explosion of people told to report was ICE made. I am wondering when ICE became residents of Miramar if you expected to be into this. Maybe it was even part of Immigration – excuse me, the old Immigration Service prior to 911, I don't even know. We have also had people who reside here peacefully for years, years, and year, they come, they don't come out. Their cars are tagged, maybe six hours they will get a call from an Immigration Center saying either Broward Transition

Center or Krome saying I am in Immigrant prison. I didn't mention earlier, I want to thank you all for the opportunity to come and speak to you and I see you recognize a problem. I would encourage you to follow through with it and even a little bit more, a lot more. So, since early 2017 a small group of have been there at least once a week doing the things I mentioned and everything that I heard, we heard is a concern. Everything you have heard is a concern, this is absolutely 100% true. I hope you all saw the video that Laurie happened to capture; that is just a token example of the total disrespect for humanity that these human beings go through out there. I want to wind this up real quickly, but I want you to know, I think your City is beautiful. This Commission is welcoming, you allowed me to come from two counties away to speak to you, but working with Immigrants, I want you to know that the name of your City, Miramar, is a bad word. They hear Miramar, they think that facility.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir. Thank you. Good evening, sir. Welcome.

THOMAS KENNEDY: Hi, my name is Thomas Kennedy. I live at 2398 Coral Way, Apartment #3, Miami, Florida 33145. I am the Deputy Political Director of the Florida Immigrant Coalition. We are one of the organizations that have been supporting the people that are coming here on a weekly basis to support the people that are doing the checking of the Miramar facility. Just as has been described, conditions there are deplorable, I mean, you are talking about mothers and children standing for hours under the hot sun, exposed to the elements, there is no adequate bathroom access, there is no water, I mean it is Miami, it is really hot. You know, they are victims of illegal towing where there is no adequate parking so they park on the sidewalk and a person comes and tows them and extorts them for cash to drop their cars or their car gets towed. The people are going there to pass out information and help them out with some water are victims of threatening encounters with the officials from the facility who are basically demanding to see papers and are threatening to check for warrants. I mean, it is disgraceful really that in this country this is happening but this is the reality that we live in now. I want to thank this Commission because just like Bud said, you guys are extremely welcoming and I am so grateful to you all for highlighting this issue and standing up against it. I will ask – this is just a first step because it really needs to be addressed. There needs to be a change because it is true, a lot of people in the Immigrant community, when they think of Miramar right now, they are thinking of that ICE check in facility. It has become infamous, you know, it has made grounds nationally. National organizations are talking about this facility because what is going on there is just so bad. So, you know, again, I commend this Commission for taking the necessary first steps to addressing the problem but things really really need to change. They need to change before something bad happens, before someone has a heat stroke, before someone gets hurt. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir.

THOMAS KENNEDY: Is it okay if I do translation?

MAYOR MESSAM: Sure.

MAURO KENNEDY: Thank you. My name is Mauro Kennedy; I am Thomas' father.

MAYOR MESSAM: Address please?

MAURO KENNEDY: 1351 NE 191<sup>st</sup> Street, North Miami Beach, Florida 33179. I was living in the country for the last 18 years. I was 60 years undocumented. I was able to buy my house, to own my company, I am a construction contractor, and I can be one of the people that are in the line every day for nine hours with children in line. In my position of construction contractor, I want to bring attention to several violations today of the South Florida Building Code at the Federal facility. The lack of restrooms, the lack of parking spots, for the amount of people coming every day it is really ashamed that the Department of Construction is not going every day to check on the violations that seem to be happening in a Federal facility that has all the means and manage to fix that situation. Also, the disrespect and the harassment that the people suffer every day is unbelievable; from the towing companies, from the ICE officials coming out to check if somebody is getting a bottle of water from volunteers. Thank you for the opportunity. We really need to bring attention to this problem because it is really a shame. Thank you, sir.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir. Good evening, welcome.

JACQUELINE LOPEZ: Good evening, my nombre is Jacqueline Lopez. (Ms. Lopez read a letter in Spanish and Ms. Ramirez translated the letter in English which is below).

MARIA ANGELICA RAMIREZ: I will be interpreting for her. My name is Jacqueline Lopez and I have been living here for 15 years in this beautiful state of the sun. My home is Broward and my City is Miramar. Florida is a state where most people are migrant workers. Regardless of our status, we are part of the economic development, we work, we give, and we pay our taxes in this state. The Miramar Center has become the maximum example of the violation of the rights and human dignity of Immigrants that show up yearly to abide by the law. Every day hundreds of Immigrants make lines for more than nine hours under the sun, the rain, in the heat, in the cold, and they have no refuge or shelter. There is no bathrooms available and there is no water. There is no public parking and every day there are dramatic scenes where the mistreatment reigns and tow trucks take advantage of our people and perform extortion trying to take their money. The Immigration Miramar building of ICE is not above the law and as a public facility, it has to abide by the norms and have the basic services available for people who daily go to their facilities. That is why I am here, to ask you please, as authorities, to put a stop to

this abuse, intolerance, ruthlessness, and indifference. Florida is the state of the sun and now it is becoming dimmer before so much abuse and injustice. These types of situations are filling our communities with fear. Miramar has always made a difference as a City that respects the dignity of Immigrants and makes them feel welcome. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Good evening, welcome.

LAURA: Thank you for this moment. My name is Laura, the Field Organizer for National Latina Institute for Recruitment. I am working in Homestead and other areas in Miami for Immigrants. (She addressed the Commission in Spanish)

MAYOR MESSAM: Can you state your address?

LAURA: She continued to address the Commission in Spanish. (Ms. Lopez read a letter in Spanish and Ms. Ramirez translated the letter in English which is below).

MARIA ANGELICA RAMIREZ: Thank you for this opportunity. I am here because I behold women who have appointments at the Center and they are afraid of showing up and not only do they have to deal with this fear but also for the fear of bringing their children to their appointments without childcare and having to arrive at their appointments at 3:00 a.m. and having their appointments be at 11:00 a.m.

LAURA: She continued to address the Commission in Spanish. (Ms. Lopez read a letter in Spanish and Ms. Ramirez translated the letter in English which is below).

MARIA ANGELICA RAMIREZ: So, these women, as they come with their families, they see there is no parking available, and from the week before it started happening, but now there is a sign that says, "No Parking" and there are tow trucks around that say if the person doesn't move their car quickly enough that either they pay those \$50 and \$60 or they will tow their cars away.

LAURA: She continued to address the Commission in Spanish. (Ms. Lopez read a letter in Spanish and Ms. Ramirez translated the letter in English which is below).

MARIA ANGELICA RAMIREZ: It is in incredible that we have the hope that Miramar will stop this from happening. We see lines happening where people are separated as if it was the Nazi times. They have lines for Haitians, lines for Cubans, lines for Hondurans, lines for Salvadorians; it is incredible to see in this time of day this is happening again as if it was 50 or 60 years ago. We cannot allow it to happen again.

LAURA: Thank you so much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you.

MARIA ANGELICA RAMIREZ: And I will stay here. My name is Maria Angelica Ramirez. I reside at 5180 NW 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Apartment #602, Miami, Florida. I want to echo everything that has been said here today. As you may know, the conditions are deplorable and I really appreciate this Commission's efforts in trying to find a solution for it and addressing them with the building owner. I really want to commend you to find a solution for it even if the systematic solution doesn't come quickly enough. Tomorrow there is going to be people standing there and they are going to be thirsty, they are going to need to use the restroom, and there are solutions for that. There can be a porta-potty as a temporary solution, there can be water bottles being given to folks. These are just a few ideas that I believe we can implement so that we could put human dignity above any systematic delays. Thank you so much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you.

PAOLA: Hello Commissioners and Mayor. My name is Paola, I reside at 12372 SW 52<sup>nd</sup> Place, Pembroke Pines, Florida. So, I have been with my fellow activists out in Miramar, not as much as them, they have been here for nine months every Wednesday or at least once a week making sure that the conditions for people, Immigrants, that are going to check in are safe. These are people that are going to do their check ins to try to avoid deportations and try to avoid separations from their families. Already it is a traumatic experience because you don't know if you are going to be able to get out of there, right. You don't know if you are going to get deported; family members are waiting anxiously to hear; get back to their loves ones. Imagine that anxiety plus having to have your kids out in the hot sun. We have had ambulances pick people up because of how hot it gets. There is no water, no bathrooms, I mean, my colleagues mentioned it very well in the descriptions of the facility and I know some of you have been there and have seen how terrible these conditions are. What we are asking is for this to be a first step and for this not to be forgotten. It is not just a Resolution that stays in the air; the pressure needs to keep going if there is no changes because right now people are suffering. Family separations are happening and I know that Miramar has always been a City that welcomes Immigrants. I mean, most of the Commission or all of the Commission, I believe, are Immigrants. I just want you all to keep doing what you are doing because I thank you, that you all are even bringing this up as much as you can and as much as your power allows you to but to keep pushing. We are all routing for that and we are all going to stay also to make sure that happens. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Good evening, ma'am.

SHANNON ANTWON: Good evening. My name is Shannon Antwon. I live at 14103 SW 52<sup>nd</sup> Street, Miramar, Florida. I am a Haitian Immigrant and community organizer here in Broward County. I am here today to ask the City of Miramar to improve the conditions at the ICE office, the local ICE office. This is not the first

time that I've attended a Commission meeting along with other activists for a similar issue. The meeting I am referencing where we had to pack the same room with dozens of people and beg the City of Miramar to hire at least one Creole speaking social worker in their Social Services Department, something that should not have been an issue in a City where the Immigrant population is so large. So, when I heard about what has been happening at the local ICE office I was disappointed to hear that not much has changed in the way that Immigrants are treated in Miramar and it upsets me that we have to pack this room yet again and demand that the City of Miramar treat its Immigrants with dignity. The conditions at the ICE facility are horrendous as you have heard from other activists here. The Immigrants have been harassed outside the office, they are forced to stand in long lines for hours in the hot sun, there is hardly any access to restrooms, parking, or even waiting or sitting areas. In the past, I also heard each of the Commissioners of Miramar express their support for Immigrant communities. In reality, there is a long way to go for that support to be actualized and for it to look the way you all say you support Immigrants. All we are asking is to be respected as human beings that matter and that is what this Resolution is about. It is already dehumanizing to have to report for check ins at an ICE office where you are subject to deportation and I think that the conditions at the facility only add injury to insult. So, we just want to see the City of Miramar and the Commissioners practice what you preach. If Miramar is truly to be a home for Immigrants then this Resolution should pass unanimously and it should pass without debate. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Housekeeping rules, in terms if you support an item, feel free to waive your hands if you show your support and if you don't you can point down just so we can go through the meeting. Thanks so much for your cooperation. Good evening, ma'am.

LADA MUNOS: Good evening, my name is Lada Munos, my address is 8710 SW 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, 33025. I am here to speak on this issue because it is very important to me. As an Immigrant, as a woman, as somebody who grew up in this beautiful beautiful community and also as the Executive Director of a local organization. She is 23 and what they are trying to as a very young organization, is to work in the community to make sure that women, especially Immigrant women, are not subject to any form of gender base violence and what is really sad is that this is a form of gender form abuse. Women have to come with their kids, right, early in the morning, in the hot, and it is just incredible that this is happening in a community that we call home, in a community with a leadership that really supports Immigrants. Definitely, we thank you so much for putting this on the agenda and for making a Resolution. We ask you that you really really look at this as a basic human right and that you do everything in your power, we each have so much power and I know that you have so much power, so please don't stop here, please keep working, please keep working to make sure that our Immigrants and our neighbors and our community have the basic dignities that they deserve. Thank you for this first step and we will continue fighting to make sure our community is



covered and we ask you to do the same. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you so much. Good evening, how are you?

ATTORNEY STEPHANIE PARCHMENT: Good evening, my name is Attorney Stephanie Parchment. I am in the owner of Defense Law Immigration Associates in Plantation, Florida; however, I did grow up in Miramar and I graduated from Miramar High School so this is an issue that is very dear to my heart. As a practitioner and Immigration Attorney, I am often at the Immigration office in Miramar. There is just two points that I want to make not to belabor everything that everyone has already said. First and foremost, many of the Officers that are at the facility dividing the lines and telling people where to go and what they can and cannot do, that is a separately contracted company. I'm sure if the Commission was aware of that so the security guards that are at the facility that are separate from the actual ICE Officers is a separately contracted company. So, if there is a way to hold that company accountable for the human rights violations and the indignity and the way that they are treating the people that are coming to report and comply with the law by showing up. If there is a way to hold them accountable as a company for their human rights violations I would ask the Commission to look into that. Secondly, with the pending expiration of TPS we can only expect this issue to become a growing problem so the sooner measures could be implemented to address the issues that are happening now before the problem gets worse is something that I just wanted to bring the floor front of your minds because the expiration of the TPS is quickly approaching and so we would expect that many of our community members that are on TPS will have their status expire soon and might become subject to having to report to ICE in the near future. So, I just wanted to bring that to your attention in addition to everything else that everyone else has said. I thank you for your time and your attention to this matter.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you so much, ma'am.

SHIRLEY LEFLUER: Good evening, my name is Shirley LeFluer, and I am with the Office of Congresswoman Frederica Wilson. Our office address is 18425 NW 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue, Suite #355. Before I give my bullet points I just want to address two issues that I did hear. I am the Immigration Specialist at the Congresswoman's office. You know she is a fighter for Immigrants, I mean, we have had stories where a gentleman was going to be deported leaving 12 of his children; she stopped the deportation. So, we are advocates for Immigrants. The office in Pembroke Pines is Border Patrol, it is not Immigration Custom Enforcement so it is two types of different enforcements that is being done and the type of clients that come into report is different; that is why you see more at ICE than Border Patrol. The reason why we are having more reporting is because we have a new Administration. With our past Administration, individuals only had to report once a year, now it is more frequently, more previously, and bringing more supporting documents. So, I just wanted to bring that issue up. It saddened me because I

am the Immigration Specialist in our office and we see between nine and 20 Immigration cases a day and our clients or our constituents never complain. It is until we got the correspondence from the Mayor and Councilwoman Colbourne; that's when it was brought to our attention, that's when it was brought to Alcee Hastings' office as well as U.S. Senator Nelson's office. We are doing a correspondent to ICE, we are working on a dual letter together in the Senate and in the House addressing this issue with ICE. We are also conducting a site visit on Friday at 1:00 at the site. If anyone wants to come and meet us there they can; it is at 1:00 this Friday at the ICE office in Miramar. At site visit we have to make sure that we see the situation. We have seen videos, we have seen pictures, but we also want to say that we have been there and we see the situation firsthand from the member of Congress. It is sad that at this point of time that we have to address this issue in the City of Miramar. I am a resident of Miramar so when I heard this issue I said we have to get on top of it to see what's going on. I am so amazed because my daughter goes to school in Pembroke Pines but I have to take 145<sup>th</sup> and I've seen the line and I thought they were just giving away something and it was until we got the correspondence to tell us what was going on; that this situation is happening in Miramar. We are addressing the issue on the Federal level; it was just brought to our attention last week so we are addressing it. Alcee Hasting is the Representative of Miramar but because we are a big advocate of Immigrants we are working together with Alcee Hasting and Senator Nelson's office to address that issue. So, if someone from your office wants to meet us there so we can address it and once we meet with ICE to see what we can do to resolve this issue we can. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you so much and thanks for responding to our call. Good evening, sir. How are you?

JUNIOR MENTO: Good evening. My name is Junior Mento, I am an Attorney and my office is at 15800 Pines Boulevard, Pembroke Pines, Florida 33027. The reason why I came here in the first place is to support the Resolution but also to give you a firsthand account of what treatment I, as an Attorney representing a client at this facility, has been the subject. I was detained because my client was so frightened by the behavior of the Officers inside the facility that he was carrying his child and just ran away. They detained me because they said that I was in cahoots with him, he did it because I instructed him, defamation per say, to just run. So, it's really bad. Everything they are telling you is true. I'm not going to go down the list of all the violations but as a City Council, you must send a very strong message to ICE that human dignity matters and human rights matters. From what I've seen and what I've been the subject of and I am an Attorney, I am a practicing Attorney, and they treat me like I cannot even say. It's almost like the Gestapo, it's almost like one of them actually went to my client and told him he didn't need an Attorney, why are paying him, right in front of me. I was right there so I didn't make a lot of noise about it even though I tried to complain to a supervisor because I represent other people there. I did not want to be blackballed and I did not want

my clients to suffer the consequences so I didn't say anything; I didn't do anything until today. There must be a strong message sent and also there must be a fact-finding mission there, if I may call it so, because I saw a gentleman, I think he was from Costa Rica, suffering from heat exhaustion and they had to call the EMS. The situation is really bad and people of good conscious have to speak out. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you so much, sir. Good evening. How are you?

SAMAN MOVASSAGHI: Good evening. How are you? Good, thank you. My name is Saman Movassaghi, I am an Immigration Attorney, my address is 2750 SW 145<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Miramar, Florida 33027. As I just told you, my office is literally right across the street from Immigration and I go there very frequently with my clients. Let me tell you, the culture inside of the ICE facility is worse than the culture outside of the ICE facility. First of all, if you ever go inside, there is only one bathroom for a man and one bathroom for a woman, that's it. You are sat in rows of chairs facing each other, you are not allowed to talk at all. I, myself, when I go with my client, have been demoralized, screamed at, yelled at, belittled for the actions of what my client has done. So, it's a culture that goes on inside of the facility as well as outside of the facility, where quite frankly, they just don't care. I just want to bring this to your attention, I also go – every day when I go to work I see the line outside, I go inside with my clients. Sometimes you are there at 4:00 or 4:30 in the morning just standing there and waiting. I can echo everything that has been said but I think you guys get the picture of what has been going on. I just want to bring to your attention what happens inside is just as worse than what happens outside. I know you guys don't have control over that but just so you understand the type of culture that is going on in ICE right now. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Good evening.

M. CHAVEZ: Good evening. My name is (inaudible) Chavez. I am a community organizer with United We Dream, which is a group led national and immigrant organization. I live in 6223 SW 131<sup>st</sup> Court, Apartment #103. As folks have said, in early 2017, we began hearing and receiving accounts from a Miramar reporting facility. The concerns have been the same since back in May when activists and community members started to take action every single week. The lines are extremely long with no adequate bathrooms, no water, no parking spaces. As folks have said, I am grateful that you are taking our concerns into account and you are talking about raising your voices but I am here to demand action and I am here to demand a permanent solution because ICE should not be above the law. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Good evening.

CATHY BYRD: Good evening. My name is Cathy Byrd and I work with the Service

Employer's National Union. Our office is located right here in the beautiful City of Miramar at 2881 Corporate Way. I want to thank the City Commission so much for bringing up this topic. I don't want to repeat the things that have been said here but ICE agents and this facility are acting as if they are above the law; they are acting above our Police. They are forgetting completely that they are working there with our tax dollars and they are supposed to be serving our community. People who are going there are not going there for services, they are going there because they have to go there because if they don't go there, ICE is going to be knocking on their door and they are going to be pulling them and sticking them in a deportation van in front of their kids. So, what is happening there is horrible. I understand that Commissioner Riggs was there yesterday. Thank you so much for going and seeing with your own eyes what's happening on the ground. I understand that in front of you they screamed at one of our fellow organizers who was just simply trying to interpret for someone who needed a multi-lingual Spanish speaker that needed help with translation. So, they really are just acting with absolute no regard for human beings. I don't know if people notice but there is a very large gate next to where the entryway is; that is for busses and that is for vans. Those places are getting filled up with human beings. They are getting shipped to a private for-profit Immigration Detention Center called the Broward Transitional Center, it is being run by the Geo Group right here in Pompano Beach and they are making money by incarcerating our families one by one. For every day they are incarcerated they make more money. We need to stop being complicit in this business; we need to do action; we need to do more. It is not enough to be disappointed, we need to kick them out of Miramar just like the people in Pembroke Pines and Southwest Ranches kicked out Corrections Corporation of America that wanted to build an Immigration Detention Center there, we need to kick ICE out, they don't deserve to be here. This is a community of Immigrants. Our members were healthcare workers, nursing home workers, nurses; they live here. Many of them have TPS and they are waiting every day that is going to go by that their TPS is not going to be renewed. We need to take action; it has got to be more than a Resolution. Thank you very much for your time.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

ELENA MUNOZ: Good evening. My name is Elena Munoz. I live in 9725 NW 52<sup>nd</sup> Street, Apartment #310, in Doral, Florida. I thank you for letting us express – I just want to add a couple of things. These people are coming to Miramar and not there for the fun of it. They have been asked to report every so often and people come as far away as Port St. Lucie, Fort Meyers, very far away, they have to leave their house very early, pay transportation, Uber or whatever, when they get there very early like 4:00 in the morning so they can get out early, they don't go in until 10:00 or 11:00. By that time, they need a bathroom, they need water and all that. That's why we have been going every Wednesday with a group of people and volunteers and those guards, the ones that are paid by the contractor, are not the worst. The ICE people, those guards are even worse. They come to us, they not

only harass the Immigrants, they harass us that go there, they don't allow us to cross the street because they say that sidewalk is private, it belongs to ICE, which I don't think is true, I think the sidewalks are public. Every time they would push us back for trying to get some water or helping a woman come and sit a little bit with her baby because they have been holding a baby since 4:00 in the morning until late. I just need to know if we are allowed or not allowed to approach and give them some water or something to help, if it is an umbrella when it is raining or whatever the case is. Thank you so much for listening.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you so much. I would like to commend the public for coming out to voice your concerns. So, before we take the vote up, I just want to thank Congresswoman Frederica Wilson's office for coming tonight to give us additional information. You have heard from our City Manager, as well as in terms of Miramar is with the community and stands with this and despite that facility is not under the jurisdiction of Miramar, we are not sitting back and going to ideally watch this take place. We will do everything within our power to improve those conditions. In addition, before allowing members of the Commission to give some comments to this item, I would like to share with the community that my office will be holding, actually next Saturday, March 3, 2018 with the Haitian American Noise Association, a Temporary Status Information session and we are encouraging individuals to bring your complete file for a consultation and for those who are Creole speaking, we will have Creole speaking attorneys there as well that will be there to assist you with your file and to address the situation. I have had this item as a report later in the Commission meeting but since there are so many people here on this topic – it will be held at the Miramar Multi-Service Complex at 6700 Miramar Parkway, from 9:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. on March 3, 2018. A couple of comments regarding some of the comments that came forward and what I take to heart. Miramar is a community of Immigrants and despite that facility is here in our City and doing just unconscionable things in regard to Immigration enforcement, it does not reflect our community; that is not who Miramar is. We stand with you and the community to do everything possible. We are working with our Congressional Delegation to get them involved because our U.S. Congress people and U.S. Senators, the Department of Homeland Security is under their jurisdiction, they represent us. We will work with them to get those issues resolved. We are just glad to have the support of Alcee Hasting's office, Frederica Wilson's office, and our office also reached out to Debbie Wasserman-Schultz's office as well, so that our entire South Florida Delegation will be on this issue to resolve the issues that we can't because it is a Federal issue. If anyone at this moment has any other comments, once everyone has an opportunity to speak, I will entertain a motion for adoption of the Resolution. Vice Mayor Barnes, you are recognized.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Very quickly. Today I shed a lot of tears watching young people demonstrating across Broward County and the malicious inhumanity of Legislators in Tallahassee. I did not know that I would come here tonight and shed more tears. I will tell you why it is important that you have come tonight. You need

to send off messages. I think what is sad is that one begins to suspect an insidiousness about what is happening in Miramar. As has been said by a number of people, this is a City with a lot of Immigrants. Are we being penalized? I almost had a building at 79<sup>th</sup> Street in Miami Dade County and that is where some of us took care of our Immigration documents. Believe it or not, that was the practice field for what is happening here. There was these long lines that you had to go down at 5:00 in the morning, you were herded into a building like animals, you were disrespected by the Inspectors once you got into the building. I have few political ambitions so I'm going to say this, an atmosphere and environment has been created in this country from Washington D.C. down to where we live that some people assume they have been given license to abuse us the way that we have been abused in Miramar over the last year and a half. I suggest to you that there should be no doubt in any of your minds that this Resolution is going to be passed unanimously; have no doubt in your mind about that. As has been said, most of here are Immigrants. What has happened is going to continue; it is the attitude of the Administration in Washington and there are people who support that attitude. So, we are going to continue to be treated thusly. I urge you to hold on to your faith, hold on to your beliefs, and if there is anything – and I think you also need to understand, the Federal Government could care less about the City of Miramar, especially as that Administration is concerned, we are a mere non-entity. That should not; however, prevent us from having our voices heard and that is what we are going to do tonight.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you Vice Mayor. Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you very much. I wanted to just thank everyone for coming out – who have come out and spoke on the issue or you are sitting out in the audience listening. I truly appreciate you bringing this information to us and your experience with us so that we can even more be sensitized to the issue. I don't know that we needed much more because each and every one of us received some form of complaint from you and as such, we followed up. The City Administration followed up with us and I know, on an individual basis, I contacted Congresswomen or Congressmen, Senators, because I realized this was much bigger than us here in the City of Miramar. I didn't want to just hand it over to them and I am so happy that at least one of them were able to show up today from the Congresswoman's office. I did hear back from them – from the others as well, acknowledging that they did receive the complaint and that they are looking into it as well. That is why I have this Resolution on tonight so that we can have a united voice as a Commission so that our Federal Government will know that it is not just one of us asking, it is all of us here in the City of Miramar that are asking to please address those issues. I say to all of you that although it is something beyond our control, we will continue to find ways to deal with the situation and to make the conditions better for you. I know some of you cannot fully understand everything so since I do speak Spanish I just want to say a few words. (Commissioner Colbourne addressed the Public in Spanish).

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Commissioner Chambers, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Let me say, I want to thank all of you for coming here tonight. Thank you for standing up for yourself, thank you for standing up for your fellow mankind, and thank you for standing up for all of the Immigrants in this country. My mother was undocumented for ten years in this country 40 years ago and she went through a lot of struggle to get sorted out to when she could be able to brought us here. I grew up in Carol City for many years. As a young fellow. I remember it was difficult to come to this City of Miramar not wanting to get stopped by an officer at the time here and I went around and ended up moving to Pembroke Pines. When I moved to Miramar ten years ago my only regret was not moving to this City earlier. This City is very welcoming, very diverse, a great group of people live here, I really love this City and I am proud to be serving. Now, let me say what is going on in this country, as my Grandmother would say, this drain is very dirty at the top, so what you are going to get at the bottom is also dirty water. With the Administration we have in Washington, D.C., that is why we are experiencing a lot of this hardship at the ICE Center around the country, even on Greyhound Bus, people have been pulled off the bus, train station. So, the only bad thing is we are just in our first year, we got three more years to go before the next election. I hope our citizens will show up and let their vote be counted at poll. Once again, thank you for coming and we are going to stand with you and stand with all our Immigrants. Thank you very much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you Commissioner. Commissioner Riggs, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Thank you, Mayor. Not to be redundant, but I want to say thank you to everyone for coming out and voicing your concerns; that is the right thing to do and you have done it so elegantly so, thank you for doing that. Also, thank you for noticing and knowing and seeing that Miramar is a City who loves and supports Immigrants; that is the absolute truth. We will and are doing everything we can to make things better. The Resolution is a great way – the Congressional Delegation route is a great way to go about this. One thing I want to add to the Resolution that I saw myself is that we need to reduce the amount of time that individuals are waiting in line. It is ridiculous to get there at 4:00 in the morning, they are supposed to open at 7:30, nobody comes out until after 9:00 and folks are there until 4:00 and 5:00 in the afternoon. That is absolutely ridiculous. So, if we could add that to the Resolution that would be great. That is something that needs to be addressed. In addition to that, I understand that this is a Federal matter for the most part but I guess this is a question for our City Attorney and maybe our Police Chief. Until we see some changes, is there any way we can put our presence there? What can we do about that? I know it is not a typical every day question but I feel a need for that. If we have our Police presence there maybe there will be better behavior, maybe folks will be treated better if we are there present.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: We will look into the issue to see and there are jurisdictional questions we have to be careful about but we will look into it and see if we can.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: So that's why I'm asking. Right, I would imagine if we are present there I'm pretty sure the behavior will be under control, that folks will not be mistreated, at least not physically. I have even heard some alleged stories about folks being physically abused. Hopefully that really did not happen. I am hoping with our presence. Even with the cars being towed, what can we do about the cars being towed? Can we put something together where cars cannot be towed until our staff is there or somebody gets there to make sure that folks are not being asked for money in order to give you back your car? That's really what is happening and that's on video, where folks are being asked for money for their car not to be towed. That's not the way we operate. So, what can we do about that aspect? Because some of it, I feel is under our control, and others we have to wait for the action to be taken from ICE.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: If there is a consensus on the Commission, we can look into doing a towing ordinance. Some Cities have implemented various ones. I don't believe we have one; I can check. But if there is a consensus – if we don't have one we could go and look into it. There are certain regulations we are allowed to have on towing companies. Various other Cities to the north of us have had significant issues with towing companies and their behavior, especially at places like Sawgrass Mills Mall and things like that and we can look at what some of those Cities have done. I would be happy to do that if there is a consensus.

MAYOR MESSAM: Do we have consensus on the support.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes, we do. Excellent.

MAYOR MESSAM: And also Commissioner Riggs, I do know that our Police Department is actively enforcing illegal towing activities. We are doing that right now. I think with the addition of strengthened or stronger towing ordinances could perhaps assist in that vision as well.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: In addition to that, I want us to be there physically so that our family and friends are not mistreated. I believe if our presence is there that will not happen while we wait for some changes to take place.

MAYOR MESSAM: I think, if I'm correct, to the City Attorney to look at the jurisdictional issues and if there is anything that we can do within our power, we can do it.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Thank you again for everyone coming out and please remember that we will do everything in our power. Thank you, Mayor.



MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes, Mr. Mayor. I do want to add that it has been brought to my attention that there is a vacant lot across from the building that could be possible be used for parking but I think perhaps the owner needs to be contacted, I don't know if he needs assistance with getting the area – getting the grass cut or what kind of arrangements can be made. But there is a vacant lot and if something can be worked out, if the City can facilitate that so we can assist so there will be parking there for residents so that their cars won't have to be towed. That's it. Do I make a motion?

MAYOR MESSAM: I don't think there is an issue with us contacting and identifying who the private owner is.

CITY MANAGER WOODS-RICHARDSON: There is not an issue with us contacting him, in fact, we have been in discussion with him about the use of that same lot. It is surrounded by a gate, but of course the guards are there, but we have suggested to them previously that is an adequate place to at least let the employees park. They rejected that idea but we will approach them again.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I know the – it was said to me that the owner of the lot was willing so if there is any way, if the folks that are visiting the building could park over there.

CITY MANAGER WOODS-RICHARDSON: That was an initial response that they were willing but I think something has changed and I'm not sure why it changed. Maybe through some discussion – there might be construction coming to that lot. We will approach them again.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Alright. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are we ready to pass the motion?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Riggs, to approve Temporary Resolution #R6657, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

## **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (7:30 – 8:00 P.M.)**

MAYOR MESSAM: This is the third Wednesday of the month where we do have Public Participation. Many of you who I see on the list have already spoken on the Immigration item so I will only be calling those individuals who are on the list and requested to speak on other items. Public Participation is time-certain, which is at 7:30 p.m. Obviously, we are about an hour behind so we will go directly into that Public Participation portion of our program. First, we will have Pastor Art Jackson.

PASTOR ART JACKSON: Good evening Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commission, Commissioners, City Attorneys, Clerks. My name is Arthur Jackson, III. I Pastor the Antioch Baptist Church in Miami Gardens just south of Miramar. I am here tonight representing the thousands of members we have who are residents of the City of Miramar. Antioch is a congregation of a little over 7,500 members and the overwhelming majority of those members are spread between Miami Gardens and Miramar. I am here speaking on the Other Business, Item #9, the Commissioners, the City Manager's Evaluation and Salary Adjustment. I am here tonight advocating for her salary increase. Very quickly I want to make this three-points if I could, I know that time is of the essence. #1. I am advocating for her because the overall state of the City of Miramar – Miramar is doing phenomenal things. I know this to be true for many of you who have come to my pulpit, you have stated

how well the City is doing. That being the case, I am of the opinion that we can't separate the success of the City from the entire leadership of the City, the Mayors, the Commissioners, City Attorneys, all of you. #1, I believe this is an order given how well the City itself is doing. Secondly, I believe that it is justifiable to increase her salary because, to my understanding, there has not been an increase since she has had the position, not a cost of living increase, not a salary adjustment increase, and in the real sense, if you consider the cost of living, she is making less now than when she first assumed the position. Last but not least, and I think Commissioner Chambers, you kind of alluded to it a few moments ago when you were talking about the leadership in the Washington, D.C., living in a time in which we are having leaders, some with misguided morals. Our City Manager, your City Manager, our City Manager, has an unblemished record. She is an award-winning Administrator, there is no deviation between her lips and her lifestyle, that what she says she means, she has proven herself to be a person of integrity, and even if we disagree with her on an issue, all of us can agree that she has an unwavering integrity. Her walk is unblemished, her work is unblemished, so I believe in summary, when we consider those three factors, the overall state of the City, her not having a cost of increase and her integrity, I believe that it is worth it. Thank you so much for your time.

MAYOR MESSAM: Glenn Rice.

GLENN RICE: Glenn Rice, 4605 SW 125<sup>th</sup> Avenue. I am going to give the alternative to what the Pastor just did. I am going to hope that you will, tonight, on giving the City Manager her pay increase – I'm going to cite what I have cited before; ethic insensitivity towards the Haitians and Asians has been documented. Racial insensitivity towards people of color in the Miramar Fire Department, I think it still stands at 16 people of color out of 160. I think you have one firefighter that is a female and is a person with color. That just happened in the last few months.

MAYOR MESSAM: I ask that there be conversations through the Chair and no comments from either staff, public, and I would ask that public commenters, if you just direct your comments to the Chair. Thank you.

GLENN RICE: The recent article that came out in the Sun Sentinel that was done by a consultant for you showed that Miramar is not minority business friendly, figures don't lie. Critical evaluations by Commissioner Riggs and Colbourne. Recently it was discovered that she had hired an Assistant City Manager without completing a thorough background check; I say thorough, not something like through the computer data that says his license is good. I think if they would have done that properly they would have found out that it would have shown that this individual had a sexual harassment complaint and was investigated; the EOC is pending. This is all public record; this is not hearsay. On top of that, they have hired a consultant to consult the Manager on how to be a City Manager. So, those are the issues I bring forward tonight. I understand she is a woman of integrity and

all that, that's fine, but these are just a few of the examples that continue to go on. I forgot to mention the Amphitheater, which is your legacy, Mayor. It is on financial life support; that was based on financials that were given out last week and by CPA's that even looked at it. So, this is under the guidance and direction of the City Manager. And that's what I have to say. I hope you consider that when you consider whether to give her a raise or not tonight. That's all I have to say.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir. Dakar Eubanks.

DAKAR EUBANKS: Good evening everyone. My name is Dakar Alexander Eubanks. I reside at 11653 SW 15<sup>th</sup> Place, Miramar, Florida. I first want to thank Commissioner Darline Riggs for inviting me. I just turned 21 and she invited me to speak. I also want to thank Yvette Colbourne, Commissioner, for inviting me to speak today. I support the Resolution to reduce gun violence. As a student at Broward College, I believe that the community needs to bring the guns down and bring the grade scores up. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir, for your comment. Alexandra Davis.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Mr. Mayor, could I ask that you bring Item #10 up after Public Speaking. I think you have some other speakers that are specific to that item.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay. Without objection from the Commission. May I ask for a quick break before.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

ALEXANDRA DAVIS: Good evening, Mayor, Commission. Alexandra Davis, 3149 SW 133<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Miramar, Florida. I stand with the students, teachers, Administrators, and parents of Marjorie Stone Douglas High School. As an educator, I am very much in tune with what goes on during the school day with drills, etc. and it is sad to see that this tragic event actually took place in our County. I stand with the Never Again movement. I want to talk about another issue that has thrust many communities into the national spotlight. This is a show of Police involved shootings caught on camera. As a Commissioner for four years, following the events of Ferguson and other such events, I asked for a study on Police body cams. It is through a PILOT program. To my horror, I found out that we didn't even have dash cams in our vehicles. Fast forward to today, we still do not have body cams or dash cams even though there was Federal funding available in the past. When I have asked about it the response that is given is that we don't get many complaints. But just this week I spoke to a resident who said they went to complain at the Miramar Police Department and there was no form given to them

in which they could write their complaint, instead they got a Supervisor who simply apologized and there was no record of her complaint. As an Immigrant community, many I have talked to today, many are afraid to go to Police Departments to file a complaint, they feel repercussions. Let's not fool ourselves with all this in Miramar. Just recently, I spoke to a young doctor who complained of being racially profiled right outside of Walmart on University Drive and he, himself, didn't want to complain because he didn't think it would make a difference. Leverage uses funding. Well, I have a few ideas on how we can cut the fat in our spending in City Hall and I am willing to have a conversation. What we need to do right by our residents and visitors in the City of Miramar is the spirit of transparency and accountability to build trust and credibility between our Law Enforcement and our community. I do hope at this time that the Commission will consider this study that was supposed to be done over four years ago, I'm not sure if it was done, but I was told that the previous Chief did not want body cameras and it seems like the current Chief is resistant also. I do hope that the City Manager will ensure that something is done. Residents I have spoken to, and I have spoken to many, are quite shocked and surprised. They don't want us to be in the national spotlight and not having recorded incidents of what is going on in our community. I mean, what happened in Parkland, nobody knew what happened there and Miramar is not immune. We are not somehow a Nevada that nothing is going to go wrong here, we need to be real, we need to use our tax dollars appropriately to fund body cams.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Agnes Forsythe. Good evening.

AGNES FORSYTHE: Good evening everyone. My name is Agnes Forsythe, as the Mayor said. My main concern is about the conditions of the roads, sidewalks, and medians of Historic Miramar. Since June of last year, construction to beautify Historic Miramar began. Most residents were excited even though we had to take many road diversions to get to our destinations, to tolerate all the dust in our driveways, and to wash to our vehicles every day. There was a break due to Hurricane Irma in September but after that we saw no one in our area continue to work on the roads. The construction workers moved to another location and began digging and continued the same, leaving the streets worse than they were before. I drove through several areas in Historic Miramar and the conditions are the same or even worse than the area where I reside. Why would the City allow the hired contractors to destroy the roads in the entire neighborhood? Why can't the contractors work on a certain number of streets, dig them up, fix the plumbing, then resurface the streets, and then move to another location to do the same thing? Island Drive is a total mess. This is a thoroughfare and it is embarrassing to drive down the island – Island Drive, and see all the stumps, which have been there for about eight months. Have the Mayor, the City Manager, and the Commissioners told Historic Miramar? Every time I go to another City and return to Miramar I tell myself, welcome to the ghetto. The entire neighborhood is a mess. The City stated that funds have already been located to fix the roads. Please do something now.

Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Ma'am. Thank you, thank you. Just a reminder, you know, when members of the public speak everyone has the right to communicate their sentiments and should be respected as such even if our opinions may differ from them or if you support them. Just a reminder if we would just extend everyone all due courtesy so that they can voice their opinions and their concerns as well. Thank you so much for your cooperation.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Mayor, before we take the break, on Item #6, I know it passed, but Commissioner Riggs had asked about doing an amendment but when the motion was made the amendment was not included to include the complaints about the wait time, reducing wait times. If we do want to do that we need a motion to reconsider, have it voted on and then you can make a motion to amend it and then we can proceed.

MAYOR MESSAM: Alright. Two votes have to take place. I will entertain a motion to reconsider Item number six.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to reconsider item number 6.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Riggs, to reconsider Item #6, Temporary Resolution #R6657, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

MAYOR MESSAM: May I have a motion on the amendment?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: It would be motion to approve as amended.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve as amended.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Vice Mayor Barnes, to approve Item #6, Temporary Resolution #R6657, as amended, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes

Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

**Resolution No. 18-71 as amended**

MAYOR MESSAM: We will be moving Item number ten up next but we will take a five-minute recess and I will be counting, colleagues. So, five-minute recess. I did not see – my error, Ms. Scialabba, please come forward.

DEBRA SCIALABBA: Good evening, Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26<sup>th</sup> Street, Miramar. First of all, I would like to say thank you for what you are doing in our City and also to that Mary Rainer was supposed to do this and then I was going to discuss the City Manager; however, they are going to be new grandparents so she is in up State. Anyway, Mayor Messam, United Neighbors of East Miramar Residents and Business Owners would like to thank Assistant City Manager, Jay Michael Moore, for his outstanding work by presenting him with this Certificate of Appreciation for his continued service towards the beautification of our City. Now, I understand about the roads and everything, but we need the infrastructure, we need all of this. We have needed this for years and years and years. I understand what everybody is saying and it is hard to realize that you are going to deal with this in two years or whatever. I would like to speak on the City Manager. So, may I give them to him please?

MAYOR MESSAM: Sure, if you can – it's no problem.

DEBRA SCIALABBA: It's actually what I had said to thank you for your outstanding work and continued service towards the beautification of our City signed by Mary Rainer and the Board of Directors. Thank you so much.

MAYOR MESSAM: Alright. Thank you. That completes your comment?

DEBRA SCIALABBA: Thank you. Can I come back for #9.

MAYOR MESSAM: When we come back to #9 you can speak on all items. Alright, so our next speaker is Nasif Alshaier. This page was missing somehow; it just came up? We have one left. Good evening, sir.

NASIF ALSHAIER: Mr. Mayor, my name is Nasif Alshaier, 3940 SW 149<sup>th</sup> Terrace. Good evening Vice Mayor, Commissioners, City Manager, and City Clerk. I am here tonight in support of the pay raise for the City Manager. Here is why, when you read an endorsement by the Money Magazine for the City of Miramar for being one of the best places to live as a small town and as one of the most outstanding Local Government that takes leadership and good management, in addition to the good Legislator that we have. I believe that we have very good management, very



good leadership, that has a good staff, very experienced in their work and the hard work days and night to improve our quality of life in Miramar and make it the best City to live. I am totally in support of the pay raise for the City Manager. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir. And our final speaker, the Miramar Park Homeowners Group represented by Ms. Norma Martin.

NORMA MARTIN: Good night everyone, Mayor, Commissioners. Norma Martin, 7200 Grandview Boulevard, Miramar, Florida 33023. The main reason I am here is my – I should say how unhappy I am with the comments you keep hearing out on the street about the Commissioners and the division, the disrespect, not agreeing with each other. I remember in 2015 when we had the election, of course, John Public was not really happy with the makeup and comments were made and the behaving and what's happening is giving them reason to say, I told you so. Secondly, the question of salary for City Manager. As far as am concerned, I don't think that is an item that should have been brought out and discussed in public. I remember when we had former City Manager, that an item was discussed within or among other items and I was also at meetings when they were electing City Manager. It was approved and as far as I am concerned recommended, there was a happy love affair. So what has happened when love turns to hate, that this thing is now out in public and you are going to tar and feather someone. I don't think it should be an item that should have been on an agenda and discussed in public. It's not nice; the feeling out there is not nice and I too don't think so. I love Miramar. That's the reason I am living here. I try everything with my group to make sure that we do and keep my neighborhood clean and to see what is happening, it hurts. I remember because in 2015, when we had the election, John Public was not in agreement with the makeup of the Commission and what you are doing is giving them the right to say, I told you so. As a result, I even sat when I was throwing out the fires, I pinned something about Miramar, and I'm going to give it to you. Read the words please and see if what it says is not true.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. At this time, we will have a five-minute recess. We have four minutes and 57 seconds remaining.

### **RECESS/RECONVENE**

MAYOR MESSAM: The Miramar City Commission Meeting is now called back to order. All elected officials, please come back to the Commission. We are now on to Ordinance. Item number seven, please.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Mayor, I thought you going to Item number ten.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes, item number ten, please.

10. Temp. Reso. #R6665 calling on the State of Florida, Governor Rick Scott, President Donald Trump, and the Federal Government to **reduce gun violence** in America and help prevent future mass shootings by requiring a background check for every firearm sale; supporting the passage of a Red Flag Law; supporting raising the age for legal purchase of firearms, magazines, and ammunition to 21; supporting the passage of legislation that would keep military-style weapons and high-capacity magazines away from our schools; urging the Florida Legislature to repeal the punitive punishments of elected officials set forth in Section 790.33, Florida Statutes; authorizing the City Clerk to transmit this Resolution. (*Commissioner Yvette Colbourne*)

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Item number ten is a resolution calling on the State of Florida, Governor Rick Scott, President Donald Trump, and the Federal Government to **reduce gun violence** in America and help prevent future mass shootings by requiring a background check for every firearm sale; supporting the passage of a Red Flag Law; supporting raising the age for legal purchase of firearms, magazines, and ammunition to 21; supporting the passage of legislation that would keep military-style weapons and high-capacity magazines away from our schools; urging the Florida Legislature to repeal the punitive punishments of elected officials set forth in Section 790.33, Florida Statutes; authorizing the City Clerk to transmit this Resolution; and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you Mr. Attorney. This item was brought forward by Commissioner Colbourne. Any comments, then we will open up for public comment. We will take a motion if so desire. Commissioner Colbourne, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you very much. Mr. Mayor, fellow Commissioners. I would like all of you – I am deeply saddened by the tragedy that happened, the horrific actions of one individual and one very dangerous firearm that brought so much harm to this community and killed 17 individuals. There is Legislations that are in both our State and at Congress level and we want to make sure that they – we want to stand with the students. I am extremely proud of the students who have come forward in taking this to the next level to make sure there is Legislation to reduce the violence from guns. I think this Legislation before you today will be our voice to let them know that we stand with them and to let our Legislators know that we are looking to make sure our schools are safe for our kids.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Are there any members from the public that wish to speak on this item? Good evening and just a reminder, if you just could state your name and address and if you choose, you look like you still

may be in school, if you could share with us your school name. Welcome.

SHEENA KING: Hi. My name is Sheena King and I attend Archbishop Edward A. McCarthy High School and my address is 12002 SW 29<sup>th</sup> Street, Miramar, Florida 33025. On Wednesday, February 14, 2018, 17 innocent lives were taken away by one individual. In the past, many of these events have occurred but since this one hit so close to our home, it made a bigger impact. Gun violence is a major topic that occurs in our society. It may be near or far but it needs to come to an end. School shootings could be prevented if only gun laws were more strictly enforced. Can everyone just do me a favor and close their eyes for a second? Just imagine waking up one morning with a great start. Imagine going into a day filled with joy and love and peace and then attending school just like any other day. Then having that day taken away by one individual who was given a great amount of power that could have been prevented if only we had a better gun control. Now, open your eyes. Hopefully, most of you can't even imagine that feeling. 17 innocent bystander lives were taken away and numerous amounts of students, faculty, and parents, and more have been affected in dare I say changed. This is why gun violence needs to come to an end. Now a numerous amount of families who are mourning at this tragedy. Loved ones and friends want to feel safe but can't seem to grasp this feeling of security again. With your help we could bring back this feeling of joy that once lived in our homes. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

AMARIA PAVAL: Hi. My name is Amaria Paval and I attend Weston Christian Academy. I am a resident of the City of Miramar. When I first heard of this incident I was horrified. Students should have a feeling of being secure and unharmed but instead, students are feeling fearful and now wanting to go outside the house. I believe there should be laws that are more strict when trying to purchase or possess a gun. If in any circumstance you need to buy a gun, you shall receive an in-depth background – background check, a mental wellness check, and check for every single social media account that you own or have owned. I thought that there should be more officers in schools and students won't feel as terrified as they used to. This improvement will make students feel a bit safer and will prevent this tragedy from ever happening again. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening.

CELIA HINDS: Good evening. My name is Celia Hinds, I'm 16, I go to Everglades High School. Do you need my address?

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

CELIA HINDS: 20826 NW 3<sup>rd</sup> Lane, Pembroke Pines, Florida. This tragedy happened last week, Wednesday, has affected me, my friends, my teachers, my family, my school district, my State, my country that I live in in so many ways. One horrific incident could have been prevented in so many ways but one answer or one solution to that problem could have been gun control and if adults took the youths, when we speak out when we reach for help, if they took it more seriously because one thing that after the incident happened when I went to school – I went to school the day after. Everybody was terrified. Although we had a lot more security, Police Officers were at the gates, everybody – we were on code yellow all day. My Chemistry teacher told me, “Out of all my years in teaching I didn't think there would be a day I would have to prepare for combat.” She feels that her responsibility is to take care of us but it is not only her responsibility, it is other adults. When we reach out to other people that they should listen. These lives weren't lost just to – how do I say? These lives will help us – the lives that were lost will help us make a change and help us come together as a County and I don't know if you guys are aware of it but today we had a school walkout across the nation and my school – we were all united to celebrate the 17 lives. It was so nice to see all of us supporting one thing and if the Government could just hear us out and support us for gun control that would be really nice. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Great job to our students. Are there any other members in the public that wish to comment on this item?

DEBRA SCIALABBA: Good evening, Debra Scialabba, 6490 SW 26<sup>th</sup> Street. Sheriff Scott Israel brought up a very good point, which I didn't know, but when someone is baker-acted, they generally have issues, mental challenges and issues, and when they are Baker-acted they are only baker-acted maybe two or three days. They can't be admitted; it is only a very short time. What he said is basically to get Legislature to pass a law because once they are baker-acted, when they get out all their rifles, everything gets turned over back to them. So, here what we are doing is we are giving their rifles back and we already know – I understand with HIPPA you can't – you can't discuss psychological privacy issues but when someone is baker-acted because of it, there should be some kind of Legislation. I'm not sure what Sheriff Scott Israel had in mind where the rifles and the weapons are not returned to them. I don't know if maybe he meant a specific time you know to lapse. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Seeing none, back to this dais. Vice Mayor Barnes, you are recognized.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: As I intimated earlier, this has been extremely personal for me. I make no apologies and I have shed a lot of tears in the last week. We shouldn't put our children through this. The children are not doing this; the adults are facilitating this kind of behavior. It is personal to me because my daughter goes to high school in August or September this year. She has cousins in high school in Fort Lauderdale. I take this personally. Think about sending your child somewhere, taking them to school, a place we assume, we take for granted, is safe. We have come to understand now that they are not. There was a time when the Vice President in this country liked what is called alliteration and I am going to borrow some of his stuff. What I call lily-livered Legislators in Tallahassee, have disrespected our young people so what do they do? They chose to discuss a Bill on pornography instead of even acknowledging the petition these young people are bringing to them. Insensitivity bartering on malice is what causes this to happen. I think the saddest aspect of it is that that kind of arrogance on the part of the Legislators is extremely fool hearty. These are young people who, some are already voters, some are going to become voters, the temerity, the insensitivity of some people who have suggested, have implied, have claimed that some of these youngsters are paid actors who go from crisis scenes, one to the other. It is incumbent on all of us, young people, grown-ups, those of us who like to call ourselves adults; we need to stop this pain and suffering in our children. It is part of our responsibility as grown-ups, as adults, as parents, to protect our children and part of the protection is turning over your son or your daughter who has things in a household that could supply half of an army. I speak of someone who has looked into the barrel of a nine-millimeter gun a long time ago. I was never given the gift of fear. I'm not so sure I ever met fear. Our young people deserve better than this and for us to look at these young people. My daughter walked out of class today so she is a paid actor? I need to talk to her mommy about that. It is disrespect; it is insensitivity. We went to a Leagues of City Conference years ago and one of the lecturers said that when lawmakers sit in places like Tallahassee and they pass laws, they discuss laws, they debate laws, they have absolutely no feeling, no understanding of what happens on the ground as a consequence of the Bills they pass into law. I suspect young people are going to make the difference this time around. I sometimes go to bed without any hope; I wake in the mornings with hope. The hope that I hold and share at this moment has to do with the young people in Broward County; it has to do with the young people across this country. There is going to come a reckoning and the time is very short, the time is near when we, as people of good will, are going to have to stand up and say enough is enough.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Vice Mayor. Are there any other comments on this item?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I just want to say thank you to the young ladies that came up. Everyone who spoke on it but particularly the young ladies and the young man that spoke before he left as well. I know these kids have homework to

do. We want our kids to be able to concentrate on learning, concentrate on their education. We want our teachers to be able to teach to their primary purpose, their primary heart and soul is placed on teaching and not being concerned about their safety. Hopefully this will send the united voice from the City of Miramar Commission to our Legislators as to what we expect for our students. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you Commissioner Colbourne for bringing this item forward. In this country we have so many children that go to bed hungry, so many children that go homeless. In Broward County alone, we have over 2,400 children that every day go to school and they are homeless. I am not sure why a young child would need a kind of weapon he possessed, why would he need an AK – AR15? It makes no sense. In this country we have – in the State of Florida I think we have over 1,500 children between the ages of three and 12 that get arrested every year. I'm not sure where they take them, but still, a young man left to purchase an AR15, a child. We are going to have to do better, much better. With that, I thank you once again Commissioner Colbourne.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Riggs? Like everyone, you can't help but feel disgust about that tragic event and that just crosses all senses of civility, you know, to send your child to school only to get a frantic phone call or text message that they are on lockdown because there is an active shooting on campus. That is just despicable and I am sure that we all remember where we were the moment when we got the notice of the shooting. When you think about the current climate in our country and just the laws that exist. When is enough is enough and what are we going to do about it? Did you know that as local elected officials, that the City of Miramar, that this Commission cannot pass any Legislation that restricts the access of guns without each of us personally being targeted, threatened to be taken out of office, fined by the State of Florida? Did you know that? I think about School Board members. Florida Legislature has pre-empted any ability for any of your local elected officials to help do just something small or great to make our community and our property and our facilities safe. My question is, as a community, what are we going to do about it? Are we just going to continue to give thoughts and prayers and nice comments regarding our sentiments and the feelings about the event or do we take action? And that is what was mentioned earlier, in terms of our young people, I could not be more proud of our students, you know, to see and hear just our Miramar students to come before us and speak so eloquently and so articulately their concerns and their viewpoints on this issue. It mirrors the other Broward students and students across this country that are standing up. But I want to continue to encourage you to keep speaking up. When you look at every major Civil Rights advancement in this country, it was led by our youth. Our youth who are not afraid to stand up, lead, and do so, actually in a militant and rebellious fashion. So, continue to speak up because your leadership is what is going to move the City, the State, and this

country. And us older folks, what are we going to do? Are we going to stand on the sidelines and not support our future generations for making sure what needs to be done gets done or are we just going to treat Marjorie Stoneman Douglas High School just like Columbine, Sandy Hook, and all the other tragic massacres that have taken place because of the senseless assault weapons? When I first saw this Resolution that was drafted and created by Mayor Mike Ryan in Sunrise that shared it with Broward County, I thought everything on it was spot on and I thank Commissioner Colbourne for submitting our version for the City of Miramar. I think with this vote it shows that the City of Miramar agrees with our fellow elected officials and our County, that sending a voice not only to Tallahassee but to Washington, D.C. that enough is enough and no more. So, on that note, I will take a motion for adoption of this Resolution.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Riggs, to approve Temporary Resolution #R6665, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes

Commissioner Riggs  
Mayor Messam

Yes  
Yes

**Resolution No. 18-73**

MAYOR MESSAM: Now on to Ordinances, item number seven.

**ORDINANCES**

7. **FIRST READING** of Temp. Ord. #01685, **amending the Land Development Code**, making findings; amending Section 201, providing new and amended definitions; revising Section 308.11 relating to Parks and Recreation level of service; amending Sections 318.2 and 318.4 relating to Building Permits; amending Sections 319.1 relating to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy; amending Sections 321.1.2, 321.1.4, 321.1.9, and 321.2 relating to the issuance of a Zoning Certificate of Use; revising Section 322.1, 322.2.2, and 322.3, Table 8, clarifying provisions relating to Temporary Use Permits; amending Sections 402.4 and 402.7, Table 402-3, Multi-Family Residential District Drawings and RM-4 Setbacks; revising Section 402.7, Table 403-1 Hospital and Hotel/Motel Permitted, Conditional, and Prohibited Uses in the OS, CR, and CF Zoning Districts; revising lot dimensions in Section 404.5, Table 404-2; clarifying Section 405.3.2 Urban Garden Operational Standards; revising Section 405.6.1 relating to Auto Repair, Paint and Tire Store Standards; amending Section 802.4.4, Table 802-1 relating to Right-Of-Way Widths for Town Home or Limited Access Tracts; amending Section 803.3.2 clarifying Residential Roof and Driveway Standards; amending Sections 809.12 and 809.12.1 relating to Swimming Pool Standards; providing for intent and inclusion in the Code; providing for severability; providing for interpretation; providing that City Officials may take action to implement Code; and providing for an effective date. *(Principal Planner Michael Alpert)*

SECOND READING SCHEDULED for March 7, 2018

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Item number seven is an ordinance of the City Commission authorizing **amending the Land Development Code**, making findings; amending Section 201, providing new and amended definitions; revising Section 308.11 relating to Parks and Recreation level of service; amending Sections 318.2 and 318.4 relating to Building Permits; amending Sections 319.1 relating to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy; amending Sections 321.1.2, 321.1.4, 321.1.9, and 321.2 relating to the issuance of a Zoning Certificate of Use;



revising Section 322.1, 322.2.2, and 322.3, Table 8, clarifying provisions relating to Temporary Use Permits; amending Sections 402.4 and 402.7, Table 402-3, Multi-Family Residential District Drawings and RM-4 Setbacks; revising Section 402.7, Table 403-1 Hospital and Hotel/Motel Permitted, Conditional, and Prohibited Uses in the OS, CR, and CF Zoning Districts; revising lot dimensions in Section 404.5, Table 404-2; clarifying Section 405.3.2 Urban Garden Operational Standards; revising Section 405.6.1 relating to Auto Repair, Paint and Tire Store Standards; amending Section 802.4.4, Table 802-1 relating to Right-Of-Way Widths for Town Home or Limited Access Tracts; amending Section 803.3.2 clarifying Residential Roof and Driveway Standards; amending Sections 809.12 and 809.12.1 relating to Swimming Pool Standards; providing for intent and inclusion in the Code; providing for severability; providing for interpretation; providing that City Officials may take action to implement Code; and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Good evening, Mr. Alpert.

PRINCIPAL PLANNER MICHAEL ALPERT: Good evening, Mr. Mayor, Mr. Vice Mayor, Commissioners, City Attorneys, City Clerk. Michael Alpert, Principal Planner. This ordinance proposes some minor amendments to existing text language and tables within several sections of four chapters for existing chapters of the Land Development Code. Some amended and new definitions in Chapter 2, various provisions and tables in Chapter 3 – Processes, amendments to texts and tables in the newly adopted Chapter 4 – Zoning, and amendments to some tables and provisions in Chapter 8, which is Development Standards. This ordinance proceeds the next major phase of the LDC update, it amends certain glitches and previously adopted chapters, streamlines, and improves upon regulations that affect redevelopment in Historic Miramar as well as homeowners. Some examples, they are taking a look at the roof type regulations that we have to allow homeowners to put various types of roof systems on their homes. We heard a lot after Hurricane Irma and our regulations have never permitted certain types and we want to make sure that would be available. Also, another example of regulations to help redevelopment or reduce setbacks and reduce requirements regarding park agreements and lot sizes – excuse me, and right-of-way requirements for smaller parcels throughout the City for redevelopment. These amendments were endorsed by Economic Development Advisory Board on January 11, 2018, the Planning and Zoning Board recommended approval on January 23, 2018 and made a finding that these amendments are consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. Approval is recommended.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Are there any members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Seeing none, I'm back to this dais. Any comments on this item? Take a motion.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Vice Mayor Barnes, to approve Temporary Ordinance #O1685, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes
Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

**Passed 1<sup>st</sup> Reading**

MAYOR MESSAM: On to Quasi-Judicial.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Thank you Mayor. I am going to read the quasi-judicial public hearing process. Florida Courts have determined that if there are certain types of matters, including the following application, which are to be treated differently than other issues considered by the Commission. Most decisions of the Commission are legislative in nature, which means that the Commission is acting as a policymaking body. In contrast, in quasi-judicial matters, the Commission is applying existing rules and policies for a factual situation and is therefore acting like a judge or a jury in a courtroom. In such cases, courts have decided that due process and fundamental fairness require that more formal procedures be

followed. The City of Miramar procedures for quasi-judicial hearings are as follows: anyone who wishes to speak shall be collectively sworn in by the City Clerk. The hearings will be conducted in an informal manner. I will read the title of the item to be considered. City staff will present a brief synopsis of the application and make a recommendation. Next will be a presentation by the applicant. The Commission will then hear from participants in favor or and in opposition to the application. All witnesses are subject to cross examination by City staff, City Commission, and the applicant, and a participant may request that the Commission ask questions of a witness. The applicant and staff will make concluding remarks. No further presentations or testimony will be permitted, and the public hearing will then be closed. All decisions of the Commission must be based upon competent, substantial evidence presented to it at the hearing. All backup materials provided to the City Commission as part of the agenda will automatically be made a part of the hearing record. All approvals will be subject to staff recommended conditions, unless otherwise stated in the motion for approval. At this time, the City Clerk should swear in all witnesses.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: All of those wishing to provide testimony on the following quasi-judicial item, please stand and raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the testimony you are about to give is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth? Please remain standing until you receive a colored dot, thank you.

## **QUASI-JUDICIAL PUBLIC HEARING**

8. Temp. Reso. #R6643 considering Application No. 1800063, **Conditional Use approval** to allow an Adult Education/Vocational Institute Conditional Use for **Florida Vocational Institute**, within Miramar Park of Commerce - Phase V, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 170, Page 161, Public Records of Broward County, Florida, located at 3560 Enterprise Way. (*Principal Planner Michael Alpert*)

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Item number eight is a resolution considering Application No. 1800063, **Conditional Use approval** to allow an Adult Education/Vocational Institute Conditional Use for **Florida Vocational Institute**, within Miramar Park of Commerce - Phase V, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 170, Page 161, Public Records of Broward County, Florida, located at 3560 Enterprise Way and providing for an effective date.

MAYOR MESSAM: Mr. Alpert.

PRINCIPAL PLANNER MICHAEL ALPERT: Good evening again. I am Michael Alpert, Principal Planner. A little bit of background about this. This is a proposed

adult educational institute to be located within the Miramar Park of Commerce, 23B. Zoning for the property is Planned Industrial Development, the Land Use Designation is Regional Activity Center. A community meeting was held on January 23, 2018 at 6:00 p.m. No one from the public was in attendance. Planning and Zoning Board recommended approval on January 23, 2018. The location of this building is on 3560 Enterprise Way, just east of Red Road and south of Miramar Parkway, north of the Homestead Extension. Approval is recommended.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you for the presentation. Are there any questions from the dais for staff? Hearing none, are there any members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Seeing and hearing none, back to the dais. May I have a motion?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Motion to approve.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Riggs, to approve Temporary Resolution #R6643, the Commission voted:

Vice Mayor Barnes	Yes
Commissioner Chambers	Yes

Commissioner Colbourne	Yes
Commissioner Riggs	Yes
Mayor Messam	Yes

**Resolution No. 18-72**

MAYOR MESSAM: On to Other Business, Reports. Item number nine.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

**9. City Manager’s evaluation and salary adjustment discussion. (Mayor Wayne M. Messam)**

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Mayor, there is no item titled to be read, this is the City Manager’s evaluation and salary adjustment. Before you get into it I did want to mention one thing, I know at the prior Commission Meeting there was some talk about a letter that had been received by an Attorney. In doing the evaluation and review, I just want to remind the Commission that you should not take that into consideration, a City is not allowed to retaliate against someone for hiring a lawyer or for making any types of claims and you should do your evaluation and view decisions purely upon your feelings about City Manager’s performance and nothing else should really be taken into consideration.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Mr. Attorney. During last meeting’s discussion regarding this item, it was decided by the Commission to bring it forward this week. I did want to respond to a question from the public regarding why this item is being discussed publicly and because this could potentially be an amendment to the Manager’s contract, which has to be adopted publicly is the reason why there is a requirement for action. I just wanted to communicate that to the public. Before going on to Commission discussion regarding the City Manager’s evaluation and salary adjustment discussion I would like to provide an opportunity to hear from our City Manager Kathleen Woods-Richardson. Madam Manager, you are recognized.

CITY MANAGER WOODS-RICHARDSON: Thank you for allowing me a moment to address you. It is with my great respect for each of you and the very highest regard that I have for this great City that I am speaking to you. The discussion of my contract, performance evaluation, and salary, has extended over the last ten months and I have respectfully and patiently heard your concerns, critiques, and comments that I understood at some point lead to an amendment, but that never happened. Since providing you my request last April, this is the first time that I am addressing you. I’m not here to refute any statements, argue any positions, persuade any decisions, or defend any of my actions. The only reason I am speaking now is because just as each of you expressed last week how surprised

and disappointed you were at the route I have taken to get an amendment to my contract, I need you to understand that I am also surprised and disappointed. My greatest disappointment is the report to each of you that I or my Attorney sent information to the media creating a publicly contentious environment in which to have a discussion. In my four years and five months with the City, I have had numerous occasions to hear and see this very Commission's regard for the fair treatment and compensation of the City's employees. I performed duties and participated in actions in accordance with written policies and procedures regarding fair treatment and compensation of City employees. The majority of the Commission involved issues exceeded the fiscal impact and complexity of the amendments I proposed for my contract. I am certain that had the request within my proposed amendment been submitted on behalf of City staff, this Commission would have agreed and directed me to implement them. I am also certain that the process would have been handled in a far more conservatory manner such as a Workshop or Executive Session and resulted in appearance of a Resolution at the next available Commission meeting because that's how this Board works. I want you to know that my request for salary amendment is not for a merit or bonus but is based on the same City policies as for the City and represented employees. A base salary comparable to market rates and to maintain internal equity and a cost of living adjustment, again, the same as for unrepresented employees. All said, my statement today is the manner in which City business is conducted reflects on everyone. It is my hope that this matter, regardless of this outcome for me, is conducted in a way that mine and the City's reputation remains intact. Thank you for hearing me.

**MAYOR MESSAM:** Thank you Madam Manager for your comments. So, basically as directed or as by consensus by the Commission on last meeting, the purpose of this item is to – for everyone to at least state that they have done their evaluation in whatever format that you've decided to do and to have a decision on the City Manager's compensation request. I would request that this Commission honor the Manager's request in regard to our deliberation and I'm sure that we all are at the capacity to handle such discussion as appropriate. Are there any comments at this time? Vice Mayor Barnes, you are recognized.

**VICE MAYOR BARNES:** As I indicated at our last meeting when this matter came up, I am totally in support of the appropriate salary amendment that our City Manager is seeking. Let me add, as clearly as possible, I refrained from preparing an evaluation of the City Manager because I was convinced beyond any kind of doubt that the original intent behind calling for evaluation had less than positive connotations to it. It is my opinion that the request for an evaluation of a City Manager came because there were contemplations. I guess I am saying it, there were contemplations of removing her. I refrained from doing the evaluation on that basis alone. I am prepared to vote for the adjustment in the salary of our City Manager.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Vice Mayor Barnes. Any other comments from the Commission? Commissioner Colbourne. To help me be able to recognize each of you, if you are not going to press the button at least raise your hand so I can know that you want to speak. Thanks so much. Commissioner Colbourne, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Okay. It still shows from the last time I pressed it. Just to let you know we need to test that.

MAYOR MESSAM: Some telepathy going on.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: You are doing pretty good, Mr. Mayor. First of all, I want to say that I have completed the City Manager's evaluation. I supported hiring the Manager very strongly and I'm not interested in shaming the Manager in any way or having any type of discussion in any way that would make her uncomfortable. This discussion here tonight, it certainly shouldn't be, and it isn't about elections or campaigning, it is about the Manager's request for an increase in pay. This is not the first time we discussed this. The last time we discussed, we previously got a request from the Manager for a pay and we had a discussion at a Workshop regarding this subject and the follow up to that was that we were to provide an evaluation for the Manager and I fully expected that we would see a Resolution for the increase in pay for her request during the budget process. It did not come before us during the budget process. It is before us now and yes, I was taken back by receiving a letter City Manager versus the City of Miramar instead of it being placed on the agenda. I really thought it would have been just placed as an item on the agenda. I do want to say that if this item was before me during the budget season for an increase, I would have voted against it then, as I will vote against it today. Specifically, what I will highlight is that this past budget season we were presented with a budget with a gap of \$10 million. A \$10 million gap in the budget is something that happened under the watch of this current City Manager. Again, I won't go into any more details than I need to but I will not support an increase today. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you. Commissioner Chambers, you are recognized. Do you have any comments? I can't see you Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: He doesn't have any.

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay, Commissioner Riggs. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Thank you, Mayor. I've given this a lot of thought since the request was made to us and I wanted to make certain that I handle this with love and the most professional manner because again, this is not about anything personal, not from me anyway, and I can honestly say that. Although, I don't know the City Manager on a personal level, I don't think anyone would disagree with me

if I say that our City Manager is a very nice person, a very nice individual. However, what we need is not just a nice individual, we need a City Manager who is going to perform the duties and functions outlined in our Charter and I've done my evaluation of the City Manager and that is public information. So, because of time, I don't have time to go over everything that I have outlined and how I've graded or did the evaluation but you are welcome to take a look at that because what I've done has gone above and beyond in giving explanations and examples as to everything that was asked from us from this evaluation from our staff. So, with that being said, there are a few things I do want to point out and again, my decision and the evaluation is based on performance and nothing else. Budget is one of the biggest issues and every year we are asked to increase the millage. I believe if this Commission wasn't as strong as we are, we would have raised the millage every year. I don't think we are financially where we should be or could have been under our current City Manager and in addition to that, another big concern of mine is Historic Miramar. I believe that within the four years and five months that the City Manager has been sitting her that Historic Miramar should have been in much better state than it is at this very moment. I have some issues with a few departments that I don't believe are operating accordingly and we have departments that have grown tremendously at the top level, yet we are asking for employees. So, there are some major issues that I have, so I too don't see that our City Manager merits an increase in salary at the moment. So, I cannot support an increase in salary as well. That's where I stand with that. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner Riggs. I have been on record in regard to my sentiments regarding the evaluation. I have, through the process, completed an evaluation but as I stated before, I don't think that our respective evaluations has any impact on our individual position on whether we should grant the City Manager her requested pay increase. I supported the pay increase then and I still support it now. I think that when we look at the direction the City of Miramar is going in, I think it is going in a positive direction. In any City you can highlight areas of opportunities where we can do things a little better. Each of us can look at ourselves and say how we can even be a better public servant. In anything, as an athlete you practice and you work every day to get better, to correct missed assignments, dropped balls, missed baskets, things to get better. I just would like to thank the City Manager for being professional in everything and how she conducts business. I think it is a fair assessment to say that she is impartial, she tries her best to balance the demands of each of us as Commissioners. There have been decisions that I haven't been happy with but I've understood why or the rational on why the recommendation was made and ultimately adopted by the Commission, us as a Board. I think when you look at the City of Miramar, the fourth largest City in this County, one of the largest budgets in this County, our City continues to grow. It is always going to be a challenge to balance our budget. It is always going to be a challenge for us to meet the level of service that our residents deserve while managing and balancing inflation, increases in salaries of over 1,000 employees, managing pensions, risk management, all the things that



are part of public Administration. It is not an easy job and there will never be utopia. Our goal is utopia, our goal is perfect service, but as we strive for perfection we can be perfect in our effort but sometimes the results may not necessarily be as we desire. I appreciate her not only as a public Administrator, I appreciate her as a woman and leader of Administration, especially in a climate when you think about how women are treated, how they are unequally compensated compared to their male peers. Her salary right now is in the middle of the road in terms of the 31 municipalities; she is about a little bit above it; a little bit above the median for a City of Miramar stature. Especially in light, as I said last week, coming off this past election, all the praise is sung about how well the City is doing and as Pastor Jackson mentioned, and I didn't know he was coming tonight, but it was ironic how he would say that the City is going in a positive direction; it is kind of hard to detach that success from this Commission and Administration. Trust me, if we were going down the toilet we all would be hitched to the wagon as well. Regardless of where this vote goes tonight, I just want the Manager to know that her efforts are appreciated, that there are some opportunities and I will be handing her my evaluation in terms of areas where I look forward to working with her in terms of areas of opportunities where we can even take this City further. I think that would be a challenge she is definitely willing and ready to live up to and I'm sure for those who have done evaluations, she will take those into consideration as well because I know her heart is with this City and I know she loves her staff. I think that, not only as a leader but as a black woman, who has to not only navigate the pressures of the five of us, which I am sure is not an easy task, but being able to be responsive to over her 1,000 employees is not an easy chore. I think the least we could do is honor a cost of living adjustment, which is what her mere request is. No merit increase, no additional compensations to pension, nothing in her contract would allow her contract to balloon to the level of her predecessor, that's for sure, and I just think that out of professional decency that at least that minimum request could be granted. So, I just want the Manager to know that I respect her. Everyone knows when the Manager was being selected, the Manager was not my number one choice, she was not my number one choice, but when she was selected I had a meeting with her, I called her into my office and I told her that failure was not an option and that I would do everything in my power to work with her to make sure that Miramar is a successful City on behalf of our residents and our corporate community. I think that she has definitely been above average on that and I think everyone who gets an above average rating at a minimum should get a cost of living adjustment. I just think that's just out of professional decency. Those are my comments. Without belaboring this issue, we did not hear from one of our elected officials, which is – okay, I just want to provide an opportunity before I open up the floor for a motion. If not, we can open the floor for a motion. Commissioner Chambers, you are recognized. I just want you to have an opportunity if you want to speak.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I think I'm going to disagree with you. I'm not sure if you want to make this a woman issue. If you do

I can get you a list of plenty of women that work for the City; they are making anywhere from \$18,000 to \$40,000 a year and they have been here for a long time and they have not gotten a raise. So, I don't think we want to make it a woman issue. There is a lot of struggling females that work for the City that I see every day can't even buy lunch and they have to choose between buying medicine for their children or putting gas in their car. It's a fact. I've spoken to them. They are in all different departments here; Police Department, Social Service Department, Utilities, Public Works, Park, not to mention males who have been here for a long time. So, my mother used to come home with \$180 something every two weeks; she just retired in 2009. I don't know how she did it but she did. I'm not sure if we want to make this a woman issue. Maybe when we come back in the budget process we can take another look and see if we can make it happen but right now it is not a go. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: May I have a motion please? Vice Mayor Barnes, you are recognized.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: I very forcefully underline and highlight my conviction and belief is not just a woman thing, it is a black woman thing.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: What does that mean?

MAYOR MESSAM: Okay.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: It's not for me.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Like I said last year in defense of our City Manager, I have reasons to convince me that there has been a movement to replace her. I said that almost a year ago. Us quibbling back and forth is not going to change my mind on that. Like I said at that time, I was asking, I was pleading with us to treat one of our own more fairly. I'm not saying anything new.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Okay.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Motion to approve.

MAYOR MESSAM: We have a motion, no second. Motion dies. Let's get a couple of more – what I don't want to have is a discussion that is not leading towards – I think we have heard a discussion in regard to everyone's sentiments. If we want to discuss the merits of women/male that is a different issue. The issue before us is if we are going to take up or honor the Manager's pay increase. I plead with the Commission not to have any discussion that is counterproductive for us making our decisions; we have all voiced our sentiments regarding our position on the Manager and our position on the request.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Mr. Mayor, do you want to withdraw the item?

MAYOR MESSAM: Excuse me. No, I'm not. We are going to vote up or down. I am just requesting that the Commission take an action.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: May I?

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes, Commissioner, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: May I get a clarification from the Attorney?

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. If we are voting not to give the Manager an increase in salary, what should the motion be?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: That could be the motion; there is no Resolution on the agenda. You have done an evaluation, at the conclusion at your evaluation you need to make a decision as to whether, you can make a motion to make no change, you can make a motion to make the City Manager's request to change, you can make a motion to make some other change; a smaller change. There is no – it is up to the Commission what you want to do. I would also mention Mayor, before you have a motion and vote you should open to the public.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes. Members of the public who wish to speak on this item please come forward.

DEBRA SCIALABBA: Debra Scialabba, 6590 SW 26<sup>th</sup> Street. Would anyone of your work four years and know you are not going to get any compensation? You can't tell me, you can't look me in the eye and tell me that this woman has not done any good for this City because she has. For you to turn around – because you know something, letters go out and I'm really sick and tired of hearing what I'm hearing in the community about certain letters, certain emails, that should not be anything to have your judgment on. That is defamation of character of an individual and I resent the fact that this evaluation and everything is evaluation. I was evaluated. She passed her probationary period. She is four years without any kind of compensation at all. You know, would you work Commissioner Chambers? Would you work.

MAYOR MESSAM: Can you please address the Chair? Do not address individual members. Thank you.

DEBRA SCIALABBA: I'm sorry. Anyway, you expect the City Manager; you hire a City Manager because you want her and then you expect her to work and have a five year or six-year probationary period then you get upset because she feels

she has to hire an independent attorney. It's just not right what you are doing here, not right at all. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there any other members of the public that wish to comment on this item? Good evening, sir.

ROLAND ABEL: Good evening. Roland Abel, 7606 Harbor Boulevard. I would just like to say first of all, that I am extremely disappointed that this matter had to be aired in the public; however, I, as some of you may know, I am a man who was brought up by a mother who had 11 of us, who did miraculous things to make sure that we succeed. I can remember very well when our City Manager came, she reminded us one fact, that when she was a young lady and her father drove through Miramar he had to be extremely careful so as not to be pulled over by the Police because Miramar was not a place where people that looked like us was very much welcomed. I was never more proud on the day when, I don't know her personally, I just know her as a person who has come up and who has done what most of us have done to make it out of our situation. I can hardly imagine, I don't know where she started in the City, that a person would have worked four years without a review or an increase. I think it is absolutely unconscionable. I am standing here today as one of the residents in Miramar saying please make sure that we never get to this place again but hopefully that this matter will be addressed to the satisfaction of the City Manager tonight. She deserves a raise; she should get that raise and she should have gotten it a long time ago. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, sir. Alright, any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Good evening.

ALEXANDRA DAVIS: Good evening, Alexandra, 3149 SW 133<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Miramar. I've heard the sentiments and I was here when the City Manager was hired. As far as I see, I think the Commission has to work too hard to correct some of the mistakes from the City Manager. I, myself, have been a community activist and have been before you numerous occasions when the millage rate has been threatened to be increased. Over the last four years I have had to do petitions, go to the public demanding that our City Manager look at her budget carefully and come up with innovative ideas so as not to raise the millage rate. On both occasions, I was able to garnish the support of the residents in order to not have the millage increase and that should not be the job of the residents; it should be the job of the City Manager and her staff to ensure that the City is operated within budget based on our tax dollars and it shouldn't have to be that the City Commission has to be looking through the budget thoroughly trying to come up with ways that we don't need a millage increase. The \$10 million that was found when this City Manager requested the increase should not have happened. You put people in a tail spin; people cannot afford that. We need to do our job very diligently and when your job is not done very diligently and you get, for example, a D grade or whatever the grade is, then you don't warrant an increase, you need to

improve and once you improve you get the increase and that's what I would like to see. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Are there any other members from the public that wish to comment on this item? Hearing and seeing none, back to the dais. Commissioner Chambers, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I'm going to make a very strong suggestion. We take this back upstairs and work on it upstairs; it is not going to happen tonight. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: Mr. Attorney, can you please advise the Commission of that statement.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: The Commission can only consider this in public. That does not mean it has to be part of a Regular Commission Meeting. In the past, we have done City Manager evaluations historically in a Workshop or in a Special Meeting upstairs. It is open to the public obviously so if it is the desire of the Commission, you could at the next meeting or a subsequent meeting, continue this and discuss it at a Special Meeting upstairs.

MAYOR MESSAM: What is the pleasure of the Commission on the request? Do we have consensus on the request?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I'm going to make a motion.

MAYOR MESSAM: One of our colleagues has made a suggestion so if we can at least make a decision on that and depending on that decision then you can – do we have consensus on Commissioner's request? Is there a desire to have a Workshop, basically he is asking for a Workshop so we have an opportunity to discuss. I'm open if it's really going to be an option to discuss that; otherwise, ...

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I'm not sure what my colleague was requesting.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Chambers, can you clarify what you were requesting?

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I didn't get that he was requesting a Workshop.

MAYOR MESSAM: What were you requesting? Commissioner Chambers, you said ...

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: If they want to make a motion, do it tonight, fine. Whatever.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I would like to make a motion not to make any changes to the Manager's contract at this point

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Second.

MAYOR MESSAM: There is a motion and second. Please call the roll.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Please clarify the motion first.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: The motion is not to make any changes to the Manager's contract.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Okay.

MAYOR MESSAM: Call the roll.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Vice Mayor Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: No.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes.

CITY CLERK GIBBS: Mayor Messam.

MAYOR MESSAM: No.

On a motion by Commissioner Colbourne, seconded by Commissioner Chambers, not to make any change to the Manager's contract at this point.

MAYOR MESSAM: On to Commission Reports

### **Commission Reports:**

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Riggs, do you have a report?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Yes, I do. Give me one moment. Okay. So, last week I was asking for consensus for the Commission to be able to ratify the City Manager's Executive Staff as she hires those individuals. So, I would like to continue that conversation and just a reminder of last week's conversation that this would go for a vote, of course, to our residents. This would just allow the community to decide. And again, the purpose is not to micromanage our City Manager, the purpose is to have a say in who becomes our Executive Staff because I believe that's what governs and directs the direction of the City in addition to our City Manager, our Executive City Manager, our Assistant City Manager; those are the individuals who have their departments, who guide and lead their departments. If you think about it, this is to my colleagues, we have a couple of situations in cases that we have handled in the past. If we had this process in place, we would not have had to have those discussions had we been able to vet and ratify who the City Manager decides to bring as her team. Now, I'm not saying - the process would remain the same, her interview process, the whole HR process, everything, but just before we put a stamp on it and say this is our Assistant City Manager, why not have them come in front of the Commission, we get to see the resumes, we get to vet them because again, we may be dealing with a new City Manager and that individual may bring their entire team and that entire team may be the best thing that ever happened to Miramar. Within that same token, they may be the worst thing that ever happens to the City of Miramar. I'm just asking you to consider that Charter Amendment that allows us to get to know who will become our Executive Staff as we hire new individuals. That's it. If we can have that conversation because I'm thinking about our future.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: You want us to make a motion.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: I just need consensus, right?

MAYOR MESSAM: I'm not clear on what ...

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Okay, the City Manager hires Assistant City Managers, right? So that entire process takes place. So, whoever she decides is going to be our new Assistant City Manager for whatever department. Before it is a definite yes, this individual would be ratified by the Commission. In other words, we would get to know who they are, see their resumes, maybe do our own vetting before we say okay, this is the right person for us. That's it. It's not any much more complicated than that. Because it would be a change to the Charter, it would go for a vote to the residents. At the end of the day, we would not really be the one to decide whether that happens or not. Right now, I just need the consensus to put it for the residents to vote on it, correct?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: You would need consensus for us to draft an ordinance amending the Charter. If this Commission, then passes the ordinance on First and Second Reading you would then pass a Resolution putting it on the ballot in

November and then if it is approved in November then it would take effect. That is the process that would have to be done in order to do that.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Right, so it's an entire process and not something that would happen overnight. What that does is it gives a little bit of control on the direction of the City future wise. I'm not even thinking about our current City Manager; I'm thinking about a future City Manager.

MAYOR MESSAM: I have the same position as last meeting. Like I shared before, I think this can be accomplished outside of the Charter. I think this – I think provisions like this should be addressed perhaps in a City Manager's contract in terms of Executive hires, having whatever consults or discussion with the Commission. I just think that to – I think to amend the Charter to accomplish something that could be simply addressed contractually in the contract, if that's – I just think that would be the more prudent an efficient way to address the matter. So, that's just my opinion on the issue.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: So, for our City Attorney, how would that work?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Under the Charter the City Manager has the power to hire and fire all department heads. Theoretically, you could have a contractual provision in a contract that says if the Manager will talk to the City Commissioners before hiring department heads or Assistant City Managers, but the ultimate decision would completely be the City Manager's. I think what Commissioner Riggs is suggesting is that there should be a ratification at the end so the ultimate decision falls on the City Commission whether to ratify hiring or not. This is not unheard of, there are some Cities that have this. They have Commissioner Manager forms of Government but they do allow that. Most Cities that have Commissioner Manager forms of Government do not, most of them have it the way we have it, where the Manager has complete say; the Commission doesn't have ratification. There is a minority of Cities that do it that way. So, you can really do it either way, it is something – if you want to do it this way it normally would be in the Charter. You could have a limited consultation contractually, but the Charter is what controls it.

MAYOR MESSAM: Another consideration, Madam Commissioner, that I take under consideration. For example, whenever, long after we are all dead and gone and Miramar is continuing, I think it potentially could limit the number of prospects of City Managers that might want to work for a City. Let's say, for example, it is a very contentious Commission and we have a vacancy and they see the Charter and it says that I not only have to work with a contentious Commission but every one of my Executives has to be approved by the contentious Commission. I'm just saying – it won't stop everyone; I'm just saying it could attenuate the prospects. These are just some of the things – that's why I say in terms of the Charter, I just think the Charter is just – I think the Charter may not necessarily be – obviously it



is a way to address the concern, I just think it would be more prudent for us through the City Manager's contract to perhaps discuss that. Another thing too, is that does this Commission want to be in the business of hiring the City Manager and all the Assistant City Managers and Directors, because in effect, that's what it would be doing. If we have to sign off, if we are saying we are signing off we are basically, in effect, hiring all of the Executives, and does this Commission want to be in that position?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: So, I hear you. That's one end of the spectrum. So, let me give you the other end of the spectrum, which is what's happening at the very moment. So, in the past, we have where the City Manager hires individuals who she didn't believe were the best for the City of Miramar, but because of other influences she ended up making that decision at the end of the day, but that wasn't was best for Miramar. So, here is the other end of that spectrum and that too, is a problem. I believe if we have good people sitting on the dais we shouldn't have an issue with ratifying whoever is chosen. That needs to be taken into consideration as well.

MAYOR MESSAM: Vice Mayor Barnes, you are recognized.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: For me, and I beg you be patient with me. For me, this is a just a continuation of disrespect for our current City Manager. And yes, I will repeat what I said last week. This amounts to micromanagement. I think there has to be some kind of understanding. As was intimated by the Mayor, the City of Miramar was here before us and it is going to be here after us; we have to be extremely careful as to the kind of legacy we want to leave. As I said, when the City came to the place where it is constituted as it is now, there are spotlights on us that did not point in our direction in the past. We have to ask ourselves if we need a hatchet to go after a nat. In fact, we are talking about changing a Constitution that governs the operation of this City. On top of that, we are talking about spending the money that some people are so conscious about us not saving and wasting and so on. We are talking about spending money to mount an election, a referendum if you would, on changing our Charter. There I am begging, there has to be an understanding that this has ramifications that go into the future and should not be done to satisfy a temporary whim or wish. In addition, there have been situations in the past in a number of municipalities right here in South Florida where Commissioners asked for and were granted certain decision-making powers and it backfired because these decision-making responsibilities were exercised in an arbitrary fashion. The question is do we want to go in that direction?

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Colbourne followed by Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Thank you. Like I said last week, I said this is

something very important and I know that you realize it is our Constitution and it's a big deal. Is it possible – would you consider if we had our Attorney or Management just kind of draft some pros and cons and if we could maybe Workshop it and then, you know, after listening to that, after going through that process we can get a Resolution as to exactly how we would want it framed. This way we could get a better understanding.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Absolutely. I am perfectly fine with that. In reference to the spotlight and the embarrassment that we've gone through, and I believe we have experienced that because we have been complacent. We can't continue to govern in that manner, we have to govern purposefully, we can't just sit there and accept everything City Manager puts in front of us and say yes, yes, yes. No, we have to be in control in the direction that our City is going. So, I would beg everyone to not be complacent and I agree with your idea in seeing what the pros are versus the cons, absolutely. That sounds like a good idea to me.

MAYOR MESSAM: Any other items Commissioner Riggs?

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: No, that's it. Thank you.

MAYOR MESSAM: I only heard two.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: We would like for some research to be done in reference to the pros and cons and one for even the cost, what is the financial burden?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: I was just asking if there were three Commissioners that wanted that so it was a consensus.

MAYOR MESSAM: We haven't heard from Commissioner Chambers.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes, we have consensus.

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: Alright. We will do that then.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Chambers, you are recognized.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Thank you. I would like to make a motion at the appropriate time. What I'm going to add is that – I'm going to request that the Attorney draft a Charter change from four votes to fire any City Manager back to three votes. That is going to be my request tonight and if we have to make a motion to take a vote on that, that's what I want to see happen. I tell you what's going on here, I echo Commissioner Riggs sentiment. I've seen it here happen when I got here. I made a request for two meetings two separate times and because of the Deputies that were here, my meeting was cancelled and I was

disregarded. Okay, disrespect me, that's fine. Around here when you hear employees reminiscing about a former Commissioner, Fitzroy Salesman and the previous City Manager, how those folks were more in tune and looking out for them, people have been silent here, workers, a number of workers have been let go because of unjustified reason, so we don't have any control. This dais is just here. So, we have to be able to take the control. Changes happen all the time; we are not afraid of changes. Madam City Manager, Attorney, I am going to request that we draft a Charter change to maybe put on the November ballot or the August ballot, whichever you choose. At the appropriate time I will make a motion.

MAYOR MESSAM: There is no appropriate – this is your report. So, you are either asking for – during your report, obviously you have the right to ask for whatever so there is no ...

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Can we have a vote for the change for the Attorney to draft the paperwork?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: In order to do that you would need to get a consensus this evening and then just like we talked about with Commissioner Riggs, that would be the process, if there is three Commissioners that want us to draft it, we could draft it.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: So, we take a vote tonight?

CITY ATTORNEY COLE: It's not a vote.

MAYOR MESSAM: I don't support this. I don't even know where the start but I just – I don't support it. I don't support that. Why would we move – why would we move to create an environment, based on the temperament of the Commission at a given moment, to have just a simple majority to change the leadership of the City? Even if I didn't support the current City Manager, I just think that certain measures that require a super majority is there to provide continuity, stability, and raise the stakes or the level of conviction so high so if that super majority is reached then it can be ascertained that there had to be significant issues with the City Manager for four of the sitting Officers, the elected officials, to vote to remove the person. We have had very minor issues. I'm saying we have had very minor issues on this dais that are not even close to the level of the hiring and firing of the Manager that passed or failed. I have been on the losing side, I've been on the prevailing side, each of us have been on both sides, but to put the Manager position at the same level of importance and significant as passing the Consent Agenda by a simple majority, I just think that it is not in the best interests of our community to do that. For us to make that suggestion, I think puts our City at significant risk and opens a Pandora's box of potentially having a carousel of City Managers. The ability – the last think I will say on this is one of the reasons and

the benefit of having a super majority requirement for the City Manager to be fired is that in a professional capacity as a City Manager, a City Manager can make a decision based off of professional conviction that they may know that a majority of the Commission may not agree with this but because of our professional conviction and experience that it is in the best interest in the City that they can make that decision without fear of just a simple decision, a majority being made to fire them. So, I would just plead with this Commission not to go down that slope.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: This is not in regard to this City Manager, Mr. Mayor, so if you want to imply that we want to fire the City Manager ...

MAYOR MESSAM: I made my comments that whether I disagreed with the Manager I would not support.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: But the Charter previously was three to hire and three to fire; it was changed.

MAYOR MESSAM: Where did you get that from? The Charter – when was the Charter set to have three to fire?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: It was changed.

MAYOR MESSAM: Yes, Commissioner Riggs.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Just so everyone is clear, my intention is not to fire our City Manager or get rid of our City Manager. My intention is to see some improvement in reference to our financial standing, to see some improvement in Historic Miramar, to see improvement in department budgets because I see places where we are not spending our money in the best way. I want to see the difference. We are a great City and I don't think I can give all the credit as being great to our current City Manager, I can't. Obviously, we don't always see eye to eye but again, none of this is personal for me at all. As a matter of fact, I believe our City Manager should stay and just make these improvements and better the Historic side, get us in a financial so where we don't need to increase millage. Those are the type of improvements I want to see. So, I'm not saying we should fire our City Manager and I'm glad that our Vice Mayor, with his comments earlier, with the whole women and black women thing, because that is all news to me. I don't have an against black women movement that is going and I just don't so that stuff is truly new to me. My intention really is our community; I want what is best for Miramar and I want a City Manager who is going to stand up and do what is right for our community. That's what it is about for me. So, I wanted to make that clear.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Do we have consensus or do we not have consensus so we can move on?

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: I think it's only fair, we had one other request for a change in the Charter and we asked the City Attorney to do some pros and cons on it. If we are going to put an item on the ballot when it comes to Charter change we are going to put them both together, they are going to go at the same time anyway. I think we have enough time that we can Workshop both items if that's okay with you. That would be my suggestion. And then after we Workshop it we can get the Resolution accordingly.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Sure.

MAYOR MESSAM: I don't support the item. Do you have any comments Vice Mayor? If not, get a poll. Vice Mayor Barnes, you are recognized.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: I am not interested in any of that. I thought it was comments from me you wanted.

MAYOR MESSAM: We are polling for consensus.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: No, no, oh no.

MAYOR MESSAM: I haven't heard from Commissioner Riggs.

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: I just want to finish my report.

MAYOR MESSAM: Wait, wait, wait, I'm trying to resolve your request. I heard from Commissioner Chambers and Commissioner Colbourne. I am asking Commissioner Riggs does she support that request to Workshop that item.

COMMISSIONER RIGGS: Together with my request for the pros and cons. Sure, why not, it's just information.

MAYOR MESSAM: Alright. Any other items, Commissioner Chambers?

COMMISSIONER CHAMBERS: Yes. I just wanted to share with the existing audience that tomorrow Parkway Baptist Church located in Miami Gardens, will be doing their weekly picnic right here in Miramar at the County Park, 3600 SW 62<sup>nd</sup> Avenue, from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.; 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. If anyone wants to stop by; it is their Senior Group and they gather every Thursday and have their Senior meeting. This Thursday they will be having their picnic right here in Miramar. We are proud to have them come over here from Miami Gardens. Sister Connie, she is in charge of that group so we want to welcome them tomorrow. If someone wants to stop by from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.; 3600 SW 62<sup>nd</sup> Avenue. Thank you, that's it.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Colbourne.

COMMISSIONER COLBOURNE: Any comments.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Thank you because I have some.

MAYOR MESSAM: Commissioner Barnes.

VICE MAYOR BARNES: Despite the denials, it is evident, it is obvious that there is a desire to replace the City Manager. Stay with me, as I have said previously, I have been a position for a long time in this community where people tell me things. There has been an intention to rid this City of the City Manager for some time. All of this double talk back and forth has not convinced me otherwise. Hence, my appeal a year ago, stop disrespecting our City Manager and get rid of her. This talk about, here it goes again, I have been here long enough to see people catch hell from City Managers. Just one notice, anyone who chooses to send me an anonymous correspondence, don't waste your time, it goes into file 13. For the simple fact that if you are going to send me information that you think is of significance and it is vital, who in God's name do I call. Who do I talk to verify things? Who do I speak to if I want more details? Who in God's name is anonymous? Don't send them to me, I delete them, I put them in the shredder.

MAYOR MESSAM: Thank you, Vice Mayor. A couple of announcements, I will go through these quickly. Last week, I had an opportunity to go to the National League of Cities Corporate Office to meet with other constituency groups and Presidents. I am the President of National Black Caucus of Local Elected Officials. I met with our Asian Pacific Caucus, our Women Caucus, our Hispanic caucus, as well as our LGBTQ caucus, to talk about infrastructure and the proposed Administration's infrastructure plan and its impacts on our Cities. Our message in regard to requiring the Federal Government to partner more with local municipalities. There is talk about a \$1.5 trillion infrastructure package, which is kind of deceptive in nature because the Federal Government is only actually contributing a couple of hundred billion dollars towards infrastructure and municipalities are covering that amount themselves already. So, we will be rolling out a Federal Advocacy Campaign to try to strengthen what has been proposed by this current Administration.

Monday, President's Day, I had the opportunity to take 70 Miramar students to see the movie, Black Panther. The groups that participated were the Miramar Youth Advisory Council, the Mayor's Mentor Group, My Brother's Keepers, and the Miramar High School Boys and Girls Basketball Team, Boys Varsity and JV as well as the Girl's team. We had an opportunity to see a great movie, we had a wonderful time. Thanks for all the foundations and supporters that made that event possible.

On Tuesday, the community of South Broward joined forces with the Florida Parent Teacher Student Association where the South Broward candlelight vigil for the victims and survivors of the Marjorie Stoneman Douglas High School took place in our City at Glades Middle School. Probably about 300 to 400 residents came out to pay respects to the deceased and to remember those in that incident. One of the treats for this event, if you can think of it, was that we had an opportunity here from three of the students from Stoneman Douglas. They were very impactful and emotional and it just makes your heart cry out to the traumatic experience that they went through. I would like to thank the community for coming out to support that event.

I would like to remind the public on March 8, 2018, Thursday, at 6:00 p.m. at the Miramar Multi-Service Center we have a Workshop on the PACE Program. There are four providers. It will take place on Thursday, March 8, 2018 at 6:00 p.m. and the address is 6700 Miramar Parkway. This event is for homeowners who are looking for alternative funding to replace your roof, your AC, solar panels, things to do your home improvements, so find out and get more information about it. We are also asking the trade subcontractor construction community to come out so that you can learn and get information on how you can become a certified contractor. Last year, there were \$9 million worth of PACE projects that took place in the City of Miramar and we want to make sure that our local construction community can have opportunities to help improve our community.

Finally, in terms of announcements, I would like to remind everyone that I will be partnering with the Haitian Lawyer's Association for a TPS – Temporary Protective Status information session. Please bring your complete file for a consultation with Creole and English-speaking attorneys and if you speak Spanish as well make sure to come out as well. It will take place Saturday, March 3, 2018 at 9:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. at the Miramar Multi-Service Complex, again that's March 3, 2018, Saturday, from 9:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.

On March 17, 2018, on Saint Patrick's Day, asking everyone to come out to the 3k Walk Run and Yoga Fair that will take place. You can get free health screenings, take a two-mile trek around Town Center. Sponsors are the Miami Dolphins, Memorial Hospital Miramar, Joe DiMaggio, to name a few, and you have free fitness demonstrations, cooking demonstrations. I see some residents in the audience that have come over the last five years and look forward to seeing everyone break a sweat. Because it is Saint Patrick's Day, wear your best fitness green.

Finally, I just would like to state – just to encourage the community to stay vigilant, pay attention to your Commission and make sure we are making decisions that you approve of. Let us know if the decisions we make that you are supporting and the ones that you don't support so that we can serve you better and make sure that we are acting according to your wishes. That concludes my report. Everyone

have a good night. Madam Manager.

**City Attorney Reports: - None.**

**City Manager Reports:**

CITY MANAGER WOODS-RICHARDSON: The City of Miramar is going to have its Annual Career Fair; it is going to be Thursday, March 1, 2018 at 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. It is going to be held at the Cultural Center in the banquet hall. So, you are all invited.

**FUTURE WORKSHOP**

**02/21/18 5:00 P.M. - Disparity Study Workshop - Commission Chambers**

**ADJOURNMENT**

The next regularly scheduled City Commission meeting is: March 7, 2018 at 7:00 p.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:39 p.m.

---

Denise A. Gibbs, CMC  
City Clerk  
DAG